



DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

BUILDING | HISTORIC PRESERVATION | PLANNING & ZONING

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD STAFF REPORT

Certificate of Appropriateness - Signs

Elisabetta

Meeting	File No.	Application Type
April 3, 2019	2019-135	(COA - Signs)

Request

The action before the Board is approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness (COA) – Signs to allow the installation of a flat wall sign on the north elevation located at 32 E. Atlantic Avenue (Elisabetta's) within the Old School Square Historic District, pursuant to Land Development Regulations (LDR) Section 2.4.6(H).

Recommendation

Approve the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-135) with the recommendation that the sign be internally illuminated channel letters with teal and red overlay.

Background Information

The subject property is located within the OSSHAD (Old School Square Historic Arts District) zoning district; Central Business District (CBD) zoning overlay; the Old School Square Historic District; and, consists of the West 23.33' of Lot 2, Less the South 14'; and East 21.67' of Lot 3, Less the South 14', Block 69, Town of Delray.

Built in 1948, the Masonry Vernacular style structure was designed in the simple Streamline Modern style with a recessed entrance, which was a popular feature of the style as it provided shelter for pedestrians. The structure is classified as noncontributing to the Old School Square Historic District. The 2009 Old School Square Historic District Resurvey recommended that the subject property be reclassified as contributing, as the Period of Significance was being expanded to include those eligible resources constructed between 1944 and 1965; however, the owner requested that the subject property not be reclassified. Upon adoption of Ordinance 10-10 on June 1, 2010, the Period of Significance for the Old School Square Historic District was expanded to 1965, and 10 of the properties that were recommended for reclassification were not reclassified to contributing, including the subject property, because the property owners elected to "opt-out" of this process.

In 1996, the building underwent a façade renovation associated with the conversion of the existing retail use (Polly Noe Antiques) to restaurant use (Avenue Bar and Grille/32 East Restaurant). Then, on June 19th, 1996 the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) approved a development proposal for a 2,065 square foot addition (1,783 square foot ground floor area and 282 square foot 2nd floor area) to the existing 5,504 square foot two-story structure. The 7,569 total square foot approved floor plan accommodated a dining area, bar, waiting room, kitchen and mechanical room on the 1st floor and a dining area, restrooms, office, mechanical and storage rooms on the 2nd floor.

In 2018, a Class III Site Plan Modification and COA was approved for alterations to front façade (North) with new exterior materials including: awning, wood planter boxes, windows, doors, railing, and light fixtures; exterior color changes; reconfiguration of existing water heaters, water tanks, can wash, dumpster enclosure and grease recovery system; and installation of a new 160 square foot walk-in cooler in the rear (South) of the property.

The request before the board is for a sign on the north elevation for the new restaurant Elisabetta. The proposed sign is 1'1" x 27'9" for a total of 29.97 SF. The sign is open face channel letters with teal and red neon tubing. The applicant has submitted an option to the

proposed sign, which is an identical sign that is internally illuminated channel letters with teal and red vinyl overlay rather than the neon tubing.

Review and Analysis

Pursuant to LDR Section 2.4.6(H)(5), prior to approval, a finding must be made that any Certificate of Appropriateness which is to be approved is consistent with Historic Preservation purposes pursuant to Objective A-4 of the Land Use Element of the Comprehensive Plan and specifically with provisions of Section 4.5.1, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Future Land Use Element Objective A-4: The redevelopment of land and buildings shall provide for the preservation of historic resources. The objective shall be met through continued adherence to the City's Historic Preservation Ordinance and the following policies:

Policy A-4.1: Prior to approval or recommending approval of any land use or development application for property located within a historic district or designated as a historic site, the Historic Preservation Board must make a finding that the requested action is consistent with the provisions of Section 4.5.1 of the Land Development Regulations relating to historic sites and districts and the "Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines."

In addition to the above, the request also requires compliance with the regulations pertaining to signage. These regulations have been included within the discussion and analysis below.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.6.7 (E)(7) Design Standard Matrix, the matrix sets forth the standards for various types of signs when located in various zoning districts or defined by use. The standards set forth therein are subject to descriptions, interpretations, exceptions, and limitations as provided for elsewhere in these LDRs.

