

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

Design of Osceola Park Neighborhood Improvements
RFQ No. 2017-035

1. Experience, Background, References	Missie Barletto	Xavier Falconi	Kevin Matthews	Mark Stivers	Score	Experience, Background, References 30 Points	
						Strengths	Weaknesses
Arcadis, U.S.	27.0	26.0	28.0	28.0	27.3	S FL and PBC experience, PM local experience, 4 references stated responsive and on time	# of current litigations, demonstration of neighborhood design infrastructure, low detail of public outreach in proposal
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)	28.0	25.0	28.0	29.0	27.5	Delray beach experience, whole neighborhood experience (traffic calming), same team throughout multiple projects, several references stated they would hire firm again, approach to neighborhood programs, grant experience, specialize in municipality work, traffic engineering knowledge	Change of ownership, some litigation, no traffic engineering on org chart
	28.0	28.0	28.0	29.0	28.3		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates	25.0	20.0	27.0	27.0	24.8	Local experience specific to this project, experience with CRA, Osceola Park Neighborhood project with public outreach	No references responded to the survey request, proposal lacked specific experience (generic), no major awards/recognition listed
	28.0						
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
CPH	28.0	20.0	26.0	27.0	25.3	Experience is relevant but not local (central FL), letters of reference in proposal, numerous awards	One reference responded to feedback request, traffic calming, local similar projects, alley way designs, litigation
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craig A. Smith & Associates	25.0	20.0	26.0	27.0	24.5	Stormwater/water and sewer experience, permitting, public involvement experience with sub-consultant	No complete streetscape in existing neighborhood, one reference responded to survey, alley way designs, limited experience as prime for roadway/neighborhood projects
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craven, Thompson & Associates	29.0	20.0	28.0	28.0	26.3	Civil experience in PBC, government-related experience, streetscape and complete street experience, positive reference feedback, roadway experience in S FL	Traffic calming, limited awards and recognition
	29.0	20.0	28.0	28.0	26.3		
Engenuity Group	24.0	22.0	25.0	26.0	24.3	Experience in Delray Beach and PBC, positive reference feedback, long-term references, CRA experience	Delray experience is as a subconsultant, limited experience as it relates to roadway design, primarily survey experience, traffic experience
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Kimley-Horn and Associates	26.0	25.0	27.0	28.0	26.5	Detailed and long history/experience with City, roadway design, stormwater, streetscape, 50 years experience in S FL	Specific City work referenced in proposal, no references responded to feedback request, pending local litigation
	26.0	25.0	27.0	28.0	26.5		
Wantman Group, Inc	29.0	25.0	28.0	27.0	27.3	Most reference feedback with very positive feedback (top firm in "stable"), number of awards and recognition, project manager has related experience for this project, local roadway experience	
	29.0	25.0	28.0	27.0	27.3		

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

2. Similar Completed Projects	Missie Barletto	Xavier Falconi	Kevin Matthews	Mark Stivers	Score	Similar Completed Projects 20 Points	
						Strengths	Weaknesses
Arcadis, U.S.	15.0	18.0	17.0	19.0	17.3	Jupiter Inlet Colony similar project, N Flagler Drive project,	Local projects specific to our City, involvement of neighborhood in projects, community projects in relation to other proposers
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)	19.0	18.0	20.0	19.0	19.0	Virtually flawless projects that they've completed for our City, approach to community outreach in other projects	Specific traffic calming
	19.0	18.0	20.0	19.0	19.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates	19.0	15.0	19.0	17.0	17.5	Specific project in this neighborhood, other Delray Beach projects related to this scope of work, 18 projects from 2011 to now	Traffic calming, public outreach
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
CPH	18.0	15.0	17.0	17.0	16.8	Relative projects, public outreach in other projects, CRA work for Panama City	Similar projects are inland, projects by proposed team
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craig A. Smith & Associates	16.0	15.0	16.0	17.0	16.0	Westgate CRA project, drainage projects	Focus on stormwater and utilities, private development projects, no complete neighborhood projects, no projects with public involvement or traffic calming
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craven, Thompson & Associates	20.0	15.0	18.0	18.0	17.8	Wayfinding, ADA, CPTED studies, bicycle/ped studies, same team throughout projects, Miami Gardens and Lake Worth Neighborhood widening projects, stormwater analysis, civil engineering	Only 3 projects in PBC, Floridana project lacked details for traffic calming
	20.0	15.0	18.0	18.0	17.8		
Engenuity Group	15.0	15.0	16.0	16.0	15.5	Very strong in surveying work	Most completed projects were as subconsultant, listed 10 projects, no roadway or neighborhood design projects
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Kimley-Horn and Associates	19.0	17.0	20.0	18.0	18.5	Relevant similar projects, permeable pavement design, bioswales and bioretention projects, US1 improvement project, MLK project, road widening projects	Team proposed only worked on two projects, traffic projects
	19.0	17.0	20.0	18.0	18.5		
Wantman Group, Inc	19.0	17.0	18.0	17.0	17.8	Streetscape, wayfinding, bicycle and pedestrian projects, Saddle Park project, NE 2nd Ave design	Neighborhood projects with public outreach, team proposed hasn't work on many similar completed projects, Delray Marketplace listed as City (and other projects incorrectly list location as City rather than County)
	19.0	17.0	18.0	17.0	17.8		

