A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

July 14, 2022

Development Services Department City of Delray Beach 100 NW 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue Delray Beach, FL 33444

RE: Alexan Delray – Parking Reduction Analysis

To Whom it May Concern,

Trammell Crow Residential, hereinafter referred to as TCR, has prepared the following review and analysis to evaluate the anticipated parking requirements for the proposed Alexan Delray multi-family residential development. The analysis and conclusions of this study are meant to expand upon the findings of the 'Alternate Parking Supply Determination' report dated May 23<sup>rd</sup>, 2022 and provided by Kimley Horn & Associates.

The following summary is a compilation of nationwide and regional data from current TCR assets demonstrating that actual parking demands for stabilized, operational multi-family properties are lower than the required rates defined in the City of Delray Beach Land Development Regulations.

#### **Project Parameters and Code Required Parking**

The Alexan Delray multi-family residential development is proposed to be located on the east side of South Congress Avenue, north of Linton Boulevard in Delray Beach, Florida. The prospective development includes a total of 267 residential units with the following unit distribution:

- 161 one-bedroom units
- 88 two-bedroom units
- 18 three-bedroom units

As summarized in the previous parking analysis by Kimley-Horn & Associates, Section 4.6.9 of the City of Delray Beach Land Development Regulations defines the parking requirements for development within the City of Delray Beach. Additionally, properties within the MROC Zoning district, which is the current zoning designation for this site, have a reduced parking requirement for one-bedroom units (1.25 spaces per unit instead of 1.5 spaces per unit). The total parking requirements as calculated are summarized on the following page.

#### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

Figure 1. City of Delray Beach Code Required Parking

Land Use	Intensity		Intensity LDR Parking Ratio			
1 BR	161	Units	1.25 Spaces / 1 BR Unit *	201		
2 BR	88	Units	2 Spaces / 2 BR Unit	176		
3 BR	18	Units	2 Spaces / 3 BR Unit	36		
	Red	quired P	arking for Units			
Guest Pa	0.5 spaces per unit, first 20 units + 0.3  Guest Parking spaces per unit, next 20 – 50 units +  0.2 spaces per unit for remaining units					
	Total Code-Required Parking					

ratio of 1.25 spaces per one-bedroom unit applied within the MROC Zoning District (current zoning designation for site)

Application of the City's code parking requirements identified a code-required parking supply of 476 parking spaces. The original study established a minimum required parking supply ratio of 1.63 spaces per unit and the development plan for Alexan Delray, dated May 25<sup>th</sup>, 2022, provided 443 spaces and a supply ratio of 1.66 spaces per unit (267 total units).

Following the review of the May 25<sup>th</sup> TCR plan and consistent with further discussion with the City of Delray Beach Development Services, TCR was asked to investigate the possibility of further reducing the provided parking for the development without creating a deficiency for residents and operational purposes. The intent of exploring an additional parking reduction would be to expand the open and public spaces as well as to reduce the presence of structured parking along the future multi-use Delray Pathway.

The following data and analysis have been prepared as justification to support the request for additional reduction in the parking supply for the subject Alexan Delray property.

#### **Data Evaluation of Trammell Crow Residential Multi-Family Parking Ratios**

Trammel Crow Residential has compiled a parking demand calculation using internal data from Q1 2022 Residential Demographics Report gathered by TCR Asset Management. This data represents currently developed, stabilized, and operational properties surveyed across the entirety of TCR's national markets. For the purposes of this study and TCR operating standards, only stabilized properties with occupancy at or greater than 95% were considered. The data is derived from properties across 7 different markets including Florida and totaling almost 4,800 total residential units.

#### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

Figure 2. National Portfolio Demographics

Living Status	North Texas	Pacific Northwest	South Cal	Gulf Coast	Mid Atlantic	Southeast
Married	12%	39%	8%	12%	1%	6%
Roommates	17%	9%	47%	11%	14%	26%
Single	71%	52%	45%	77%	85%	68%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Throughout the national portfolio, resident demographics are relatively consistent in terms of gender, age, and living status. The majority of TCR communities are evenly distributed among men and women with the vast majority being under 50 years of age.

- Approximately 70% of the total available units are occupied by single adults.
- Approximately 18% of the total available units are occupied by roommates.
- Approximately 11% of the total available units are occupied by married couples.

