

Eval Criteria 1	Xavier	Ana	Laura	Jeffrey	Patrick	Score	Eval Criteria 1 - Proposer's Experience. Overall and Experience; primary respondent's experience and background; examples of three bike programs; potential partner organizations providing key services; Awards, certifications, or other related recognition; managing bike dock stations; managing bike programs during special events; managing revenue control systems; managing bike programs in a location with seasonal visitors and/or residents; experience of each key personnel.	
							Strengths	Weaknesses
P3 Global Management Inc.	18.0	13.0	15.0	20.0	10.0	15.2	P3 Global currently has a presence in local market, they operate 150 bikes in West Palm Beach. Launched a 250-bike program in 2015 in Hoboken, one of the largest in the country. Has experience in sponsorships and advertising. Proposed Program Manager has over 10 years exp. in operating a bike retail outlet. Proposed Ops manager currently oversees the NJ and WPB operations, enhancing their experience. Managed a successful bike share in City of Hoboken. Experience in bike share programs clarified during the interviews.	P3 Global proposal provided limited details on the experience of the firm and the key personnel. P3 Global presented a large bike market of 30,000, but not within the US.
	18.0	15.0	19.0	20.0	10.0	16.4		
Zagster	12.0	15.0	17.0	19.0	10.0	14.6	Zagster has diverse experience. Been in business 10 years and has experience with different types of Share Programs.	Limited experience specific to Bike Share programs in Florida. Proposal has limited information on experience managing a program during special events. Proposal did not demonstrate an understanding of Delray Beach requirements related to seasonal visitors and special events.
	12.0	15.0	15.0	14.0	10.0	13.2		

Eval Criteria 2	Xavier	Ana	Laura	Jeffrey	Patrick	Score	Eval Criteria 2 - Operational Plan. Approach and general strategies for management of the Program, Business plan. Routine maintenance and cleaning of bikes, plan to sustain on-going operations, guarantees offered the City, Methods to monitor and rebalance/redistribute bikes, contingency for weather emergencies, example staffing plan, strategies for recruiting including local workers, customer service practices, process for refunds and resolving disputes, marketing plan and schedule, rates for bike customers, any rate discounts, payment options/credit card security, technology to be used, bike reservations, reporting.	
							Strengths	Weaknesses
P3 Global Management Inc.							P3 Global proposes a local manager to oversee the program and two part-time staff. P3 Global has partnered with NextBike, a next-generation smart bike technology company. P3 Global has a local maintenance team and they stock spare parts. Presented a good maintenance plan and marketing plan. During the interview the representatives demonstrated understanding of the City requirements.	Deployment will not occur until firm engages a Program sponsor. Limited details on any contingency plans in the event of a storm. No special pricing/discounts offered for residents or for City employees, but stated it can be negotiated during negotiation phase.
	22.0	18.0	19.0	21.0	10.0	18.0		
	22.0	18.0	22.0	23.0	10.0	19.0		
Zagster							Zagster offers customer support 24/7 through call center. Proposes to work with local businesses before deployment. Proposal provides detailed information on the operation plan which is based on obtaining a sponsor for each unit. Zagster has certified mechanic. Zagster did not propose advertising for the kiosks; plans advertising through an app.	Operational plan does not include local management and staffing. Sponsorships will be for one year. Bicycles will be purchased and deployed as sponsors are engaged to cover the costs. During interview indicated that the expectation was that the City would have a significant role in finding sponsors for the Program. Limited information provided on any resident pricing program.
	15.0	20.0	21.0	23.0	20.0	19.8		
	15.0	18.0	18.0	16.0	20.0	17.4		

