

# HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD

## CITY OF DELRAY BEACH

## STAFF REPORT

**MEETING DATE:** February 6, 2019

**ITEM:** 516 North Swinton Avenue, The Harden-Hart House (2018-193) – Consideration to Individually List the property at 516 North Swinton Avenue as The Harden-Hart House to the Local Register of Historic Places.

**RECOMMENDATION:** Recommend approval to the City Commission

### GENERAL DATA:

Owner/Applicant..... David and Andrea Harden

Location:..... West side of North Swinton Avenue, between NE 4<sup>th</sup> Street and NE 6<sup>th</sup> Street

Property Size:..... 0.27 Acres

Zoning:..... R-1-AA (Single-Family Residential)

Overlay District: Lake Ida Neighborhood Overlay District

Adjacent Zoning:.....

North:	R-1-AA (Single-Family Residential)
East:	R-1-AA (Single-Family Residential)
South:	R-1-AA (Single-Family Residential)
West:	R-1-AA (Single-Family Residential)

Existing Future Land Use Designation:..... LD (Low Density Residential)



## ITEM BEFORE THE BOARD

The action requested of the Board is that of making a recommendation to the City Commission on a request for individual designation of **“The Harden-Hart House”** located at **516 North Swinton Avenue**, pursuant to Land Development Regulations (LDR) Section 4.5.1(C), Designation Procedures.

## BACKGROUND

The subject property is located at 516 North Swinton Avenue, on the west side of North Swinton Avenue between Lake Ida Road and NW 6<sup>th</sup> Street within the Lake Ida Neighborhood. The property contains a circa 1925 single-family residence designed in the Mediterranean Revival style. The complete designation report is attached.

Subsequent to this Public Hearing before the HPB, the designation will move forward for review by the City Commission. The designation is now before the Board for consideration.

## ANALYSIS

**Pursuant to Section 4.5.1(B)(1), Criteria for Designation of Historic Sites or Districts, to qualify as a historic structure, individual properties, structures, sites, or buildings, must have significant character, interest, or value as part of the historical, cultural, aesthetic, and architectural heritage of the city, state, or nation. To qualify as a historic site, historic district, or historic structure, the property or properties must fulfill one or more of the criteria set forth in division (2) or (3) below.**

**Section 4.5.1(B)(2) A building structure, site, interior, or district will be deemed to have historical or cultural significance if it meets one or more of the following criteria:**

- (a) Is associated in a significant way with the life or activities of a major person important in city, state, or national history (for example, the homestead of a local founding family);**
- (b) Is the site of a historic event with significant effect upon the city, state, or nation;**
- (c) Is associated in a significant way with a major historic event, whether cultural, economic, social, military, or political;**
- (d) Exemplifies the historical, political, cultural, economic, or social trends of the community in history; or,**
- (e) Is associated in a significant way with a past or continuing institution which has contributed substantially to the life of the city.**

The residence located at 516 North Swinton Avenue meets criteria (a) and (d) above. The structure located at 516 North Swinton Avenue is associated with former City of Delray Beach City Manager David Harden and his wife Andrea, as it has been their residence since 1994. Previously, John M. and Eliza Hart owned the home when it was located in West Palm Beach from 1925-1994. The structure exemplifies the Mediterranean Revival architectural style popular during the 1930's.

### **Persons Important to Local History – David and Andrea Harden**

David Theodore Harden grew up in Okeechobee, Florida, a cattle town where his father was a mechanic. He attended Emory University and received a Bachelor's degree in chemistry in 1964. He then attended Florida State University (FSU) in 1964 for graduate studies in chemistry. He soon learned about city management and decided chemistry was not where his heart was, so he left FSU after 2 months. He would go on to earn a Master's Degree in Public Administration from Georgia Institute of Technology in 1967. David served as a supply officer for the US Navy from 1967 to 1971 and went into the drilling reserves until 1989, he then went into the retired reserves as a Captain.

David married Andrea Koleda in 1972, the two met at church while David was stationed at Cecil Field Naval Base near Jacksonville, Florida. After they married the two moved to Apopka where they had

three children, Jeremy (oldest), Chad, and Aaron (youngest). In the mid-1970's David was ordained a Deacon by the First Baptist Church of Apopka, he currently serves as an Elder at SonCoast Community Church in Boca Raton. Andrea is also active in the church she enjoys teaching children. David has been involved with the Boy Scouts of America, serving as a District Chairman in Palm Beach County for 8 years and as the Vice-president for Administration for the Gulf Stream Council.

