

Fire Protection Assessment Study

Presentation of Preliminary Results

**December 11, 2018** 



### ROLL CALC SAV Override > Water Rate Plan Overnide > Sewer Rate Plan Senior Debt Coverage 3.21 All Debt Coverage Last Plan Avg Bill (5,000 gal) \$53.50 Pperating Fund IP Spending Current Plan # Last Plan 540M

# Agenda

- 1. Introduction
- 2. Fire Assessment Background
- 3. Methodology Discussion
- 4. Assessment Calculation
- 5. Property Impact Examples
- 6. Next Steps and Discussion

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Introduction & Background

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

#### Introduction to Stantec

- The City of Delray Beach has retained Stantec to perform a Fire Protection Assessment Study
  - Our firm (previously known as Burton & Associates) has served municipal clients in Florida for over 30 years
  - We provide a variety of Financial Consulting Services including but not limited to:
    - General Fund Financial Sustainability Analysis
    - Non-Ad Valorem Assessment Fee design and management
    - Utility rate design and revenue sufficiency studies
    - Impact Fee Studies
    - Bond/Debt Issuance Support
  - Successfully implemented, updated or consulted on over two dozen
     Fire Assessments throughout the State

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Project Team

**Mike Burton** 

**Principal** 

Years of Experience: 30+



**Erick van Malssen** 

**Managing Consultant** 

Years of Experience: 14





Consultant

Years of Experience: 4

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- What is a Fire Assessment?
  - Fire Assessments are Non-Ad Valorem Fees used to directly fund Municipal Fire Protection Services
  - By State law, very few municipal services may have a Non-Ad Valorem direct funding mechanism. Examples include:
    - Fire Protection
    - Solid Waste
    - Stormwater
    - Utility Capital Projects
  - Any revenues raised through a Non-Ad Valorem Assessment must be used for the service and not distributed as a general revenue source

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- What is a Fire Assessment?
  - Non-Ad Valorem Assessments are billed through annual property tax bills to all property owners that benefit from the service
    - Requires cooperation between the City, Property Appraiser and Tax Collector
  - The City currently funds Fire Protection Services through Ad Valorem taxes and other General Fund Revenues
  - A Fire Special Assessment could provide direct cash flows for the full cost of service, or costs and/or projects that are currently unfunded
  - Alternatively, direct funding of Fire Protection Services through a Non-Ad Valorem Assessment could relieve the General Fund, allowing available revenues to fund other services or projects

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Fire Assessment Background

#### • What is a Fire Assessment?

- Non-Ad Valorem Assessments are billed through annual property tax bills to all property owners that benefit from the service
  - Requires cooperation between the City, Property Appraiser and Tax Collector
- The City currently funds Fire Protection Services through Ad Valorem taxes and other General Fund Revenues
- An Assessment could provide direct cash flows for the full cost of fire protection services within the City, or specifically fund a certain component of the service such as:
  - Personnel and/or Operating Costs
  - Capital Projects
  - Vehicle Replacement Costs
  - Debt Service for Fire Related Costs
  - Unfunded costs or projects

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- Legal Requirements for all Non-Ad Valorem Assessments
  - The Fee calculation must follow the "two pronged test"
    - 1. The property assessed must derive a special benefit from the service provided
      - i.e. property such as rights-of-way, submerged lands, etc. would be excluded from a Fire Assessment
    - 2. The Assessment must be fairly and reasonably apportioned among the properties that receive the special benefit
      - Addressed by the fee calculation methodology

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- Legal Requirements for all Non-Ad Valorem Assessments
  - Assessed properties must be within the City Limits or Service Area
  - Costs for EMS, ALS & Personal Transport must be removed from the calculation
    - Non Ad Valorem Assessments must derive from a benefit to property, not people
    - Per case law, EMS services benefit people, not property
  - Required Exemptions:
    - Governmental & Vacant Agricultural Properties
  - Optional Local Exemptions:
    - Churches, Non-Profits & Charitable Organizations

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- How Does it Work?
  - If the City wishes to consider adoption, the following would need to be decided upon:
    - Methodology
    - Amount of costs to be funded/revenue raised
      - Limited to the full cost of Fire Protection service, with EMS costs excluded
    - Maximum projected rates for future cost increases
  - The bills would be applied to the annual tax bills to all affected property owners
    - Renters and Tenants would not receive a bill, only the owner of the property
  - First possible year for consideration: FY 2019-20 (FY 2020)

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- The Assessment Adoption Process
  - Resolution of Intent
    - First step to set the process in motion (Under consideration tonight)
    - Non Binding Resolution that provides the Property Appraiser and Tax Collector notice that the City is considering using the uniform method/tax bills to potentially assess properties
      - Does not commit the City to adopt the assessment
    - Passage of the Resolution only sets the process in motion, the City still must consider and pass the actual assessment separately

