

## Planning, Zoning and Building Department

#### **BOARD ACTION REPORT - APPEALABLE ITEM**

Project Name: 49 Palm Square Project Location: 49 Palm Square

Request: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)

Board: Historic Preservation Board

Meeting Date: July 19, 2017

#### **Board Action:**

Approved the COA for elevation changes, on a 6 to 0 vote (Harden Absent).

#### **Project Description:**

The property is located within the RM (Multi-Family Residential) zoning district and the Marina Historic District, a Nationally and Locally Registered Historic District. The one-story, historic, minimal traditional wood frame residence was built in the late 1930's or early 1940's as a vacation cottage. The residence is situated on three lots measuring 87.50' wide overall x 110' deep (south line) to 123' deep on the north property line. The original subject 1,024 square foot one-story residence has front facing cross-gabled roofs covered in asphalt shingle, horizontal clapboard siding, operable wood louver shutters and an irregular floor plan. There is a brick chimney located towards the rear (west) side of the residence and the height of the residence is approximately 14' (grade to peak).

In 2015, the Historic Preservation Board approved a COA for the hydraulic lifting of the structure in place by approximately 2' foot higher than it is was originally situated. The lifting of the structure to 8'-0" (NGVD) allowed it to slightly exceed the FEMA required minimum floor elevations for this Flood Zone. The property is one block away from the Intracoastal Waterway and flooding has occurred on the site as well as adjacent properties. The proposal also included:

- Creation of two additions on the south side of the existing structure. One is an extension of the bath and guest closet and the other is an extension of the master bedroom;
- An 1,490 square foot addition on the north side of the existing structure for a new kitchen, pantry, laundry;
- An attached open air carport to contain a cabana bath and storage area situated to the rear of the carport and equaling 627 square feet; and,
- Alteration of the rear porch.

The current COA request will allow for a material change to the approved brick chimney to natural coquina stone, elimination of the proposed trellis feature on the west (front) elevation, revision of the front porch roofline, construction of a new covered entrance on the north elevation and revision of the style of the front door. Staff supported the Certificate of Appropriateness request.

#### **Board Comments:**

The Board comments were supportive.

## **Public Comments:**

No members of the public spoke for or against the project.

Associated Actions: All required actions were taken.

**Next Action**: HPB action is final.

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD CITY OF DELRAY BEACH STAFF REPORT

**MEETING DATE:** July 19, 2017

ITEM: 49 Palm Square, Marina Historic District-Certificate of Appropriateness, (2017-

**167**) for architectural elevation changes to the contributing residence.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness

## **GENERAL DATA:**

Owner/ Applicant...... Noel Smith and Linda Harper

Agent:..... Roger Cope, Cope Architects, Inc.

Location: 49 Palm Square

Property Size: ..... 0.23 Acres

Historic District:..... Marina Historic District

Current Zoning:..... RM (Multi-Family Residential)

Adjacent Zoning:....

North: RM South: RM East: RM West: RM

Existing Future Land Medium Density Residential 5-12

Use Designation:..... DU/Acre

Water Service: Public water service is

provided on site.

Sewer Service: Public sewer service is

provided on site.



## ITEM BEFORE THE BOARD

The item before the Board is the consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) (2017-167) request for architectural elevation changes to the contributing residence on the property located at **49 Palm Square, Marina Historic District**, pursuant to Land Development Regulations (LDR) Section 2.4.6(H).

#### **BACKGROUND & PROJECT DESCRIPTION**

The property is located within the RM (Multi-Family Residential) zoning district and the Marina Historic District, a Nationally and Locally Registered Historic District. The one-story, historic, minimal traditional wood frame residence was built in the late 1930's or early 1940's as a vacation cottage. According to the City Property cards, the residence was built in 1942, yet the master site files reflect 1939 and 1940. The residence is situated on three lots measuring 87.50' wide overall x 110' deep (south line) to 123' deep on the north property line.

The original subject 1,024 square foot one-story residence has front facing cross gabled roofs covered in asphalt shingle, horizontal clapboard siding, operable wood louver shutters and an irregular floor plan. There is a brick chimney located towards the rear (west) side of the residence and the height of the residence is approximately 14' (grade to peak).

In 2015, the Historic Preservation Board approved a COA for the hydraulic lifting of the structure in place by approximately 2' foot higher than it is was originally situated, which was below the flood plain at 6'-13" (NGVD) and not meeting FEMA floor height level requirements. The lifting of the structure to 8'-0" (NGVD) allowed it to slightly exceed the FEMA required minimum floor elevations for this Flood Zone. The property is one block away from the Intracoastal Waterway. Flooding has occurred on the site as well as adjacent properties. The proposal also included:

- Creation of two additions on the south side of the existing structure. One is an extension of the bath and guest closet and the other is an extension of the master bedroom;
- An 1,490 square foot addition on the north side of the existing structure for a new kitchen, pantry, laundry;
- A new attached open air carport to contain a cabana bath and storage area situated to the rear of the carport and equaling 627 square feet; and,
- Alteration of the rear porch.

The approved additions to the residence were similar in scale, mass and height to the existing structure, maintaining similar architectural details. The approved height of the raised structure is approximately 14' high, with the new addition to the rear of the existing residence approximately 20' high.

