



Development Services Department

BOARD ACTION REPORT – APPEALABLE ITEM

Project Name: 101 NE 5th Street
Project Location: 101 NE 5th Street
Request: Certificate of Appropriateness (COA)
Board: Historic Preservation Board
Meeting Date: December 5, 2018

Board Action:

Approved the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-030) for construction of a new two-car garage on the west side of the property located at **101 NE 5th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, on a 5 to 0 vote (Paula Newman-Rocker and Reeve Bright absent).

Project Description:

The subject property is irregularly shaped and fronts on both Fern Court and NE 5th Street. The 0.42 acre lot contains a 1,500 sq. ft. one-story, single-family residence constructed circa, and a detached single-car garage. The Mission style structure is classified as contributing to the Del-Ida Park Historic District, but there are no records as to when the garage was constructed; thus, it is not considered a contributing structure. Building records indicate that a Florida Room was added to the west elevation in 1965.

At its meeting of July 3, 2013, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) approved a COA (2013-187) for two minor additions to the residence, demolition of an existing single-car garage, construction of a detached garage and guest cottage. The COA was significantly revised and reduced in scope by the property owner. Those revisions were administratively approved and consisted of a rear kitchen addition/expansion, and addition of a home office and master suite walk-in closet. The total added square footage measures approximately 350 square feet. All new, impact-rated windows were installed throughout the structure, and the flat roof was refinished. The two additions were completed vesting the project, but the detached garage and guest cottage were not constructed. In 2014, an Ad Valorem Tax Exemption was approved for the subject property.

The subject request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the approved two-car, detached garage. Originally, the garage was to have a half-flat and half-pitched roof. The proposal includes a simpler, Mission style, detached two-car garage with a flat roof and corner parapets. The proposed garage is 27' deep by 26' wide, and 11' high (13' with the parapet).

Board Comments:

The Board comments were supportive.

Public Comments:

No members of the public spoke for or against the project.

Associated Actions:

All required actions were taken.

Next Action:

HPB action is final.

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

CITY OF DELRAY BEACH

STAFF REPORT

MEETING DATE: December 5, 2018

ITEM: 101 NE 5th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District – Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-030) for the construction of a new two-car garage.

RECOMMENDATION: Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness

GENERAL DATA:

Owner/Applicant..... Virginia Ritter and John Kolkmeier

Location:..... North side of NE 5th Street, between NE 2nd Avenue and N. Swinton Avenue

Property Size:..... 0.42 Acres

Historic District: Del-Ida Park Historic District

Zoning:..... R-1-AA (Single Family Residential)

Adjacent Zoning:.....

North:	R-1-AA
East:	R-1-AA
South:	R-1-AA
West:	R-1-AA

Existing Future Land Use Designation:..... LD (Low Density 0-5 DU/Acre)

Water Service:..... Public water service is provided on site.

Sewer Service:..... Public sewer service is provided on site.



ITEM BEFORE THE BOARD

The item before the Board is approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) (2019-030) for construction of a new two-car garage on the west side of the property located at **101 NE 5th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, pursuant to Land Development Regulation (LDR) Section 2.4.6(H).

BACKGROUND & PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The subject property is irregularly shaped and fronts on both Fern Court and NE 5th Street. The 0.42 acre lot contains a 1,500 sq. ft. one-story, single-family residence constructed circa, and a detached single-car garage. The Mission style structure is classified as contributing to the Del-Ida Park Historic District, but there are no records as to when the garage was constructed; thus, it is not considered a contributing structure. Building records indicate that a Florida Room was added to the west elevation in 1965.

At its meeting of July 3, 2013, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) approved a COA (2013-187) for two minor additions to the residence, demolition of an existing single-car garage, construction of a detached garage and guest cottage. The COA was significantly revised and reduced in scope by the property owner. Those revisions were administratively approved and consisted of a rear kitchen addition/expansion, and addition of a home office and master suite walk-in closet. The total added square footage measures approximately 350 square feet. All new, impact-rated windows were installed throughout the structure, and the flat roof was refinished. The two additions were completed vesting the project, but the detached garage and guest cottage were not constructed. In 2014, an Ad Valorem Tax Exemption was approved for the subject property.

The subject request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to modify the approved two-car, detached garage. Originally, the garage was to have a half-flat and half-pitched roof. The proposal includes a simpler, Mission style, detached two-car garage with a flat roof and corner parapets. The proposed garage is 27' deep by 26' wide, and 11' high (13' with the parapet).