David and Andrea moved to Delray Beach in 1990 after David accepted the position of City Manager with the City. The position of City Manager had been vacant for ten months prior to David's start; before that, the city had 10 different city managers in 9 years' time. In the early nineties Delray Beach was in the planning stages of a downtown revitalization and was working towards an economic renewal. There was much work to do. As City Manager, David was hired to operate the city as a business with a goal to address policy matters that reflected the majority view of the city commission. In his first year, David worked to defuse politics at City Hall, he balanced the budget (even created a surplus) and improved race relations. During his tenure, Delray Beach became the only city in Florida to be twice awarded (1993 & 2001) the "All-America City" award from the National Civic League. The award recognizes communities that leverage civic engagement, collaboration, inclusiveness and innovation to successfully address local issues. In 1995, Florida Trend magazine bestowed the honor of "Best-Run Town in Florida" on Delray Beach; the city was noted to have "climb[ed] from a poorly run, politically driven town to the best run in the state" (sun-sentinel newspaper). David has been awarded numerous awards including a 2011 Florida Municipal Achievement Award from the Florida League of Cities, the 2012 Member City of the Year from the Palm Beach County League, and two national recognitions from the Alliance for Innovation for innovative projects in providing services. He was honored in November of 2012 by the Delray Beach Preservation Trust for his advocacy of protections for the city's five historic districts. David would go on to serve seven mayors of the City of Delray Beach as its city manager for 22 years.

Prior to working with Delray Beach, David served as the City Manager for the Winter Park, Florida for 12 years. He initiated legislation in Winter Park that established Central Florida as a pioneer in producing reclaimed water for irrigation use and he began a program to reverse the deteriorating water quality in the city's lakes. While living in Apopka David and Andrea restored an 1886 Victorian style house that they listed to the National Register of Historic Places in 1989. Before his time serving Winter Park as city manager, David was a city planner for Winter Park. He also worked as a planner at Orange County, Florida, just before Walt Disney World opened in the county.

David has served as a public servant for more than 40 years and is one of the longest tenured city managers in Florida. He continues to work as a consultant and serving as an interim city manager for Florida communities such as Palm Springs and Marco Island.

#### **Persons Important to Local History – John M. and Eliza Hart**

John M. Hart was born in December 1855. He had a career as a professional civil engineer in Cleveland, Ohio, working for the New York Central Railroad. He married Eliza J. Blystone on December 22, 1883 in Painesville (Lake County), Ohio. Eliza was born in February 1844. John and Eliza, decided to move to West Palm Beach in 1919 after having spent six seasons there previously. They lived in homes on Poinsettia Place and Jefferson Place before building the Mediterranean Revival style, 2-story home at 326 Pioneer Place. They were subsequently visited several times by D.C. Moon, General Manager and later Vice-president of the New York Central.

Mr. Hart continued to live at the Pioneer Place home with his second wife Grace until his passing at age 95 in April of 1951.

### **Relocation of Structure**

The Mediterranean Revival style, 2-story structure was originally constructed circa 1925 at 326 Pioneer Place within the City of West Palm Beach. The home was relocated to its current location by David and Andrea Harden in 1994 to a Delray Beach vacant lot the Harden's purchased on the west side of North Swinton Avenue (five lots north of Trinity Lutheran Church) from retired pastor, Rev. Robert Klemm.

In the early nineties, the Norton Gallery of Art acquired properties along Pioneer Place as part of its plan for expansion. The subject structure, along with several others along Pioneer Place were slated for demolition or relocation.

The Harden's had originally planned to build a new home on their N. Swinton Avenue vacant lot but when their plans did not work out, it was suggested by Mr. Chris Brown, then Director of the Delray Beach Community Redevelopment Agency (CRA), to move a West Palm Beach home to the vacant lot. The CRA was planning to move two other structures from the Hillcrest neighborhood in West Palm Beach to Delray Beach, logistically the timing was ideal to move another. Then, John Johnson, Preservationist with the Palm Beach County Historic Preservation Board and the State of Florida informed the Hardens of the availability of two historic houses in good condition located on Pioneer Place. The homes were to be relocated rather than demolished. The Harden's looked at both houses and decided to take the one at 326 Pioneer Place.

On Monday, January 24 1994, Modern Moving detached the house from its foundation at 326 Pioneer Place, moved it to the Intracoastal Waterway, loaded it onto a barge and floated it down the Intracoastal to Knowles Park in Delray Beach. The following Monday, January 31, 1994, with the Harden-Hart leading the way, hundreds of people gathered to watch the three historic homes (including the 2 CRA acquired homes) move from Knowles park west on SE 10<sup>th</sup> Street to Swinton Avenue, then slowly north on Swinton in a "Parade of Homes". The Hardens moved into their newly relocated home at 516 N. Swinton Avenue in April of 1994.

