

Experience, Background 30 Pts Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Steve Hynes	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Experience, Background 30 Pts Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	27.0	30.0	27.0	25.0	27.0	136.0	Proposer has 25 years in business with a variety of certifications and staff experience. Proposer has several pending lawsuits. Proposer has multiple contracts as the first provider. Good organizational chart with project management philosophy. Proposer will provide 14 personnel dedicated to CDB however 6 in the field. Proposal seems heavy on sub-contracting. Firm has 22 claims with 50% Hurricane Irma related. Proposal includes a consultant well versed in FEMA requirements.
Bergeron	26.0	18.0	25.0	28.0	25.0	122.0	Proposer has 26 years in business. Proposal lacked information regarding employee qualification, licenses, awards or complaints. Proposer has 20 active accounts in Florida. The proposal was confusing about number of years in business with debris management. Strong references noted in proposal.
Crowder Gulf	29.0	25.0	28.0	30.0	27.0	139.0	Since 2002 proposer has FEMA experience with all forms of disaster's. Proposer has a full service firm with under water sonar scanning and drones which would be helpful to operations. Proposer provided a detailed organizational chart with exceptionally qualified licensed and experienced staff. Proposer would not make first contact with CDB until 48 hours out which is a bit late. No lawsuits or liens presented by proposer on either side. Proposer awarded 2016 APWA Texas & 2018 APWA Florida
D&J	28.0	29.0	26.0	26.0	27.0	136.0	Proposer started debris management in 1987. Proposer presented significant storm experience with licensed and qualified staff. Proposer has a large number of full-time employees reducing the need for sub-contractors along with several engineers on staff. Proposer is a USACE contractor and FDOT qualified. Proposer presented strong references.
Devland	17.0	20.0	15.0	20.0	15.0	87.0	Proposer has 32 years of experience. Proposer only listed CEO, unclear on firm's capacity. Proposer did not provide any information regarding litigation. Proposer provided a very limited contract list.
DRC	27.0	18.0	25.0	25.0	23.0	118.0	Proposer presented a team with strong experience of key personnel. Proposal included several awards. Proposer has several lawsuits/claims regarding breach of contract with sub-contractors or within the firm. Proposer has over 100 active contracts in Florida which seems overwhelming. Proposal states 100% of FEMA reimbursement.
TFR	27.0	20.0	27.0	27.0	27.0	128.0	Proposer has several government contracts. Organizational chart presented in proposal very strong. Proposer is a USACE contractor and FDOT qualified. Proposal included a step by step plan on how firm will handle any disaster depending on the severity by using procedures in relation with FEMA requirements. Proposal included 3 awards received in conjunction with debris removal. Proposal presented 1 lawsuit.

Approach and Capacity 30 Pts. Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Steve Hynes	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Approach and Capacity 30 Pts. Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	28.0	30.0	28.0	30.0	27.0	143.0	Proposer presented well rounded services with pre-planning, planning and execution techniques required to complete the job. Proposer provided details on engaging the City within the regulations and procedures of FEMA requirements. Proposer presented detailed financial information. The staff accessibility could be an issue as it was not very well detailed in the proposal.
Bergeron	26.0	30.0	25.0	30.0	26.0	137.0	Proposal included a strong approach with guidelines, standards and procedures on how to evaluate and execute a contract. Proposal provided a flow chart which shows how the firm will perform the work. Proposal detailed a crew package and zoning of the work areas along with disposal site with attention to environmental details. Proposal did not include much information on FEMA reimbursement. Proposal provided a limited list on subs-contractors.
Crowder Gulf	30.0	30.0	28.0	30.0	27.0	145.0	Proposer offers a solid approach on disaster removal, with different formulas in place depending on the event and severity including drone and GoPro technology with a response timeline and clear plan. Proposer is the only firm that included traffic control services. Proposal needed more details on what disposal site would look like. Proposer will offer major safety training for City staff annually. Proposer will assign a senior staff member to the CDB EOC.
D&J	29.0	30.0	26.0	30.0	26.0	141.0	Proposer detailed a very strategic approach with several levels of alerts pertaining to restoration. Extensive sub-contractor list however the firm is not dependent on subs-contractors. Proposal includes a lot of free client training for City staff. Proposal details a hot spot crew to handle emergency complaints. Proposer will deploy mechanics with crew with-in 24 hours therefore utilizing 2 drivers.
Devland	15.0	8.0	12.0	20.0	10.0	65.0	Proposer offered no organizational chart or listing of sub-contractors. Proposal lacked details regarding approach and capacity.
DRC	29.0	30.0	26.0	29.0	25.0	139.0	Proposer presented a detailed approach on dealing with storms and debris removal. Proposer will establish a good relationship with debris monitors. Proposer detailed plan being onsite in 24 hours. Proposer has the FEMA record for most debris removed in a day. Proposer presented a plan for weekly public notices of the debris removal schedule.
TFR	27.0	30.0	25.0	30.0	25.0	137.0	Proposer detailed a FEMA compliance team with a hauling staging and debris plan. Proposer detailed plan with a 72 hour deployment however that would be a concern for CDB. Proposal lacked information on resources for sub-contractors. The proposal did state a preference for local sub-contractors.