Eval Criteria 3	Xavier	Ana	Laura	Jeffrey	Patrick	Score	Eval Criteria 3 - Capacity and Approach. Working knowledge of requirements, approach and methodologies, goals for Program, implementation, details of how Program 'size' was determined, docking stations, location of docking stations, bicycles proposed, how seasonal fluctuations will be addressed, ADA provisions, funding sources for Program, accessibility and ability to attend meetings.	
							Strengths	Weaknesses
P3 Global Management Inc.							P3 Global presented a good marketing plan that demonstrated knowledge of industry, docking stations, and marketing points. Geography for placement of docking stations. Initial phase of implementation will be of 80 bikes and 14 stations concentrated in high-trafficked downtown & tourist area. Vision to link with West Palm Beach, possible synergy bike share in Delray and West Palm Beach. Proposal states that they will be working with City to find the transportation provider. All the bikes will be rolled out at the same time. Demonstrated an understanding of the community.	Will need City assistance to set up stations more quickly. One type/size of bicycle proposed.
	15.0	13.0	15.0	18.0	15.0	15.2		
Zagster	20.0	18.0	20.0	22.0	15.0	19.0	Zagster proposed 20 docking stations, most in the beach area. Several types of bikes proposed. Proposal included a map of the docking station locations. Zagster proposal is to phase in the Program. Model offered can be adjusted for City. Customer specialist available. Zagster proposal states that they are able to deliver bikes and stations within a few weeks after obtaining a sponsor.	There will be no on-site staff to address the issues; issue resolution will be via email and/or phone. Limited number of bikes proposed for Phase 1 implementation. Proposal provided limited information on how the docking locations were/will be determined. The map for location of proposed docking stations and transportation plan was made based remote analysis; no on-site analysis was made.
	16.0	15.0	17.0	18.0	18.0	16.8		
	10.0	18.0	15.0	14.0	18.0	15.0		

Eval Criteria 4	Xavier	Ana	Laura	Jeffrey	Patrick	Score	Eval Criteria 4 - Revenue Proposal. Creative revenue sources, financial summary, backup that supports expense and revenue projections, pro forma, revenue-sharing options, estimated revenues if bikes have advertisements.	
							Strengths	Weaknesses
P3 Global Management Inc.	15.0	15.0	15.0	15.0	15.0	15.0	P3 Global presented a well developed revenue proposal. P3G will launch a privately financed bike share program. Proposed to advertise sponsors on bikes. Competitive bike rental prices.	No revenues to the City were proposed at this time. Advertising on the bike plus panel may not be viable due to City sign ordinance limitations.
	10.0	10.0	10.0	14.0	15.0	11.8		
Zagster	10.0	18.0	17.0	15.0	20.0	16.0	Zagster proposal presented a good marketing plan. Proposal provided a detailed explanation of the revenue plan to the City. Proposal gives the City the opportunity to price bike services.	Sponsorship relies heavily on City involvement. Zagsters logos occupy prime advertising locations on bikes. Service Fee of \$1800 per bike/A1per year (covered by sponsorship). Revenue projections based upon nationwide data.
	10.0	10.0	10.0	7.0	15.0	10.4		

Eval Criteria 5	Xavier	Ana	Laura	Jeffrey	Patrick	Score	Eval Criteria 5 - Interviews. Knowledge demonstrated. Clear, unqualified answers, presentation style.	
							Strengths	Weaknesses
P3 Global Management Inc.	9.0	10.0	8.0	9.0	10.0	9.2	The representatives were knowledgeable about the Program requirements. Firm is committed to expanding in FL. They articulated the challenges and time frame in an honest manner. Presentation style was a relaxed and professional demeanor.	Limited number of staffing proposed.
Zagster	5.0	4.0	5.0	4.0	5.0	4.6	None noted.	Presented via on-line meeting. The representative did not demonstrate knowledge of Delray Beach. Presentation style lacked professionalism. Success not based off appropriate market saturation.

Eval Criteria 6	Xavier	Ana	Laura	Jeffrey	Patrick	Score	Eval Criteria 6 - Location. Local Business Preference; Businesses must be certified prior to the Due Date and Time for submission of Proposals	
							Strengths	Weaknesses
P3 Global Management Inc.	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		Firm is not certified as a Local Business
Zagster	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		Firm is not certified as a Local Business

Ranking		Initial Eval Score	Final Eval Score
P3 Global Management Inc.		72.6	75.4
Zagster		71.8	60.6