

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

CITY OF DELRAY BEACH

STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: May 1, 2019

ITEM: 701 N Swinton Avenue, Del Ida Park Historic District– a Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-116) associated with a 462 square foot addition to the existing contributing single-family residence.

RECOMMENDATION: Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness.

GENERAL DATA:

Owner/Applicant..... SAMUEL SPEAR, JR.

Agent:..... SAMUEL SPEAR, JR.

Location:..... Northeast corner of North Swinton Avenue and NE 7th Street

Property Size:..... 0.21 Acres

Historic District: Del-Ida Park Historic District

Zoning:..... R-1-AA (Single Family Residential)

Adjacent Zoning:.....

North:	R-1-AA (Single Family Residential)
East:	R-1-AA (Single Family Residential)
South:	R-1-AA (Single Family Residential)
West:	R-1-AA (Single Family Residential)

Existing Future Land Use Designation:..... LD (Low Density Residential)

Water Service:..... Public water service is provided on site.

Sewer Service:..... Public sewer service is provided on site.



ITEM BEFORE THE BOARD

The item before the Board is approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-116) associated with a 462 square foot addition to the existing contributing single-family residence located at **701 North Swinton Avenue, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, pursuant to Land Development Regulation (LDR) Section 2.4.6(H).

BACKGROUND & PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The subject property, which consists of Del-Ida Park, South 15 Feet of Lot 3 and Lot 4, Block 1, is located within the Del-Ida Park Historic District. The property is zoned Single Family Residential (R-1-AA). The property contains a wood-framed, contributing, Minimal Traditional style, single-family residence constructed in 1940.

At its May 3, 2016 meeting the HPB approved a request for a replacement of the damaged flat, asphalt shingle roof with a cedar-shake shingle roof.

Then, at its November 7, 2018 meeting the HPB reviewed a COA for color change to the existing structure. The request was a result of a code enforcement violation from September 25, 2018 for the work being done without the permit. The proposal was to change the color of the trim and shutters from the existing dark green to Dark Purple (Dramatist MQ5-43^P). The board was not in support of the request and referred the COA to staff to work with the owner on final approval. The final approval was for the Shutters and trim to be "Blue Square" by Behr and the entrance door to be "Coal Mine" by Behr. The work was completed with the exception of the purple trim around the top of the structure.

The subject COA request is for an addition to the northeast corner of the house to include a new bedroom, bathroom, and closet space. The COA and is now before the Board for consideration.

ANALYSIS OF PROPOSAL

Items identified in the Land Development Regulations shall specifically be addressed by the body taking final action on the site and development application/request.

Pursuant to LDR Section 2.4.6(H)(5), prior to approval, a finding must be made that any Certificate of Appropriateness which is to be approved is consistent with Historic Preservation purposes pursuant to Objective A-4 of the Land Use Element of the Comprehensive Plan and specifically with provisions of Section 4.5.1, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

ZONING AND USE REVIEW

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.3.4(K) - Development Standards: properties located within the R-1-AA zoning district shall be developed according to the requirements noted in the chart below.

The proposal is in compliance with the applicable requirements; therefore, positive findings are made.

Development Standards	Required	Existing	Proposed
Open Space (Minimum, Non-Vehicular)	25%	78.9%	71.8%
Setbacks (Minimum): Front (West)	30'	34.55' – 34.73'	No Change
Side Interior (North)	10'	10.03' – 10.13'	10.13' -10.22'
Side Street (South)	15'	16.85' – 16.97'	No change
Rear (East)	10'	54.59'	22.55' – 22.49'
Height (Maximum)	35'	15' 3½"	13' 2¾"

LDR SECTION 4.5.1 HISTORIC PRESERVATION: DESIGNATED DISTRICTS, SITES, AND BUILDINGS
--

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E), Development Standards, all new development or exterior improvements on individually designated historic properties and/or properties located within historic districts shall, comply with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Development Standards of this Section.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(2)(c)(4) - Minor Development.

The subject application is considered "Minor Development" as it involves "alteration of less than 25 percent of the existing floor area of the building and all appurtenances."

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(4) – Alterations: in considering proposals for alterations to the exterior of historic buildings and structures and in applying development and preservation standards, the documented, original design of the building may be considered, among other factors.

The existing structure, and its remaining original form, have been considered with respect to the proposed addition and site improvements, which are noted to have been sensitively designed.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(5) - Standards and Guidelines: a historic site, building, structure, improvement, or appurtenance within a historic district shall only be altered, restored, preserved, repaired, relocated, demolished, or otherwise changed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, as amended from time to time.

The applicable Standards are noted below:

Standard 2

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 5

Distinctive materials, features, finishes and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

Standard 9

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10

New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The proposal includes an addition to the east side of the property for the single-family structure to include a bedroom, bathroom, and closet space. Proposed windows will be clear, impact resistant glass and doors materials will be aluminum with white frames, also will the same clear, impact resistant glass. The proposed windows are slightly different than the existing in size, however have a similar muntin pattern as the existing providing for a slight differentiation of old to new.

The proposed addition's height at 13'2 3/4" does not exceed the height of the existing structure at 15'-3 1/2". The materials for addition will be the same as existing including cedar siding, wood shutters and asphalt roof shingles will match the existing structure. The paint color for the exterior walls will match the existing "Celery Ice" by Behr, the window shutters will be "Blue Square" by Behr, with white trim for the windows and doors. Colors are compatible as they are the same as existing structure. It is noted that the purple trim detail around the top of the existing structure shall be painted "Blue Square" as was previously approved. This item is attached as a condition of approval.