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

3. Approach to Project Management	Missie Barletto	Xavier Falconi	Kevin Matthews	Mark Stivers	Score	Approach to Project Management 20 Points	
						Strengths	Weaknesses
Arcadis, U.S.	13.0	18.0	16.0	15.0	15.5	Approach aligns with the needs of the project, traffic-related project management approach, 60% plan check, project management positively highlighted in reference checks	Standard approach for any project, did not tailor project management approach to our City, time schedule, generic pictures
	10.0		18.0	18.0			
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)	19.0	18.0	19.0	19.0	18.8	Aggressive schedule, inclusive of engineer and general contractor, 30-60-90% plan check, discussion of project understanding, website development & newsletter for public outreach, stormwater routing, outlined specific issues to be resolved	Traffic plan
	19.0	20.0	19.0	19.0	19.3		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates	16.0	14.0	18.0	17.0	16.3	Covered all subjects requested	Did not demonstrate knowledge of Delray, communication plan staff-dominated, generic approach to a unique situation, not enough detail for public outreach plan, no 90% plan submittal, lengthy schedule for design
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
CPH	18.0	15.0	17.0	18.0	17.0	Public outreach approach very detailed, traffic control plans, Addressed business outreach, basis of design report, constructability review, recognized inherit constraints in neighborhood	Schedule for design, late design (60%) review, traffic plan
	20.0						
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craig A. Smith & Associates	16.0	15.0	18.0	16.0	16.3	Mapped out roads for project, aggressive schedule, 30-60-90% plan review, alternate methods for products to be utilized	Public outreach was light, lacked specifics for each approach, communication focused on notifying rather than planning
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craven, Thompson & Associates	18.0	15.0	15.0	18.0	16.5	Subconsultant for public outreach, complete GIS documents would be prepared for City, clear outline of approach (particularly research), no proposed 3D/laser surveying, 30-60-90% plans	Complaint line, project website, unrealistic timeline (main concern for points)
	18.0	15.0	15.0	18.0	16.5		
Engenuity Group	13.0	15.0	17.0	17.0	15.5	Overview of grant funding and applying for	Public involvement and traffic approaches, general approach with no specific detail to this project, primarily surveying approach, lack of project understanding, timeline
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Kimley-Horn and Associates	18.0	17.0	18.0	17.0	17.5	Budget control and QAQC, detailed schedule with 10 month design	Public meetings as needed, generic approach, no substance to public outreach
	18.0	17.0	18.0	17.0	17.5		
Wantman Group, Inc	20.0	18.0	18.0	16.0	18.0	Public involvement plan with website, outreach at 30-60% plans, referenced CRA master plan for neighborhood and City's new streets policy, pervious pavements in alley ways, presentation specified generalizations in proposal (specifically project manager's approach)	General approach not specific to the neighborhood, elaboration on finding flaws
	20.0	18.0	18.0	18.0	18.5		

