



CITY OF DELRAY BEACH
DEPARTMENT OF DEVELOPMENT SERVICES
100 N.W. 1ST AVENUE • DELRAY BEACH • FLORIDA 33444 • (561) 243-7040



HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD STAFF REPORT

200 NE 5th Court

Meeting

April 2, 2025

File No.

2025-049

Application Type

Certificate of Appropriateness

REQUEST

The item before the Board is consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (2025-049) request for the installation of a standing seam metal roof and other exterior modifications on an existing non-contributing, one-story, single-family residence located at **200 NE 5th Court, Del-Ida Park Historic District**.

GENERAL DATA

Owner: Thomas J. Connolly

Location: 200 NE 5th Court

PCN: 12-43-46-09-29-008-0010

Property Size: 0.14 Acres

Zoning: RL (Low Density Residential)

Historic District: Del-Ida Park Historic District

LUM Designation: LD (Low Density)

Adjacent Zoning:

- RL (North)
- RL (East)
- RL (South)
- R-1-AA (West)

Existing Land Use: Residential

Proposed Land Use: Residential



BACKGROUND AND PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The subject property consists of Lot 1, Block 8 of Del-Ida Park. The property is located within the locally designated Del-Ida Park Historic District and contains a non-contributing, one-story structure constructed in 1952. According to the original Yellowcards, the existing structure is constructed out of CBS with a smooth stucco exterior, and a pitch and gravel roof.

On October 24, 2018, staff administratively approved a Certificate of Appropriateness (2018-194) for the replacement of existing windows and doors, repair of the existing fence, and painting of the exterior façade.

The subject request is a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) for the replacement of an asphalt shingle roof to a Champagne color (SW 6644), standing seam, metal roof. Other proposed modifications include the construction of an open-air porch to the rear of the structure and the replacement of existing windows to single hung white aluminum with clear glass. It is noted that as the structure is non-contributing to the district, the window modifications and construction of the rear porch can be reviewed administratively (by staff). Specifically, the change of material and proposed roof color require review by the HPB. The request is now before the board.

Project Planner:

Katherina Paliwoda, Planner paliwodak@mydelraybeach.com

Review

Dates:

April 2, 2025

Attachments:

1. Color and Materials
2. Plans
3. Photographs

REVIEW AND ANALYSIS

Pursuant to Land Development Regulation (LDR) Section 2.4.12(A)(5), prior to approval, a finding must be made that any Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with Historic Preservation purposes pursuant to Objective HPE 1.4 of the Historic Preservation Element of the Comprehensive Plan; the provisions of Section 4.5.1; the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines; and, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

ZONING AND USE REVIEW

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.4.5(B) – Low Density Residential (RL) Principal Uses: The provisions for R-1-A shall apply for single-family detached dwellings.

The existing use is single-family residential, which is a permitted use within the RL zoning district.

LDR SECTION 4.5.1

HISTORIC PRESERVATION: DESIGNATED DISTRICTS, SITES, AND BUILDINGS

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E), Development Standards, all new development or exterior improvements on individually designated historic properties and/or properties located within historic districts shall, comply with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Development Standards of this Section.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(2) – Minor Development.

The subject application is considered "Minor Development" as it involves the modification of less than 25 percent of the existing non-contributing single-family residence.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1E(3) – Buildings, Structures, Appurtenances and Parking: Buildings, structures, appurtenances and parking shall only be moved, reconstructed, altered, or maintained, in accordance with this chapter, in a manner that will preserve the historical and architectural character of the building, structure, site, or district:

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(4) – Alterations: in considering proposals for alterations to the exterior of historic buildings and structures and in applying development and preservation standards, the documented, original design of the building may be considered, among other factors.

The subject request involves replacement of the existing asphalt shingle roof with a Champagne color (SW 6644), standing seam metal roof on the existing non-contributing, single-family residence. The existing asphalt shingle roof material is original to the structure. The structure has been considered with respect to improvements.

SECRETARY OF THE INTERIORS STANDARDS

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(5) - Standards and Guidelines: a historic site, building, structure, improvement, or appurtenance within a historic district shall only be altered, restored, preserved, repaired, relocated, demolished, or otherwise changed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, as amended from time to time.