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- The Assessment Adoption Process
  - If the City ultimately chooses to proceed with the adoption process
    - Two Public Hearings Required for Adoption:
      - Initial Resolution Adoption
        - Sets the Maximum Potential Rates to be advertised
        - Sets the Date, Place and Time of Final Hearing
      - Final Resolution Adoption Formally adopts the Assessment
        - 20-days prior to Final Resolution Hearing
          - First Class mailed notices to all affected property owners
          - States date, time and place of Final hearing
          - Displays Proposed Maximum Assessment for specific property
  - September 15, 2019 deadline for adoption to submit final assessment roll to tax collector for FY 2020 tax bills

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Methodology Discussion

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Calls for Service Methodology

- Most common and widely used Fire Protection Assessment Methodology in Florida
- Generally Upheld by the Florida Court System
- Allocates costs of Fire Protection Service to property classes based upon the historical demand for services, by property class
  - Informed by actual City call/incident data provided by the Fire Department
- Assessment rates are calculated by Property Class:
  - Residential properties assessed per Dwelling Unit
  - Non-Residential properties assessed by the square footage of developed structures
    - Commercial
    - Industrial/Warehouse
    - Governmental/Institutional
  - Vacant properties may be assessed per parcel

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

## Calls for Service Methodology

- Call Incident Data Analysis:
  - 3-Years of Data from Jan 1, 2015 Dec 30, 2017
  - National Fire Incident Reporting System (NFIRS) Data compiled by the City's Fire Department
  - The analysis includes only Fire or First Responder calls to real property
    - EMS, ALS and Transport calls are excluded
    - Calls to non-real property (i.e. vehicle accidents, beaches) are excluded
  - Call/Incident Allocation Results
    - Residential 63.7%
    - Commercial 25.2%
    - Industrial/Warehouse 1.0%
    - Government/Institutional 8.5%
    - Vacant Properties 1.5%

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- Calculations presented herein are preliminary in nature
  - Subject to minor refinements
    - Currently based upon FY 2019 Adopted Budget, would be replaced by preliminary FY 2020 when available
    - Based upon current property data, would be updated before final calculations and adoption procedures
- Per Discussions with City Management, we have identified potential unfunded costs to be included in the assessment program
- Results in a first-year revenue target of approximately \$4,000,000

Unfunded Budget Initiatives	FY 2020	FY 2021	FY 2022	FY 2023	FY 2024
New Firefighters	\$401,044	\$429,117	\$459,155	\$491,296	\$525,687
Increase in Existing Pension Costs	\$340,464	\$364,296	\$389,797	\$417,083	\$446,279
Additional Pension Burden	\$502,051	\$537,195	\$574,799	\$615,034	\$658,087
Vehicle Replacement Program	\$750,000	\$772,500	\$795,675	\$819,545	\$844,132
Station Rehab/Replacement	\$2,000,000	\$2,060,000	\$2,121,800	\$2,185,454	\$2,251,018
Net Collected Revenue Target	\$3,993,559	\$4,163,108	\$4,341,226	\$4,528,413	\$4,725,202
Annual Expense % Growth:		4.2%	4.3%	4.3%	4.3%

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

	Calls for Service	Allocated		
Assessment Class	Allocation %		Costs	
Residential	63.72%	\$	2,992,758	
Commercial	25.18%	\$	1,182,523	
Industrial / Warehouse	1.03%	\$	48,345	
Government / Institutional	8.54%	\$	401,337	
Vacant	1.54%	\$	72,133	
<b>Total Fire Protection Net Revenue Re</b>	\$	4,697,095		
Less: Exemptions		\$	(300,697)	
<b>Total Billed Fire Assessment</b>		\$	4,396,398	
Less: Property Appraiser's Expense	2.00%	\$	(88,000)	
Less: Tax Collector's Expense	2.00%	\$	(88,000)	
Less: Statutory Discount	4.00%	\$	(176,000)	
Less: Contingency	1.00%	\$\$	(44,000)	
Estimated Net Collected Revenue (ro	ounded)	\$	4,000,000	

### Assessment Calculation

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

		Allocated	Allocated		Y 2020 Protection	
<b>Assessment Class</b>		Costs	Units	Ass	essment	Unit Type
Residential Commercial Industrial / Warehouse Government / Institutional Vacant	\$ \$ \$ \$	2,992,758 1,182,523 48,345 401,337 72,133	37,004 100,444 39,828 44,000 1,206	\$ \$ \$ \$ \$	11.77	per 100 Sq Ft per 100 Sq Ft

