

Final Ranking Score	Criteria 1	Criteria 2	Criteria 3	Criteria 4	Score	Possible 100 Points

Employers Mutual d/b/a Ascension Benefits & Insurance Solutions					
Score	19.0	29.3	3.3	25.0	76.6

The Gehring Group, Inc					
Score	14.7	24.7	4.0	11.5	54.9

Arthur J Gallagher, Inc.					
Score	14.7	13.3	5.0	13.3	46.3

		Strengths	Weakness
1	<p>Experience</p> <p>Detailed narrative description documenting Proposer's overall background and experience insurance broker services.</p> <p>Detailed narrative description documenting Proposer's specific experience including property and casualty insurances</p> <p>Knowledge of Florida State law as it applies to property and casualty insurances.</p> <p>Background in the insurance renewal process.</p> <p>Experience in analyzing insurance coverage proposals.</p> <p>Experience in negotiating with insurance carriers.</p> <p>Background and expertise with municipalities, particularly Florida municipalities</p> <p>Background and expertise with organizations with portfolios similar in size to the City's</p> <p>Experience specific to analyzing the marketplace and market trends.</p> <p>Summary of the experience of Proposer's key team members who will be servicing the City account</p> <p>detailed narrative description documenting experience of the individual proposed by Proposer to be the City broker</p>	<p>The firm met all required experience criteria</p> <p>The firm listed many years of experience for the brokers.</p> <p>The firm listed long term client relationships that were over 10 years</p> <p>The firm has experience going back 40 plus years of public accounts in FL each about the size of the City</p>	

		Strengths	Weakness
2	<p>Capacity and Approach</p> <p>Proposer's intended approach to servicing the City's account</p> <p>Detailed narrative description of the proposed approach and methodology for engaging with City representatives while in the course of performing the duties</p> <p>Overall approach to delivering the Scope of Services and any strategies Proposer proposes to implement</p> <p>Strategies Proposer will utilize to assist the City in meeting its goals for a smooth transition, proactive claims management, access to reporting information, and expedient claims processing services</p> <p>Methodology Proposer would utilize to accomplish the transitioning from the incumbent insurance broker.</p> <p>Narrative that demonstrates working knowledge and understanding of the requirements of the Scope of Services</p> <p>Identify the lines of insurances Proposer is licensed to provide from the following;</p> <p>Details of implementation plan and schedule</p> <p>Detail your methodology for working effectively with the City's TPA</p> <p>Provide details of the approach that will be implemented for working in conjunction with City staff to determine the best strategy for insurance renewals</p> <p>Provide details of any value-added services proposed for the City's account.</p> <p>Provide an example renewal proposal drafted and submitted to a client by the proposed broker during the past three years</p>	<p>The information submitted by the firm shows their reliabilty</p> <p>The firm intends to work with the City at our request</p> <p>Monthly updates will be provided to the City</p> <p>Firm will not make any changes without City approval</p> <p>Respondent is the incumbent and currently works very well with the finance department and TPA</p> <p>Safety and OSHA training provided by the firm</p>	

Detail Proposer's approach to responding to inquiries (e.g., directly, in-house experts).	
Location Detail Proposer's approach to responding to inquiries (e.g., directly, in-house experts). How the proposer physically plans on attending pre-scheduled meetings. How the Proposer plans on ensuring accessibility and responsiveness to requests by City staff and availability of services during the term of the Agreement	
4	
a	
Highest score for lowest fees	

Strengths	Weakness
The firm is located in Stuart, FL	

1	<p>Experience</p> <p>Detailed narrative description documenting Proposer's overall background and experience insurance broker services.</p> <p>Detailed narrative description documenting Proposer's specific experience including property and casualty insurances</p> <p>Knowledge of Florida State law as it applies to property and casualty insurances.</p> <p>Background in the insurance renewal process.</p> <p>Experience in analyzing insurance coverage proposals.</p> <p>Experience in negotiating with insurance carriers.</p> <p>Background and expertise with municipalities, particularly Florida municipalities</p> <p>Background and expertise with organizations with portfolios similar in size to the City's</p> <p>Experience specific to analyzing the marketplace and market trends.</p> <p>Summary of the experience of Proposer's key team members who will be servicing the City account</p> <p>detailed narrative description documenting experience of the individual proposed by Proposer to be the City broker</p>

Strengths	Weakness
<p>The firm is well known in the industry</p> <p>The firm has a worldwide presence</p> <p>High volume of access points listed by the firm</p> <p>Firm provided listing of long term client relationships</p>	<p>Uncertain about the longevity of the firms team</p>

2	<p>Capacity and Approach</p> <p>Proposer's intended approach to servicing the City's account</p> <p>Detailed narrative description of the proposed approach and methodology for engaging with City representatives while in the course of performing the duties</p> <p>Overall approach to delivering the Scope of Services and any strategies Proposer proposes to implement</p> <p>Strategies Proposer will utilize to assist the City in meeting its goals for a smooth transition, proactive claims management, access to reporting information, and expedient claims processing services</p> <p>Methodology Proposer would utilize to accomplish the transitioning from the incumbent insurance broker.</p> <p>Narrative that demonstrates working knowledge and understanding of the requirements of the Scope of Services</p> <p>Identify the lines of insurances Proposer is licensed to provide from the following;</p> <p>Details of implementation plan and schedule</p> <p>Detail your methodology for working effectively with the City's TPA</p> <p>Provide details of the approach that will be implemented for working in conjunction with City staff to determine the best strategy for insurance renewals</p> <p>Provide details of any value-added services proposed for the City's account.</p> <p>Provide an example renewal proposal drafted and submitted to a client by the proposed broker during the past three years</p> <p>Detail Proposer's approach to responding to inquiries (e.g., directly, in-house experts).</p>

Strengths	Weakness
The firm presented a timeline and service plan acceptable for the City	Uncertain it the firm will be able to do business with the league of Cities

Location

Detail Proposer’s approach to responding to inquiries (e.g., directly, in-house experts).