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

4. Organizational Structure	Missie Barletto	Xavier Falconi	Kevin Matthews	Mark Stivers	Score	Organizational Structure 20 Points	
						Strengths	Weaknesses
Arcadis, U.S.	15.0	16.0	14.0	17.0	15.5	Balanced team, international firm, in-house staff	Subconsultant is out of town, public outreach representatives, availability chart and workload, QAQC, lack of clarity on org chart
	19.0			18.0			
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)	17.0	18.0	17.0	19.0	17.8	Group of engineers and subconsultants, PM and staff availability, Quality Assurance (QA), depth of team (backup resources), included traffic engineering in interview	Traffic engineer, 6 subconsultants
	20.0	20.0	17.0	19.0	19.0		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates	14.0	12.0	18.0	17.0	15.3	Support staff, numerous office locations, team has worked together on numerous projects, good depth	Description of staff, public outreach discipline lacked specific staff designee, standard organizational structure (not tailored to this project), traffic calming personnel, heavy workload (75% or greater) for most key personnel, "pine" inspections by Shenandoah
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
CPH	16.0	12.0	17.0	18.0	15.8	Depth in firm (all in-house), work capacity, Stormwater management personnel, permitting specialist	Traffic calming personnel, public involvement personnel, other missing personnel such as electrical and geotechnical, no QAQC shown, no availability for sub-consultants, personnel heavy on utilities but not specific to transportation
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craig A. Smith & Associates	15.0	17.0	16.0	16.0	16.0	Most disciplines are covered, subconsultants have own org chart	Subconsultants performing key components, Johnson Engineering supplementing engineering, "civil stormwater" sectioned bundled, key personnel not involved until bidding phase, organization of proposal
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craven, Thompson & Associates	17.0	14.0	19.0	18.0	17.0	Subconsultant for public outreach, team has history of working together, traffic engineering component added during interview	QAQC, traffic engineering personnel, highly utilized firm, key personnel availability
	17.0	16.0	19.0	18.0	17.5		
Engenuity Group	17.0	15.0	15.0	16.0	15.8	Strong subconsultants, 50% availability for this project	6 subconsultants, most of team is 50% or more committed to other projects, flat org chart, supplementing engineering to subconsultant, quality control for surveying only (not whole project), org chart hard to follow
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Kimley-Horn and Associates	16.0	15.0	18.0	17.0	16.5	Resources and support is strong, local office, in-house staff, dedicated personnel for traffic operations and QAQC	No public outreach personnel, project org chart extremely limited (staff assigned to only one task such as QAQC), subconsultant staff noted as-needed, 4 key staff, workload availability not detailed, not tailored to this project
	16.0	15.0	18.0	17.0	16.5		
Wantman Group, Inc	16.0	17.0	17.0	17.0	16.8	Public involvement/outreach, certified planners, QAQC, lighting, various disciplines handled in-house	Team has limited time together, PM experience is vaguely related to neighborhood improvements or public projects, separated traffic engineering and signalization, personnel for geotechnical, workload and availability
	16.0	17.0	17.0	17.0	16.8		

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

5. Interviews	Missie Barletto	Xavier Falconi	Kevin Matthews	Mark Stivers	Score	Interviews 10 Points	
						Strengths	Weaknesses
Arcadis, U.S.	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	Strong presence, depth of detail, well organized presentation, traffic engineer's ability to communicate his experience and knowledge, temporary traffic calming, adjust plan according to public feedback, will use good data to backup public's suggestions	Presentation not as neighborhood specific as others
	10.0	10.0	9.0	10.0	9.8		
Calvin, Giordano & Associates	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
CPH	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craig A. Smith & Associates	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Craven, Thompson & Associates	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	Specific examples of how to accomplish tasks for this project,	Project engineer's knowledge of CPTED, outreach construction oriented, only firm to not state website for public outreach, lack of strong presence for public outreach, stated little Delray Beach complete streets policy knowledge
	5.0	7.0	8.0	8.0	7.0		
Engenuity Group	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0		
	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A		
Kimley-Horn and Associates	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	Approach to public outreach (gates of communication), evaluate each item individually, creole and Spanish translator, neighborhood pride (style of crosswalks, ADA, etc.)	Naples video lacked efficiency of parking etc., asked question regarding bike paths and got an answer regarding roundabouts, underwhelmed with presentation style, only 4 person project team, project team not clearly identified
	7.0	8.0	9.0	7.0	7.8		
Wantman Group, Inc	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	0.0	Alleyways (encroachment, fences, etc.), traffic engineer in-house, project manager's depth of knowledge, CPTED knowledge, knowledge of community, strong presentation (incorporating community identity)	Traffic engineer not present, \$40M project just awarded to firm (concern for availability on this project)
	10.0	7.0	9.0	8.0	8.5		

City of Delray Beach
Final Ranking Form

Buyer Name: Ryan Lingholm

Date of Technical Evaluations: 3/27/17

Date of Final Evaluations: 4/3/17

Ranking	Initial Ranking Total	Final Ranking Total
Arcadis, U.S.	75.5	N/A
Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)	83.0	95.3
Calvin, Giordano & Associates	73.8	N/A
CPH	74.8	N/A
Craig A. Smith & Associates	72.8	N/A
Craven, Thompson & Associates	77.5	85.0
Engenuity Group	71.0	N/A
Kimley-Horn and Associates	79.0	86.8
Wantman Group, Inc	79.8	88.8

Legend:

Technical Evaluation Scores - Top-most score within each Proposer's row of each criterion
Recorded Score Changes* - Middle scores within each Proposer's row of each criterion
*Recorded Score Changes represent a member's preliminary score before scores were finalized
Final Evaluation Scores - Bottom-most score within each Proposer's row of each criterion
N/A - Proposer was not shortlisted, no scores recorded
Grayed Cell - No score changes during the technical or final evaluation meeting

Shortlisted Firms:

- 1 Baxter & Woodman (Mathews Consulting)
- 2 Wantman Group, Inc
- 3 Kimley-Horn and Associates
- 4 Craven, Thompson & Associates