Standard 1

A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

Standard 2

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 3

Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

Standard 4

Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Standard 5

Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

Standard 6

Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard 7

Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Standard 8

Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

Standard 9

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10

New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The use of the property will remain a single-family residence as it was traditionally used. In addition, the use of standing seam metal roofs are common within this historic district particularly for non-contributing structures, so the request can be considered visually compatible with other structures within the historic district. With regard to the construction of the open-air rear porch, it can be considered compatible with the massing, scale, and architectural style of the existing structure. Finally, the open-air porch and the new roof materials can be considered appropriate within the historic streetscape.

VISUAL COMPATIBILITY STANDARDS

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) – **Visual Compatibility Standards**: new construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures, and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section with regard to height, width, mass, scale, façade, openings, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1. Visual compatibility for minor and major development as referenced in Section 4.5.1(2) shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m) below.

- a. **Height:** The height of proposed buildings or modifications shall be visually compatible in comparison or relation to the height of existing structures and buildings in a historic district for all major and minor development. For major development, visual compatibility with respect to the height of residential structures, as defined by 4.5.1(2)(a), shall also be determined through application of the Building Height Plane.
- b. **Front Facade Proportion:** The front facade of each building or structure shall be visually compatible with and be in direct relationship to the width of the building and to the height of the front elevation of other existing structures and buildings within the subject historic district.
- c. **Proportion of Openings (Windows and Doors):** The openings of any building within a historic district shall be visually compatible with the openings exemplified by prevailing historic architectural styles of similar buildings within the district. The relationship of the width of windows and doors to the height of windows and doors among buildings shall be visually compatible within the subject historic district.
- d. **Rhythm of Solids to Voids:** The relationship of solids to voids of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district for all development, with particular attention paid to the front facades.
- e. **Rhythm of Buildings on Streets:** The relationship of buildings to open space between them and adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible with the relationship between existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district.
- f. **Rhythm of Entrance and/or Porch Projections:** The relationship of entrances and porch projections to the sidewalks of a building shall be visually compatible with existing architectural styles of entrances and porch projections on existing historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district for all development.
- g. **Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color:** The relationship of materials, texture, and color of the facade of a building and/or hardscaping shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district.
- h. **Roof Shapes:** The roof shape, including type and slope, of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the roof shape of existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district. The roof shape shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building.
- i. **Walls of Continuity:** Walls, fences, evergreen landscape masses, or building facades, shall form cohesive walls of enclosure along a street to ensure visual compatibility with historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district and the structure to which it is visually related.
- j. **Scale of a Building:** The size of a building and the building mass in relation to open spaces, windows, door openings, balconies, porches, and lot size shall be visually compatible with the building size and mass of historic buildings and structures within a

historic district for all development. To determine whether the scale of a building is appropriate, the following shall apply for major development only:

- a. For buildings wider than sixty percent (60%) of the lot width, a portion of the front façade must be setback a minimum of seven (7) additional feet from the front setback line:
- b. For buildings deeper than fifty percent (50%) of the lot depth, a portion of each side façade, which is greater than one story high, must be setback a minimum of five (5) additional feet from the side setback line:
- k. **Directional Expression of Front Elevation:** A building shall be visually compatible with the buildings, structures, and sites within a historic district for all development with regard to its directional character, whether vertical or horizontal.
- l. **Architectural Style:** All major and minor development shall consist of only one (1) architectural style per structure or property and not introduce elements definitive of another style.
- m. **Additions to individually designated properties and contributing structures in all historic districts:** Visual compatibility shall be accomplished as follows:
 1. Additions shall be located to the rear or least public side of a building and be as inconspicuous as possible.
 2. Additions or accessory structures shall not be located in front of the established front wall plane of a historic building.
 3. Characteristic features of the original building shall not be destroyed or obscured.
 4. Additions shall be designed and constructed so that the basic form and character of the historic building will remain intact if the addition is ever removed.
 5. Additions shall not introduce a new architectural style, mimic too closely the style of the existing building nor replicate the original design but shall be coherent in design with the existing building.
 6. Additions shall be secondary and subordinate to the main mass of the historic building and shall not overwhelm the original building.