Equipment 25 Pts Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Steve Hynes	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Equipment 25 Pts Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	20.0	12.5	25.0	25.0	23.0	105.5	Proposal detailed information regarding the equipment for CDB, however lacking some of minimum equipment requirements. Proposal included self loading trucks, however CDB prefers dump trucks with loaders. Proposer did not list sub-contractors. Potential for TDSRS site in Delray Beach. Proposer presented bench marks for full FEMA reimbursement.
Bergeron	20.0	12.5	20.0	20.0	22.0	94.5	Proposal did not have much information on TDSRS. Proposal did not have breakdown on what is available to CDB. Proposal was missing some of the minimum equipment requirements, no dump trucks listed which is a CDB preference. Proposal lacked depth of resources, no sub-contractors with equipment or rentals.
Crowder Gulf	25.0	12.5	25.0	24.0	23.0	109.5	Proposal included pictures of equipment including a marine division along with both dump trucks and self-loaders. Proposal had no pre-determined TDSRS.
D&J	25.0	20.0	22.0	20.0	23.0	110.0	Extensive listing of equipment along with vehicle vin numbers including 20 dump trucks. All equipment listed is owned by firm. Proposer TDSRS plan not very extensive.
Devland	15.0	7.5	10.0	15.0	10.0	57.5	Proposal lacked sufficient information. Proposer owns some equipment along with having accounts for rental equipment. Prosper did not offer information regarding TDSRS.
DRC	20.0	8.0	20.0	21.0	22.0	91.0	Proposal lacked information regarding equipment, self-loaders offered unlike the CDB preference of dump trucks. No information on TDSRS plan.
TFR	19.0	9.5	20.0	23.0	20.0	91.5	Proposal presented limited listing of equipment with grinders and trailers.

Fee Proposal 10 Pts. Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Steve Hynes	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Fee Proposal 10 Pts. Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	8.0	5.0	10.0	9.0	8.0	40.0	Presented clear fees and rates number 3 in pricing
Bergeron	8.0	2.0	18.0	10.0	8.0	46.0	Middle range for fees and rates
Crowder Gulf	9.0	3.0	10.0	9.0	8.0	39.0	
D&J	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	50.0	Lowest with rates and fees
Devland	8.0	3.0	7.0	10.0	7.0	35.0	Fee unclear hard to follow through
DRC	7.0	8.0	10.0	10.0	8.0	43.0	
TFR	8.0	3.0	10.0	8.0	5.0	34.0	

Ranking	Score
Ash Britt	424.5

Bergeron	399.5
Crowder Gulf	432.5
D&J	437.0
Devland	244.5
DRC	391.0
TFR	390.5

RFP No. 2018-01

Disaster and Debris Management Services

Technical Evaluation Scoring Summary Form

Buyer Name: Ja'Anal McAden

Technical Evaluations: 7/31/2018 13:14

Presentations: August 13, 2018 9:00am; 1:00pm & 2:00pm

Final Evaluations: August 17, 2018 1:00pm

Experience, Background 30 Pts Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Experience, Background 30 Pts Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	27.0	30.0	25.0	27.0	109.0	Proposer has 25 years in business with a variety of certifications and staff experience. Proposer has several pending lawsuits. Proposer has multiple contracts as the first provider. Good organizational chart with project management philosophy. Proposer will provide 14 personnel dedicated to CDB however, 6 in the field. Proposal seems heavy on sub-contracting. Firm has 22 claims with 50% Hurricane Irma related. Proposal includes an option for a consultant who is well versed in FEMA requirements.
Crowder Gulf	29.0	25.0	30.0	27.0	111.0	Since 2002 proposer has FEMA experience with all forms of disaster's. Proposer has a full service firm with under water sonar scanning and drones which would be helpful to operations. Proposer provided a detailed organizational chart with exceptionally qualified licensed and experienced staff. Proposer would not make first contact with CDB until 48 hours out which is a bite late. No lawsuits or liens presented by proposer on either side. Proposer awarded 2016 APWA Texas & 2018 APWA Florida.
D&J	28.0	29.0	26.0	27.0	110.0	Proposer started debris management in 1987. Proposer presented significant storm experience with licensed and qualified staff. Proposer has a large number of full-time employees reducing the need for sub-contractors along with several engineers on staff. Proposer is a USACE contractor and FDOT qualified. Proposer presented strong references.