#### **Section 4.5.1(B)(3) Architectural or aesthetic significance:**

- (a) Portrays the environment in an era of history characterized by one or more distinctive architectural styles;**
- (b) Embodies those distinguishing characteristics of an architectural style, period, or method of construction;**
- (d) Contains elements of design, detail, material, or craftsmanship of outstanding quality or which represented, in its time, a significant innovation or adaptation to the South Florida environment.**

The Harden-Hart house is an excellent example of the Mediterranean Revival architectural style. The City of West Palm Beach noted in a letter dated November 17, 1993 that neither the builder nor the architect of the structure was known. The two-story structure has a modified rectangular floor plan with an intersecting gable roof and a front entry porch off a porte-cochère. Typical of Mediterranean Revival style of architecture, the second story is shorter than the ground level, which allows for 9' tall first floor ceiling heights. The structure is constructed of wood with a textured stucco exterior and a terra-cotta, barrel tile roof with gables and exposed wood rafter tails. Decorative features unique to the structure include four Solomonic or Barley-sugar columns that support the porte-cochère and the outside front corner of the entry porch. Each spiral type column has a bas-relief head centered at the top of each column and each head is different from the others. The columns are original to the structure. The structure features two pairs of single-hung, wood first floor windows on the front façade, which are inset in faux, rusticated, keystone arches that rise up from the ground and surround the windows. Simpler double-hung, four over-one wood windows are featured on the balance of the elevations. The windows feature vertical pane, four-lites in the upper sash and are inset with stone sills. Other window styles include three slip head, single sash windows and four casement windows.

## **COMPREHENSIVE PLAN**

**Future Land Use Objective A-4:** The redevelopment of land and buildings shall provide for the preservation of historic resources. The objective shall be met through continued adherence to the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance and, where applicable, to architectural design guidelines through the following policies:

**Policy A-4.1:** Prior to approval or recommending approval of any land use or development application for property located within a historic district or designated as a historic site, the Historic Preservation Board must make a finding that the requested action is consistent with the provisions of Section 4.5.1 of the Land Development Regulations relating to historic sites and districts and the "Delray Beach Design Guidelines".

**Policy A-4.2:** In order to protect the City's historic resources, the Land Development Regulations shall include provisions for designation of historically significant buildings, structures, archaeological sites, or districts. The City shall conduct periodic neighborhood surveys to identify and evaluate potential historic resources at least once every five years.

The proposed designation meets the intent of the applicable Objective and Policies noted above, as it will provide for the preservation of the subject structure, thereby ensuring the protection of an example of this type of style and building. Further, the comments above illustrate that the request meets the criteria set forth in LDR Section 4.5.1 which provides for the designation of "historically significant buildings"; therefore, the proposed designation is appropriate and a recommendation of approval should be forwarded to the City Commission. The Public Hearing dates for review of the subject designation by the City Commission have been tentatively scheduled for March 2019.

### **COURTESY / PUBLIC NOTICES**

Public Notice letters were mailed to the property owners within a 500' radius of 516 North Swinton Avenue.

Courtesy Notices of the Public Hearing were sent to Lake Ida Homeowner's Association.

Letters of support or objection, if any, will be presented at the HPB meeting.

### **ALTERNATIVE ACTIONS**

- A. Continue with direction.
- B. Move a recommendation of approval to the City Commission that "**The Harden-Hart House**", located at **516 North Swinton Avenue** be listed in the Local Register of Historic Places by amending Land Development Regulations (LDR) Section 4.5.1(I), by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan, and LDR Sections 4.5.1(B) and 4.5.1(C).
- C. Move a recommendation of denial to the City Commission that "**The Harden-Hart House**", located at **516 North Swinton Avenue** be listed in the Local Register of Historic Places by amending Land Development Regulations (LDR) Section 4.5.1(I), by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request is not consistent with the Comprehensive Plan, and LDR Sections 4.5.1(B) and 4.5.1(C).

<b>RECOMMENDATION</b>
-----------------------

Recommend approval to the City Commission that **"The Harden-Hart House"**, located at **516 North Swinton Avenue** be listed in the Local Register of Historic Places by amending Land Development Regulations (LDR) Section 4.5.1(I), by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan, and LDR Sections 4.5.1(B) and 4.5.1(C).

**Staff Report Prepared by:** Michelle Hoyland, Principal Planner