ANALYSIS OF PROPOSAL

Pursuant to Land Development Regulation (LDR) Section 2.4.6(H)(5), prior to approval, a finding must be made that any Certificate of Appropriateness which is to be approved is consistent with Historic Preservation purposes pursuant to Objective A-4 of the Land Use Element of the Comprehensive Plan and specifically with provisions of Section 4.5.1, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

ZONING AND USE REVIEW

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.3.4(K), Development Standards, properties located within the R-1-AA (Single Family Residential) zoning district shall be developed according to the requirements noted in the chart below.

Development Standards		Required	Proposed
Setbacks (Minimum):	Front (South)	30'	30'
	Side Interior (West)	10'	10'
	Rear (North)	10'	10'

As illustrated, the proposal is in compliance with the applicable requirements; therefore, positive findings can be made.

LDR SECTION 4.5.1, HISTORIC PRESERVATION, DESIGNATED DISTRICTS, SITES, AND BUILDINGS

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E) - Development Standards: all new development or exterior improvements on individually designated historic properties and/or properties located within historic districts shall, comply with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Development Standards of this Section.

Standard 2

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 9

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10

New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The existing garage is not a contributing structure to the historic district and is not in harmony with the existing contributing single-family residence nor the neighboring residences. The pitched, shingle roof style on the garage is not present on the applicant's property nor on adjacent properties. As stated in the applicant's Justification Statement: *"There is no record as to when this garage was constructed and its location proximate to the neighbor's residence gives the impression that it is not a part of the applicant's property"*.

The proposed garage elevations are designed to resemble Mission style of the existing contributing single-family residence which will be compatible with the existing structure and the surrounding area. The two-car garage will have individual arched openings with brown simulated wood grain, aluminum door in a barn-style. The garage will be detached from the residential structure so if removed in the future will not compromise the integrity of the historic building. The proposal meets the applicable standards noted above and their intent as the proposal ensures an appropriate exterior alteration of the historic property, protecting the historic integrity of the single-family residence and its environment.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) - **Visual Compatibility Standards**: new construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section with regard to height, width, mass, scale, façade, openings, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1. Visual compatibility for minor and major development as referenced in Section 4.5.1(E)(2) shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m). Visual compatibility for all development on individually designated properties outside the district shall be determined by comparison to other structures within the site.

Applicable Visual Compatibility Standards

- (a) **Height**: The height of proposed buildings or modifications shall be visually compatible in comparison or relation to the height of existing structures and buildings in a historic district for all major and minor development. For major development, visual compatibility with respect to the height of residential structures, as defined by 4.5.1(E)(2)(a), shall also be determined through application of the Building Height Plane.
- (b) **Front Facade Proportion**: The front facade of each building or structure shall be visually compatible with and be in direct relationship to the width of the building and to the height of the front elevation of other existing structures and buildings within the subject historic district.

- (g) Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color:** The relationship of materials, texture, and color of the facade of a building and/or hardscaping shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district.

The proposed garage elevations are designed with a flat-roof and in the Mission architectural style. The garage will be compatible with the existing contributing single-family residence and the surrounding area. The two-car garage will have individual arched openings with brown simulated wood grain, aluminum doors in a barn-style. A single goose neck styled light fixture will be situated over each garage door. The proposal incorporates three 4/1 style windows, similar to the existing structure. The height of the garage does not exceed the highest element of the existing residence. The proposed elevation changes to the approved detached garage are compatible with the existing proportion of the front façade and are appropriate and compatible with the Del-Ida Park Historic District. The proposal meets the intent of the review criteria above; thus, positive findings are made with respect to the sections indicated above.

ALTERNATIVE ACTIONS

- A. Continue with direction.
- B. Approve Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-030) for the property located at **101 NE 5th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District** by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in Land Development Regulation Section 2.4.6(H).
- C. Deny Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-030) for the property located at **101 NE 5th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and by finding that the request and approval thereof is inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan and does not meet the criteria set forth in Land Development Regulation Section 2.4.6(H).

RECOMMENDATIONS

Approve Certificate of Appropriateness 2019-030 for **101 NE 5th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H).

Attachments:

- Survey, Site plan, Elevations, and Pictures.

Report prepared by: Michelle Hoyland, Principal Planner