Approach and Capacity 30 Pts. Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Approach and Capacity 30 Pts. Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	28.0	30.0	30.0	27.0	115.0	Proposer presented well rounded services with pre-planning, planning and execution techniques required to complete the job. Proposer provided details on engaging the City within the regulations and procedures of FEMA requirements. Proposer presented detailed financial information. The staff accessibility could be an issue as it was not very well detailed in the proposal.
Crowder Gulf	28.0	30.0	30.0	27.0	115.0	Proposer offers a solid approach on disaster removal, with different formulas in place depending on the event and severity including drone and GoPro technology with a response timeline and clear plan. Proposer is the only firm that included traffic control services. Proposal needed more details on what disposal site would look like. Proposer will offer major safety training for City staff annually. Proposer will assign a senior staff member to the CDB EOC.

D&J	29.0	30.0	30.0	26.0	115.0	Proposer detailed a very strategic approach with several levels of alerts pertaining to restoration. Extensive sub-contractor list however the firm is not dependent on sub-contractors. Proposal includes a lot of free client training for City staff. Proposal details a hot spot crew to handle emergency complaints. Proposer will deploy mechanics with crew with-in 24 hours therefore utilizing 2 drivers.
-----	------	------	------	------	-------	--

Equipment 25 Pts Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Equipment 25 Pts Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	23.0	12.5	25.0	23.0	83.5	Proposal detailed information regarding the equipment for CDB, however lacking some of minimum equipment requirements. Proposal included self loading trucks, however CDB prefers dump trucks with loaders. Proposer did not list sub-contractors. Proposal included potential for TDSRS site in Delray Beach. Proposer presented bench marks for full FEMA reimbursement.
Crowder Gulf	23.0	12.5	24.0	23.0	82.5	Proposal included pictures of equipment including a marine division along with both dump trucks and self-loaders. Proposal had no pre-determined TDSRS.
D&J	25.0	20.0	20.0	23.0	88.0	Extensive listing of equipment along with vehicle vin numbers, including 20 dump trucks. All equipment listed in the proposal is owned by firm. Proposer TDSRS plan not very extensive.

Fee Proposal 10 Pts. Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Fee Proposal 10 Pts. Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	8.0	5.0	9.0	8.0	30.0	Presented clear fees and rates number 3 in pricing

Crowder Gulf	9.0	3.0	9.0	8.0	29.0	
D&J	10.0	10.0	10.0	10.0	40.0	Lowest with rates and fees

Interviews 5 Pts. Max.	Missie Barletto	Angel Farinas	Sam Metott	Tim Stillings	Criterion Score	Interviews 5 Pts. Max. Scoring Discussions
Ash Britt	4.0	3.0	4.0	5.0	16.0	The firm's presentation offered good knowledge and answered the questions the selection committee requested clarification on. When asked follow up questions by the selection committee during the interview the CEO/representatives responded well to follow up questions.
Crowder Gulf	3.0	2.5	5.0	3.0	13.5	Firm's presentation lacked teamwork aspect in engaging the City. Presentation did not offer opportunities to engage the City in a partnership. The presentation again enforced that the equipment offered by the firm would only be using self loaders for the City. The firm's presentation did not add to the proposal. The firm did not offer any clarification during the interview of the questions asked by the selection committee. The firm did not offer any staging areas either.
D&J	5.0	2.0	3.0	5.0	15.0	The presentation expressed the firm's knowledge of City concerns with a good grasp of experience as a sub contractor. Firm has a strong team approach for working with City. Firm is prepared to help City locate a TDSRS.

Ranking	Score
Ash Britt	353.5
Crowder Gulf	351.0
D&J	368.0

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9

Replace the text within the red highlighted <> to match the solicitation; the black text will automatically update accordingly
Complete the date fields

To add a Committee member, insert a column and update the "Criterion Score" formulas accordingly (green text) [

To add a criterion, copy an entire criterion box and paste in below the last criterion; then, update the ranking formula

To add a company, insert the applicable rows for each criterion box and the ranking box, then update the formulas accordingly

Record each score in the appropriate area; the criterion score will automatically add the scores of each Committee member

Record the scoring notes in the appropriate area

Record only the finalized score for each Committee member

Use one summary form for technical evaluations, and one summary form for final evaluations (if applicable)

Suggestion: Once the Technical Evaluation Scoring Summary Form is formatted, copy the sheet and label it Final

s to include the new criterion (green text) [=IFERROR((F7+F14+F21+F28+F35), "")]