# Property Impact Examples

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

			A	Assessment	FY 2020		
Parcel Type	Type	Units	Rate per Unit			Assessment	
Single Family Home	<b>Dwelling Unit</b>	1	\$	80.88	\$	80.88	
Condominium Unit	<b>Dwelling Unit</b>	1	\$	80.88	\$	80.88	
Mobile Home	<b>Dwelling Unit</b>	1	\$	80.88	\$	80.88	
Small Apartment Complex (12 Units)	<b>Dwelling Unit</b>	g Unit 12 \$		80.88	\$	970.56	
Large Apartment Complex (117 Units)	<b>Dwelling Unit</b>	117	\$	80.88	\$	9,462.96	
Office/1-Story Single Tenant	per 100 Sq Ft	34	\$	11.77	\$	400.18	
Restaurant	per 100 Sq Ft	43	\$	11.77	\$	506.11	
Retail/Office	per 100 Sq Ft	59	\$	11.77	\$	694.43	
Shopping Center	per 100 Sq Ft	1,039	\$	11.77	\$	12,229.03	
Light Manufacturing	per 100 Sq Ft	228	\$	1.21	\$	275.88	
Warehouse	per 100 Sq Ft	236	\$	1.21	\$	285.56	
Service Club	per 100 Sq Ft	112	\$	9.12	\$	1,021.44	
Assisted Living Facility	per 100 Sq Ft	637	\$	9.12	\$	5,809.44	
Church	per 100 Sq Ft	82	\$	9.12	\$	747.84	
Vacant	per Parcel	1	\$	59.81	\$	59.81	
Estimated Net Collected Revenue (rounded)			\$	4,000,000			

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

- Per Discussions with City Management, we have identified potential unfunded costs to be included in the assessment program
- Results in a first-year revenue target of approximately \$4,000,000

Unfunded Budget Initiatives	FY 2020		FY 2021	FY 2022		I	FY 2023		Y 2024	
New Firefighters	\$401,044	S	\$429,117	\$	3459,155	\$	491,296	\$5	525,687	
Increase in Existing Pension Costs	\$340,464	9	\$364,296	\$389,797		\$417,083		\$446,279		
Additional Pension Burden	\$502,051	9	\$537,195	\$574,799		\$615,034		\$658,087		
Vehicle Replacement Program	\$750,000	9	\$772,500 \$795,675		\$819,545		\$844,132			
Station Rehab/Replacement	\$2,000,000	\$2	2,060,000	\$2	\$2,121,800		\$2,185,454		\$2,251,018	
Net Collected Revenue Target	\$3,993,559	\$4	\$4,163,108		\$4,341,226		\$4,528,413		\$4,725,202	
Annual Expense % Growth:			4.2% 4.3		4.3%	4.3%		4.3%		
Recommended Not-to-Exceed Growth:			5.0%	5.0%		5.0%		5.0%		
Assessment Rates Escalated by 5	% Annually									
Residential	\$ 80.8	88 \$	84.92	\$	89.17	\$	93.63	\$	98.31	
Commercial	\$ 11.7	7 \$	12.36	\$	12.98	\$	13.63	\$	14.31	
Industrial / Warehouse	\$ 1.2	21 \$	1.27	\$	1.33	\$	1.40	\$	1.47	
Government / Institutional	\$ 9.1	2 \$	9.58	\$	10.05	\$	10.56	\$	11.09	
Vacant	\$ 59.8	81 \$	62.80	\$	65.94	\$	69.24	\$	72.70	

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

### Assessment Calculation

Full and Partial Cost Recovery rate calculations:

	Cost Recovery %							
Fire Assessment Calculation		100%		<b>75%</b>		50%		25%
Allocated Costs	\$	29,030,256	\$	21,772,692	\$	14,515,128	\$	7,257,564
Less: Exemptions	\$	(1,856,533)	\$	(1,392,400)	\$	(928,266)	\$	(464,133)
Net Billed Revenues:	\$	27,173,723	\$	20,380,293	\$	13,586,862	\$	6,793,431
Less: Assessment Costs	\$	(2,445,000)	\$	(1,834,000)	\$	(1,223,000)	\$	(611,000)
Net Estimated Collected Revenues:	\$	24,729,000	\$	18,546,000	\$	12,364,000	\$	6,182,000
Residential Rate per Dwelling Unit	\$	499.86	\$	374.89	\$	249.93	\$	124.96
Commercial Rate per 100 Sq Ft	\$	72.76	\$	54.57	\$	36.38	\$	18.19
Industrial / Warehouse Rate per 100 Sq Ft	\$	7.50	\$	5.63	\$	3.75	\$	1.88
Government / Institutional Rate per 100 Sq Ft	\$	56.37	\$	42.28	\$	28.19	\$	14.09
Vacant Rate per Parcel	\$	369.67	\$	277.25	\$	184.83	\$	92.42

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Next Steps

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

### Next Steps

- Consider Resolution of Intent to proceed with Phase 2 of the Study
  - Adoption of Resolution of Intent would allow for the potential adoption of the assessment program
    - Phase 2 would refine and finalize the analysis per direction of the Commission
    - Allow for further workshops to discuss and refine the potential assessment program and allow for public outreach
  - Adoption Process:
    - Initial Resolution Adoption
      - Sets the Maximum Potential Rates to be advertised
      - Sets the Date, Place and Time of Final Hearing
    - Final Resolution Adoption Formally adopts the Assessment
      - 20-days prior to Final Resolution Hearing
        - First Class mailed notices to all affected property owners
  - September 15, 2019 deadline for adoption to submit final assessment roll to tax collector for FY 2020 tax bills

Fire Protection Assessment Study Preliminary Results

# Open Discussion and Live Modeling