Regarding the **Roof Shape** visual compatibility standard, the roof line of the proposed porch will be slightly shorter than the original structure but will be at the same 8' in height under roof. There are no proposed changes to the structure's existing roof shape. With respect to ***Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color, and Roof Shapes***, the proposal includes the installation of a new standing seam metal roof in the color of Champagne (SW 6644) to replace the existing gray asphalt shingle roof and for the proposed porch. The column exterior will be a smooth stucco in Pure White (SW 7005) which will match the material and color of the existing structure. While there has been much debate over the use of metal roofing within Delray Beach's five historic districts, it is a material that has been documented as being utilized on a case-by-case basis within Delray Beach. Although asphalt shingle would be the most compatible roof material for existing historic/contributing structures, the structure is classified as a non-contributor and is not anticipated to be reclassified as contributing in the near future. The concern is with the proposed material color, as mill finish, metal roofing is the most appropriate for use within a historic district. The board would need to make a determination that the Champagne color (SW 6644), standing seam metal roof is an appropriate roofing material for use on the subject masonry structure that allows for the relationship of materials, color, and texture to be considered visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings within the Del-Ida Park Historic District.

The existing windows on the residence are also proposed to be replaced with single hung, white aluminum frames with mullions, with clear glass. As previously noted, the windows can be reviewed administratively and would be processed via a building permit. However, there a new openings (door) proposed on the south side elevation, and a new window on the north elevation. The (west) side of the residence has 4 existing windows that will be replaced with an aluminum impact resistant sliding glass

door to create an entryway accessing the proposed open-air porch. With regard to **Windows and Doors**, as the property is non-contributing there are no concerns of altering the historic integrity of the structure.

COMPREHENSIVE PLAN

Pursuant to the Historic Preservation Element (HPE), Objective 1.4, Historic Preservation Planning: Implement appropriate and compatible design and planning strategies for historic sites and properties within historic districts.

The objective shall be met through continued adherence to the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance and, where applicable, architectural design guidelines through the following policies:

Historic Preservation Element 1.4.1 Prior to approval or recommending approval of any land use or development application for property located within a historic district or designated as a historic site, the Historic Preservation Board must make a finding that the requested action is consistent with the provisions of Section 4.5.1 of the Land Development Regulations relating to historic sites and districts and the "Delray Beach Design Guidelines".

The development proposal involves the replacement of the existing asphalt shingle roofing with a Champagne color (SW 6644) standing seam metal roof and other exterior alterations. There are no concerns with respect to soil, topographic or other physical considerations. With respect to the adjacent land uses, the property is in an area surrounded by residential uses. The board will need to determine that the proposal is consistent with the requirements of the Comprehensive Plan, and the provisions of LDR Section 4.5.1 relating to historic sites and districts as well as the "Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines".

ALTERNATIVE ACTIONS

- A. Move to continue with direction.
- B. Approve Certificate of Appropriateness (2025-049), for the property located at **200 NE 5th Court, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by finding that the request and approval thereof is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations.
- C. Approve Certificate of Appropriateness (2025-049), for the property located at **200 NE 5th Court, Del-Ida Park Historic District** by finding that the request and approval thereof is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, subject to the following conditions:
- D. Deny Certificate of Appropriateness (2025-049), for the property located at **200 NE 5th Court, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by finding that the request is inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan and does not meet the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations.

PUBLIC AND COURTESY NOTICES

☒ Courtesy Notices were provided to the following, at least 5 working days prior to the meeting:

Del-Ida Historic Neighborhood

☒ Public Notices are not required for this request.
☒ Agenda was posted on 3/26/25, 5 working days prior to meeting.

TAC Timeline Table			
Review No.	Submittal Date	TAC Comments Transmitted	Fee Due with Next Submittal?:
1	11/07/2024	11/22/2024	No <u> X </u> Yes <u> </u> Amount: <u> </u>
EX	Extension Request	2/28/2025	Approved on 2/04/2025
2	02/11/2025	Board Ready 2/14/2025	No <u> X </u> Yes <u> </u> Amount: <u> </u>