Figure 3. National Portfolio Parking Data

Units	North Texas	Pacific Northwest	South Cal	Gulf Coast	Mid Atlantic	Southeast	Florida	Total	% Total
Studio	55	0	6	40	22	7	0	130	2.7%
1	598	46	321	1278	189	241	451	3124	65.2%
2	266	76	153	445	75	121	297	1433	29.9%
3+	58	13	4	0	0	0	32	107	2.9%
Total Units	977	135	484	1763	286	369	780	4794	100%
Total Bedrooms	1359	237	645	2208	361	490	1141	6441	100%

Parking Spaces Occupied (by Unit)	North Texas	Pacific Northwest	South Cal	Gulf Coast	Mid Atlantic	Southeast	Florida	Total
<b>Total Occupied Spaces</b>	1045	122	624	2099	259	461	1104	5714
<b>Total Unit Count</b>	977	135	484	1763	286	369	780	4794
Effective Parking Ratio	1.07	0.9	1.29	1.19	0.91	1.25	1.42	1.19

National Average 1.19 Spaces per Unit

Our parking utilization data correlates strongly with the living status of our residents. Most of our properties are occupied by single adults with a single vehicle. While there are many instances where a one-bedroom apartment is occupied by residents with more than 1 vehicle, the additional spaces are offset by lack of utilization across the rest of the property. As seen in the following dataset, this philosophy is supported by our analysis of parking spaces in relation to the number of bedrooms.

#### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

In analyzing the overall composition of properties, a metric that TCR utilizes as a gauge to measure the feasibility of potential developments is the ratio of Parking Spaces to Bedrooms. While different markets have differing parking density demands, **1.0 Space per Bedroom** represents an internal benchmark for TCR to have adequate parking supply for its residents nationwide as well as in Florida.

Figure 4. National Portfolio Parking per Bedroom

Units	North Texas	Pacific Northwest	South Cal	Gulf Coast	Mid Atlantic	Southeast	Florida	Total	% Total
Studio	55	0	6	40	22	7	0	130	2.7%
1	598	46	321	1278	189	241	451	3124	65.2%
2	266	76	153	445	75	121	297	1433	29.9%
3+	58	13	4	0	0	0	32	107	2.9%
Total Units	977	135	484	1763	286	369	780	4794	100%
Total Bedrooms	1359	237	645	2208	361	490	1141	6441	100%

Parking Spaces Occupied (by Bedroom)	North Texas	Pacific Northwest	South Cal	Gulf Coast	Mid Atlantic	Southeast	Florida	Total
<b>Total Occupied Spaces</b>	1045	122	624	2099	259	461	1104	5714
<b>Total Bedroom Count</b>	1359	237	645	2208	361	490	1141	6441
<b>Effective Parking Ratio</b>	0.77	0.51	0.97	0.95	0.72	0.94	0.97	0.89

National Average 0.89 Spaces per Bedroom

As illustrated in the Figure 4 tables, a minimum of 1.0 Space per Bedroom provides tolerance between the anticipated user demand and our minimum parking standards. If we remove the Pacific Northwest, which includes a small sample size from a public-transit oriented development, from the subset of data the National Average increases to 0.90 Occupied Spaces per Bedroom.

While TCR aims to follow all code and jurisdictional guidelines, in many instances the ability to reduce required parking to better suit the end-user demand has created unique opportunities to save cost, reduce lot coverage, provide more amenity/public spaces, and other project and community benefits.

#### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

#### **Project Specific and Regional Analysis**

In addition to the overall portfolio demographic and parking data, below is a snapshot of the most recent property to be developed, stabilized, and operated by TCR in the South Florida market. Alexan 335 is located east of N State Rd 7 in Plantation, FL just west of Fort Lauderdale. The project was a commercial infill development in a suburban community with a limited supply of apartment residencies to support the growing community of renters.

Figure 5. Alexan 335 Parking Summary

#### **ALEXAN 335**

7122747111000				
Unit Type	<b>Unit Count</b>	Unit Mix	Bedroom Count	Parking Utilization
1 Bedroom	108	44%	108	153
2 Bedroom	115	46%	230	198
3 Bedroom	25	10%	75	48
Total	248	100%	413	399
Occupied Spaces per Unit		1.61		
Occupied Spaces per Bedroom <b>0.97</b>				

In this particular market, a much larger percentage of two-bedroom units were required to satisfy the local demand. Additionally, the local jurisdiction had a higher requirement for parking based on the suburban oriented zoning ordinances. Overall the occupied parking spaces per unit trended higher than the national average and primarily due to the much higher percentage of 2 bedroom units.

Even so, the Occupied Spaces per Bedroom ratio is still in line with our regional best practice of 1.0.

Alexan 335 in one of several projects TCR has recently developed in the Florida market. TCR has followed the same philosophy in developing recent multi-family projects of similar size & typology across Florida. Overall, the Florida market has exhibited similar trends for parking demand while also showing overall unit type distributions closer to the ratios proposed at Alexan Delray.