The proposed 1-story addition to is visually compatible and in direct relationship with the low-scale of the existing structure. The addition is located behind the existing structure to the northeast. The addition is not placed forward of the plane of existing structure, such design protects the historic integrity of the historic district and surrounding area.

The new addition has been designed such that should it be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic structure and its environment would not be impacted. Further, the proposed architectural features will protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment. Based upon the above, positive findings are made with respect to compliance with the Standards.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) - Visual Compatibility Standards: new construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section with regard to height, width, mass, scale, façade, openings, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1. Visual compatibility for minor and major development as referenced in Section 4.5.1(E)(2) shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m) below. Visual compatibility for all development on individually designated properties outside the district shall be determined by comparison to other structures within the site.

The following criteria apply:

- (a) **Height:** The height of proposed buildings or modifications shall be visually compatible in comparison or relation to the height of existing structures and buildings in a historic district for all major and minor development. For major development, visual compatibility with respect to the height of residential structures, as defined by 4.5.1(E)(2)(a), shall also be determined through application of the Building Height Plane.
- (b) **Front Facade Proportion:** The front facade of each building or structure shall be visually compatible with and be in direct relationship to the width of the building and to the height of the front elevation of other existing structures and buildings within the subject historic district.
- (c) **Proportion of Openings (Windows and Doors):** The openings of any building within a historic district shall be visually compatible with the openings exemplified by prevailing historic architectural styles of similar buildings within the district. The relationship of the width of windows and doors to the height of windows and doors among buildings shall be visually compatible within the subject historic district.
- (d) **Rhythm of Solids to Voids:** The relationship of solids to voids of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district for all development, with particular attention paid to the front facades.
- (e) **Rhythm of Buildings on Streets:** The relationship of buildings to open space between them and adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible with the relationship between existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district.

- (f) **Rhythm of Entrance and/or Porch Projections:** The relationship of entrances and porch projections to the sidewalks of a building shall be visually compatible with existing architectural styles of entrances and porch projections on existing historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district for all development.
- (g) **Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color:** The relationship of materials, texture, and color of the facade of a building and/or hardscaping shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district.
- (h) **Roof Shapes:** The roof shape, including type and slope, of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the roof shape of existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district. The roof shape shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building.
- (i) **Walls of Continuity:** Walls, fences, evergreen landscape masses, or building facades, shall form cohesive walls of enclosure along a street to ensure visual compatibility with historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district and the structure to which it is visually related.
- (j) **Scale of a Building:** The size of a building and the building mass in relation to open spaces, windows, door openings, balconies, porches, and lot size shall be visually compatible with the building size and mass of historic buildings and structures within a historic district for all development. To determine whether the scale of a building is appropriate, the following shall apply for major development only:
 - 1. For buildings wider than sixty percent (60%) of the lot width, a portion of the front façade must be setback a minimum of seven (7) additional feet from the front setback line:
 - 2. For buildings deeper than fifty percent (50%) of the lot depth, a portion of each side façade, which is greater than one story high, must be setback a minimum of five (5) additional feet from the side setback line:
- (k) **Directional Expression of Front Elevation:** A building shall be visually compatible with the buildings, structures, and sites within a historic district for all development with regard to its directional character, whether vertical or horizontal.
- (l) **Architectural Style:** All major and minor development shall consist of only one (1) architectural style per structure or property and not introduce elements definitive of another style.
- (m) **Additions to individually designated properties and contributing structures in all historic districts:** Visual compatibility shall be accomplished as follows:
 - 1. Additions shall be located to the rear or least public side of a building and be as inconspicuous as possible.
 - 2. Additions or accessory structures shall not be located in front of the established front wall plane of a historic building.
 - 3. Characteristic features of the original building shall not be destroyed or obscured.
 - 4. Additions shall be designed and constructed so that the basic form and character of the historic building will remain intact if the addition is ever removed.
 - 5. Additions shall not introduce a new architectural style, mimic too closely the style of the existing building nor replicate the original design but shall be coherent in design with the existing building.
 - 6. Additions shall be secondary and subordinate to the main mass of the historic building and shall not overwhelm the original building.

In consideration of the Visual Compatibility Standards, the proposed addition is appropriate and compatible with the existing contributing structure. The proposed addition is designed to be consistent with the original structure's Minimal Traditional architectural style. The proposed colors and materials will be the same as the original structure. The proposed materials used are compatible with historic buildings and structures within the Del-Ida Park Historic District.

The proposed 1-story addition and improvements to the property are visually compatible and in direct relationship with the low-scale of the existing structure. The existing 1-story contributing structure is situated on the south side of the property and the 1-story addition is proposed on the northeast side of the existing residence. The addition to the structure is visually compatible as it is placed in the rear of the main structure; thus, it does not overwhelm the original structure. The overall design maintains architectural details appropriate for the structure and the Del-Ida Park Historic District. The proposal meets the intent of the review criteria above; thus, positive findings are made with respect to the sections indicated above.

ALTERNATIVE ACTIONS

- A. Continue with direction.
- B. Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness 2019-116 for **701 N Swinton Avenue, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request and approval thereof meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5).
- C. Deny the Certificate of Appropriateness 2019-116 for **701 N Swinton Avenue, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by finding that the request and approval thereof does not meet the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Approve COA 2019-116 for **701 N Swinton Avenue, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request and approval thereof meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5), subject to the following condition of approval:

1. That the purple trim detail around the top of the existing structure shall be painted "Blue Square"

Attachments: Site plan, elevations, pictures, and survey

Report Prepared by: Katherina Paliwoda, Planner & Michelle Hoyland, Principal Planner