How the proposer physically plans on attending pre-scheduled meetings.

How the Proposer plans on ensuring accessibility and responsiveness to requests by City staff and availability of services during the term of the Agreement

4

Fee Proposal

a Highest score for lowest fees

Strengths	Weakness

Firm located in Boca Raton, FL

1	<p>Experience</p> <p>Detailed narrative description documenting Proposer's overall background and experience insurance broker services.</p> <p>Detailed narrative description documenting Proposer's specific experience including property and casualty insurances</p> <p>Knowledge of Florida State law as it applies to property and casualty insurances.</p> <p>Background in the insurance renewal process.</p> <p>Experience in analyzing insurance coverage proposals.</p> <p>Experience in negotiating with insurance carriers.</p> <p>Background and expertise with municipalities, particularly Florida municipalities</p> <p>Background and expertise with organizations with portfolios similar in size to the City's</p> <p>Experience specific to analyzing the marketplace and market trends.</p> <p>Summary of the experience of Proposer's key team members who will be servicing the City account</p> <p>detailed narrative description documenting experience of the individual proposed by Proposer to be the City broker</p>

Strengths	Weakness
<p>The firm has over 15 years experience as insurance broker</p> <p>The firm met all required experience criteria</p> <p>The firm has nearly 80 years of experience with FL public entities</p>	<p>the firm was established in 1992 compared to the other respondents</p> <p>The firm employers did not show longevity at the company</p> <p>The firm did not provide licensee and designations in the proposal</p>

2	<p>Capacity and Approach</p> <p>Proposer's intended approach to servicing the City's account</p> <p>Detailed narrative description of the proposed approach and methodology for engaging with City representatives while in the course of performing the duties</p> <p>Overall approach to delivering the Scope of Services and any strategies Proposer proposes to implement</p> <p>Strategies Proposer will utilize to assist the City in meeting its goals for a smooth transition, proactive claims management, access to reporting information, and expedient claims processing services</p> <p>Methodology Proposer would utilize to accomplish the transitioning from the incumbent insurance broker.</p> <p>Narrative that demonstrates working knowledge and understanding of the requirements of the Scope of Services</p> <p>Identify the lines of insurances Proposer is licensed to provide from the following;</p> <p>Details of implementation plan and schedule</p> <p>Detail your methodology for working effectively with the City's TPA</p> <p>Provide details of the approach that will be implemented for working in conjunction with City staff to determine the best strategy for insurance renewals</p> <p>Provide details of any value-added services proposed for the City's account.</p> <p>Provide an example renewal proposal drafted and submitted to a client by the proposed broker during the past three years</p> <p>Detail Proposer's approach to responding to inquiries (e.g., directly, in-house experts).</p>

Strengths	Weakness
<p>The firms used the format of the RFP and included information for all requested criteria</p> <p>The firm anticipates on starting according to the City schedule</p> <p>The firm presented benchmarks in their proposal.</p>	<p>The firm has less experience compared to other respondents</p>

Location

Detail Proposer’s approach to responding to inquiries (e.g., directly, in-house experts).

How the proposer physically plans on attending pre-scheduled meetings.

How the Proposer plans on ensuring accessibility and responsiveness to requests by City staff and availability of services during the term of the Agreement

4

Fee Proposal

a Highest score for lowest fees

StrengthsWeakness

The firm is located in Palm Beach Gardens, FL

City of Delray Beach
Property Casualty Third - Party Claims Administrator

1	Cantorre	DeMicco	Hermann	Score	20
Employers Mutual d/b/a Ascension Benefits & Insurance Solutions	19.0	18.0	20.0	19.0	
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	
The Gehring Group, Inc	15.0	15.0	14.0	14.7	
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	
Arthur J Gallagher, Inc.	17.0	20.0	7.0	14.7	
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	
2	Cantorre	DeMicco	Hermann	Score	30
Employers Mutual d/b/a Ascension Benefits & Insurance Solutions	28.0	30.0	30.0	29.3	
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	
The Gehring Group, Inc.	29.0	25.0	20.0	24.7	
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	

City of Delray Beach
Property Casualty Third - Party Claims Administrator

Arthur J Gallagher, Inc	25.0	5.0	10.0	13.3
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0

3	Cantorre	DeMicco	Hermann	Score
----------	----------	---------	---------	-------

5

Employers Mutual d/b/a Ascension Benefits & Insurance Solutions	3.0	4.0	3.0	3.3
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
The Gehring Group, Inc.	4.0	4.0	4.0	4.0
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0
Arthur J Gallagher, Inc.	5.0	5.0	5.0	5.0
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0

City of Delray Beach
Property Casualty Third - Party Claims Administrator

4	Cantorre	DeMicco	Hermann	Score	20	
Employers Mutual d/b/a Ascension Benefits & Insurance Solutions	25.0	25.0	25.0	25.0		
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
The Gehring Group, Inc.	11.5	11.5	11.5	11.5		
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
Arthur J Gallagher, Inc.	13.3	13.3	13.3	13.3		
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		

Technical Evaluation Scores	Criteria 1	Criteria 2	Criteria 3	Criteria 4	Score	Possible 100 Points	
Employers Mutual d/b/a Ascension Benefits & Insurance Solutions							
Score	19.0	29.3	3.3	25.0	76.6		
The Gehring Group, Inc.							
Score	14.7	24.7	4.0	11.5	54.9		
Arthur J Gallagher, Inc.							
Score	14.7	13.3	5.0	13.3	46.3		