Figure 6. Overall Florida Market Parking Summary

**ALEXAN PROPERTIES - FLORIDA MARKET OVERVIEW** 

Unit Type	Unit Count	Unit Mix	Bedroom Count	Parking Utilization
1 Bedroom	451	58%	451	532
2 Bedroom	297	38%	594	513
3 Bedroom	32	4%	96	59
Total	780	100%	1141	1104
Occupied Spaces	per Unit		1.42	
Occupied Spaces	per Bedroom		0.97	

#### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

#### Conclusion

When studying parking at the proposed Alexan Delray community, the national and regional datasets as well as local demographics provide meaningful and relevant information to consider parking reductions while ensuring the overall success of the development.

The current City of Delray Beach code required parking necessitates 476 total parking spaces in the Alexan Delray development equating to 1.21 parking spaces per bedroom, and the most recent plans submitted to the City indicate a total of 443 parking spaces (1.13 spaces per bedroom) in the proposed development. The revised development plan, coordinated with input from Delray Beach Development Services, proposes a total of 404 parking spaces (1.03 spaces per bedroom).

Figure 7. City of Delray Beach Code Required Parking and Space per Bedroom Equivalent

ALEXAN Delray	City of Delray Beach Required Parking								
Unit Type	<b>Unit Count</b>	Unit Mix	<b>Bedroom Count</b>	LDR Parking Ratio	Required Parking				
1 Bedroom	161	60%	161	1.25	201				
2 Bedroom	86	32%	172	2	172				
3 Bedroom	20	7%	60	2	40				
Guest				SEE LDR	63				
Total	267	100%	393		476				
Spaces per Unit		1.78							
Spaces per Bedro	om	1.21							

In comparison to the City of Delray parking requirements, the TCR parking data specific to Florida shows that lesser parking requirements can be applied (see effective parking ratio below). In addition to confirming our overall Space per Bedroom ratio of 1.0, the regional market study also provides direction on the appropriate parking ratios based on resident demand across the properties in Florida.

Figure 8. Effective Parking at Alexan Properties in the Florida Market

#### FLORIDA MARKET OVERVIEW Unit **Unit Type Unit Count Bedroom Count Parking Utilization Effective Parking Ratio** Mix 1 Bedroom 451 58% 451 532 1.17 297 2 Bedroom 38% 594 513 1.73 4% 1.84 3 Bedroom 32 96 59 Total 780 100% 1141 1104 **Occupied Spaces per Unit** 1.42 **Occupied Spaces per Bedroom** 0.97

#### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

Combining the market findings from the previous table with local analysis of prospective residents, TCR proposes the following parking provisions for Alexan Delray:

Figure 9. Alexan Delray Proposed Parking Provisions and Space per Bedroom Equivalent

Unit Type	Unit Count	Unit Mix	Bedroom Count	Proposed Ratio	Parking Proposed
1 Bedroom	161	60%	161	1.15	185
2 Bedroom	88	33%	176	1.75	154
3 Bedroom	18	7%	54	2	36
Guest				0.10 Space/Unit	27
Total	267	100%	391		402
				<b>Provided Parking</b>	404
Spaces per Unit		1.51			
Spaces per Bedr	room	1.03			

As demonstrated in this summary, a further reduction of parking would still provide for a minimum of 1.0 space per bedroom and would conform with our regional parking distributions. We anticipate that the parking demand at 2 and 3 bedrooms won't be as high, but the proposed ratio allows for surplus spaces to be provided.

Locally, Delray Beach renters are represented primarily by younger single adults with marginally elevated roommate/couple households which will result in demand for fewer parking spaces. Proximity to local transit on site (bus), regional transit within a mile (Delray Beach Tri-Rail), as well as the Delray Pathway proposed along the subject property allows for a greater commuter population and could potentially reduce the overall parking needs beyond the proposed amounts in the future.

Overall, this study demonstrates the ability for Alexan Delray to successfully reduce the required residential parking in order to provide additional public spaces as shown in the July 14<sup>th</sup>, 2022 development plan.

### A CROW HOLDINGS COMPANY

The updated development plan for Alexan Delray uses the parking reduction proposed in this study to proactively promote the pedestrian connectivity of Delray Beach by removing approximately 40 spaces and replacing them with public green space and improved sidewalk connectivity from Congress Ave. to the future Delray Pathway.

Combined with the energy of new residents and users, TCR proposes to enhance the Alexan Delray development by providing additional public space to create visual continuity and beatification along the future Delray Trail; all while continuing to promote a Delray First mindset.

Should you have any questions, please reach out directly via email or phone at the contact information provided below.

Sincerely,

RESIDENTIAL

Nyla Westlake

Managing Director - Asset Management

nwestlake@tcr.com P: 407-608-7324