The current COA request is to allow a material change for the approved brick chimney to natural coquina stone, to eliminate the proposed trellis feature on the west (front) elevation, revise the roofline of the front porch, construct new covered entrance on the north elevation and revise the style of the front door. The subject COA is now before the Board for consideration.

#### **DESIGN ELEMENTS ANALYSIS**

Pursuant to LDR Section 2.4.6(H)(5), <u>Certificate of Appropriateness Findings</u>, prior to approval, a finding must be made that any Certificate of Appropriateness which is to be approved is consistent with Historic Preservation purposes pursuant to Objective A-4 of the Land Use Element of the Comprehensive Plan and specifically with provisions of Section 4.5.1, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E), <u>Development Standards</u>, all new development or exterior improvements on individually designated historic properties and/or properties located within historic districts shall, comply with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Development Standards of this Section.

## Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(2)(b)(3) - Major Development:

The subject application is considered Minor Development as it involves the construction, reconstruction, or alteration of a building less than twenty-five percent (25%) of the existing floor area, and all appurtenances."

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(4) - <u>Alterations</u>, In considering proposals for alterations to the exterior of historic buildings and structures and in applying development and preservation standards, the documented, original design of the building may be considered.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(5) - <u>Standards and Guidelines</u>, A historic site, building, structure, improvement, or appurtenance within a historic district shall only be altered, restored, preserved, repaired, relocated, demolished, or otherwise changed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, as amended from time to time.

## The applicable Secretary of Interior Standards for Rehabilitation are noted below:

#### Standard 2

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

#### Standard 3

Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

#### Standard 9

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

#### Standard 10

New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) - <u>Visual Compatibility Standards</u>: new construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section with regard to height, width, mass, scale, façade, openings, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1. Visual compatibility for minor and major development as referenced in Section 4.5.1(E)(2) shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m) below. Visual compatibility for all development on individually designated properties outside the district shall be determined by comparison to other structures within the site.

## Applicable Visual Compatibility Standards

**(f)Rhythm of Entrance and/or Porch Projections:** The relationship of entrances and porch projections to the sidewalks of a building shall be visually compatible with existing architectural styles of entrances and porch projections on existing historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district for all development.

(g)Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color: The relationship of materials, texture, and color of the facade of a building and/or hardscaping shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district.

**(h)Roof Shapes:** The roof shape, including type and slope, of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the roof shape of existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district. The roof shape shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building.

**(k)Directional Expression of Front Elevation:** A building shall be visually compatible with the buildings, structures, and sites within a historic district for all development with regard to its directional character, whether vertical or horizontal.

The previous approval included removal of the existing fireplace as evidence of structural cracking along its surface indicated it was structurally compromised; thus, required rebuilding. The fireplace was proposed to be replaced with a new a two-way interior fireplace; the exterior chimney was to be reconstructed utilizing red brick masonry. During the interior renovation, the owner chose to utilize natural coquina stone to face the interior of the new two-way fireplace rather than red brick. In order to maintain continuity and keep the fireplace looking authentic, the applicant has requested to also utilize the coquina stone on the exterior of the fireplace.

The proposal includes removal of the previously approved trellis from the west (front) elevation. The trellis was originally proposed to provide a covered area offering shelter from the elements and as a connection from the adjacent proposed carport (north side of the structure). The north elevation will include a new covered entrance between the carport and the main structure, eliminating the need for the trellis and ensuring the front elevation of the existing residence will not be obscured.

The proposal also includes revision to the roofline of the front porch on the west elevation. Originally, a post and beam/lean-to type porch was approved which slightly revised the scale of the front elevation. The change includes a continuation of the roofline towards the front of the structure, reducing the overall height of the porch support columns and shifting the light fixtures on each of the columns down. The revisions will allow the front porch to be more pedestrian in scale and in keeping with the original scale of the structure while also ensuring visual compatibility and consistency with the standard for Roof Shapes as well as the standard for Rhythm of Entrance and/or Porch Projections.

Coquina was a material utilized for a variety of applications at the time the structure was built; thus, the use of coquina on the chimney meets the standard for the Relationship of Materials, Texture and Color, ensuring authenticity of materials used in historic buildings and structures within the Marina Historic District.

Finally, the front entrance door is to be revised to include an impact-rated, single-panel wood door with a single-paned wood framed transom window above. The approved front entry door was for an impact rated French door with 10 divided lights, with white trim.

The proposed revisions to the front elevation, specifically removal of the proposed trellis, coquina cladding facing of the new fireplace and revision to the porch roofline will resemble but not match the original structure while also being compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features, protecting the historic integrity of the property and the Marina Historic District; thus, the

49 Palm Square; COA 2017-167 HPB Meeting July 19, 2017 Page 4 of 4

proposal can be found to be generally appropriate and compatible with the Visual Compatibility Standards and the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

### **ALTERNATIVE ACTIONS**

- A. Continue with direction.
- B. Move approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness (2017-167) for **49 Palm Square, Marina Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5).
- C. Move denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness (2017-167) for **49 Palm Square, Marina Historic District** by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof does not meet the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5).

#### RECOMMENDATION

Move approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness (2017-167) for **49 Palm Square, Marina Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5).

Attachments: Drawings Photographs

Report Prepared by: Michelle Hoyland, Historic Preservation Planner







