

1. Experience, Background, References	Isaac Kovner	Victor Majtenyi	Doug Levine	Score	Experience, Background, References 25 Points	
					Strengths	Weaknesses
A&P Consulting Transportation Engineers Corp.	10.0	16.0	9.0	11.7	Experience in design work with reclaimed and roadway, drainage and FDOT work in Miami. work experiene, big main projects, big transmission pipes.	Not many CEI projects, only one CEI project roadway done in Miami Beach, one reference, only one CEI project done in PB County, staff 10 year or less, no DB experience. Mostly road construction, only one client refernce feedback
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	15.0	19.0	19.0	17.7	Worked on CEI NW 12th Ave, FDOT broad experience, drainage, side walks, ramps, driveways, irrigation, utilities. Combined business experience for over 80 years. Experience in road construction, a lot of work in Delray.	Not reclaimed experience, just general CEI services. One litigation. Only 2 client references
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
CPM North America, PLLC	5.0	13.0	11.0	9.7		All the work done in Puerto Rico, limited project listing experience, no mention of CEI or reclaimed water experience, very limited experience, only 2 years in business, did not get a sense of experience and fairly new company, only 2 client references
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Craven Thompson & Associates, Inc.	25.0	18.0	25.0	22.7	CEI experience in roadway, drainage, utilities and FDOT, expansion en North County neighborhood, 16 "reclaimed project, extensive work on CEI work, good references, worked in PB County good, list was good, 56 years in business. Nice list of project experience with roadway and reclaim	1 litigation, only 2 references, only one reference
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Mathews Consulting, A Baxter & Woodman Company	25.0	20.0	23.0	22.7	Very good experience in all disciplines, reclaim master plan, 12A, 12B, water, drainage, roadways, sidewalks, driveways, sewer, a lot of exp master plan 12 B, 12 A and utilities work water, drainage, City experience, experience with all disciplines. Experience with similar projects in Delray. Five client references	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		

2. Similar Completed Projects	Isaac Kovner	Victor Majtenyi	Doug Levine	Score	Similar Completed Projects 20 Points	
					Strengths	Weaknesses
A&P Consulting Transportation Engineers Corp.	12.0	16.0	9.0	12.3	Ok with similar projects handling big pipes, only listed 8 projects out of the 16 proposed, similar projects done in Miami Dade like sewer and lift stations, some roadway irrigation projects, large pipe transmission projects - mains, most relevant project was a 42" reclaim line.	72" line was a feasibility study
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	17.0	16.0	14.0	15.7	ok with all disciplines, similar completed projects like 12th Ave, 2nd St., 3rd St., Alleys, SE 4th St., sidewalks, done a lot of work	limited on reclaimed. Road construction but little written about reclaim
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
CPM North America, PLLC	10.0	12.0	4.0	8.7	Wastewater experience	All projects in Puerto Rico, very small project list compared to other bidders, none of their projects done outside Puerto Rico, not similar projects to this one
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Craven Thompson & Associates, Inc.	20.0	17.0	20.0	19.0	Detailed work on North County neighborhood, NE 38th St., NE 34th CT., NE 5th Ave., NE 14th Ave., good list of reclaimed similar projects. Listed similar projects	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Mathews Consulting, A Baxter & Woodman Company	20.0	18.0	18.0	18.7	Experience on reclaimed Delray 11A, 11B, master plan, a lot of experience in boca , stormwater in Pompano as well as Lauderdale by the Sea, a lot of experience and in DB, good list of similar projects and Delray experience. Listed similar projects	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		

3. Approach to Project Management	Isaac Kovner	Victor Majtenyi	Doug Levine	Score	Approach to Project Management 25 Points	
					Strengths	Weaknesses
A&P Consulting Transportation Engineers Corp.	20.0	16.0	13.0	16.3	very informative information	did not specify the locations of the projects , very generic in nature, not many details or pictures of sites. Detail to project management could be stronger
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	25.0	20.0	20.0	21.7	Great approach, very detailed approach, strong approach plus scheduling of projects	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
CPM North America, PLLC	20.0	17.0	10.0	15.7	Addressed approach according to format, good descriptive narrative,	not very descriptive on how to approach project management compared to the others, could have used more details in their approach
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Craven Thompson & Associates, Inc.	20.0	20.0	18.0	19.3	Very good project management approach, decent management approach and did mention grants, pm approach good, talked about A1A not finger-in streets in their scope	Needed side streets with scope. Could have more detailed approach
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Mathews Consulting, A Baxter & Woodman Company	24.0	22.0	25.0	23.7	Very detailed approach to project management, in depth project management analysis, very thorough approach, very detailed and mentioning of grants, how they can help and PR was very good, demonstrated knowledge of work	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		

4. Organizational Structure	Isaac Kovner	Victor Majtenyi	Doug Levine	Score	Organizational Structure 20 Points	
					Strengths	Weaknesses
A&P Consulting Transportation Engineers Corp.	18.0	16.0	8.0	14.0	Don't have any issued with it, good organizational structure	Did feel they were not very detailed on their structure. RPR lacked in reuse projects
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	20.0	16.0	18.0	18.0	very good organizational structure, detailed ganizational structure good	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
CPM North America, PLLC	18.0	12.0	11.0	13.7	Organizational structure was good,	Fairly new company, got the impression that they use subconsultants on technical aspects. Three different engineering companies
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Craven Thompson & Associates, Inc.	18.0	17.0	17.0	17.3	Addressed utilization rate, org diagram was very good	2 projects listed for experience. Did not see resumes for key personnel
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Mathews Consulting, A Baxter & Woodman Company	19.0	17.0	20.0	18.7	Very detailed and informative organization structure, shown commitment, very good organizational resources. Key personnel have experience in reclaim	
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		

5. Interviews	Isaac Kovner	Victor Majtenyi	Doug Levine	Score	Interviews 10 Points	
					Strengths	Weaknesses
	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		

City of Delray Beach

A&P Consulting Transportation Engineers Corp.	0.0			0.0	N/A	N/A
	0.0			0.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	N/A	N/A
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
CPM North America, PLLC	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	N/A	N/A
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Craven Thompson & Associates, Inc.	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	N/A	N/A
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		
Mathews Consulting, A Baxter & Woodman Company	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	N/A	N/A
	0.0			0.0		
	0.0			0.0		

Purchasing Agent's Name: Jose Hidalgo

Date of Technical Evaluations: 04/12/2017

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

Date of Final Evaluations: N/A

Ranking	Initial/Final Ranking Total	Final Ranking Total
A&P Consulting Transportation Eng	54.3	0.0
Calvin, Giordano & Associates, Inc.	73.0	0.0
CPM North America, PLLC	47.7	0.0
Craven Thompson & Associates, In	78.3	0.0
Mathews Consulting, A Baxter & W	83.7	0.0

Legend:

Technical Evaluation Scores - Top-most score within each Proposer's row of each criterion

Final Evaluation Scores - Bottom-most score within each Proposer's row of each criterion

N/A - Proposer was not shortlisted, no scores recorded

Grayed Cell - No score changes during the technical or final evaluation meeting

Shortlisted Firms:

N/A

Note: Selection Committee decided to make technical evaluations be the final ranking.