The subject property is located within the OSSHAD zoning district; the CBD zoning overlay; and, the Old School Square Historic District, which allows no more than two signs per lot or parcel or development. The size of a maximum wall sign is 30 square feet. The proposed 29.97 sq. ft. sign meets the intent of the sign code with respect to size.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.4.24(F)(7) Development Standards, all properties within the Old School Square Historic District are subject to the provisions of Section 4.5.1.

LDR SECTION 4.5.1, HISTORIC PRESERVATION, DESIGNATED DISTRICTS, SITES, AND BUILDINGS

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E), Development Standards, all new development or exterior improvements on individually designated historic properties and/or properties located within historic districts shall, comply with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Development Standards of this Section.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(3), Buildings, structures, appurtenances and parking shall only be moved, reconstructed, altered, or maintained in accordance with this chapter, in a manner that will preserve the historical and architectural character of the building, structure, site, or district:

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(3)(a)1, Appurtenances include, but are not limited to, stone walls, fences, light fixtures, steps, paving, sidewalks, signs and accessory structures.

Based upon this code section, signs are considered an appurtenance, which shall preserve the historical and architectural character of the building and district. As the subject property is located within the OSSHD, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation are applicable as well as the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines.

(4) Alterations. In considering proposals for alterations to the exterior of historic buildings and structures and in applying development and preservation standards, the documented, original design of the building may be considered, among other factors.

(5) Standards and guidelines. A historic site, building, structure, improvement, or appurtenance within a historic district shall only be altered, restored, preserved, repaired, relocated, demolished, or otherwise changed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, as amended from time to time.

There is importance in preserving “character-defining” and distinctive features, and discussing scale and compatibility within historic districts such as the following:

Standard 8

New construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible.

The applicant’s proposal of teal and red neon tubing channel letters does not meet the intent of this Standard. The second proposal of internally illuminated teal and red channel letters does meet the intent of the Standard. The new restaurant Elisabetta is located along the same block that recent signage for Tin Roof and TAPAS 35 was approved for by HPB. Originally built in 1948, in the Streamline Modern style, the use of neon tubing was common during the Art Deco period but is inappropriate for buildings of another historical period. A condition of approval is added to replace the neon tubing with channel letters to be more compatible and appropriate with the architecture of the structure.

Recent approvals for Tin Roof added a condition of approval to replace the exposed neon tubing with internally lit channel letters and TAPAS 35 complied with staff recommendation to change their proposed box to channel letters for the word Mediterranean Tapas Bar. These conditions and recommendations were made to be more consistent with the architectural style of the structures.

Pursuant to the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines recommendations for signage include:

- Use materials and sign types that are based on historical precedent. For example, the use of neon tubing was common during the Art Deco period, but is inappropriate for buildings of another historical period;
- Place signage so significant architectural detail is not obscured;
- In commercial districts, the valance of an awning is often a visible and unobtrusive location for signage;
- Use indirect lighting when illuminating the sign;
- Avoid cabinet or box signs unless there is historical precedent;
- Ground-mounted signs are appropriate in cases of residential conversions;
- The scale of the signage should relate to the scale and detail of the historic building, and not overwhelm or call attention to the sign;
- The choice of typeface is a recommended way of conveying the period in which the building was constructed. Historic photographs of the period may be consulted to identify some common typestyles;
- The material of the sign need not be identical but should be compatible with the construction materials of the building; and, for signs that are used in residential conversions, the application of the original materials and sometimes details are a recommended approach to sign design. For example, for a masonry building, a masonry monument sign may be an appropriate choice. If the building possesses a parapet detail, the signage may reflect that detail, tying the two together.

Pursuant to the Delray Beach Historic Guidelines the use of neon tubing is inappropriate for the structure and does not meet the requirement to use indirect lighting when illuminating a sign, thus, this requirement has not been met.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) - Visual Compatibility Standards: new construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section regarding height, width, mass, scale, façade, openings, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1. Visual compatibility for minor and major development as referenced in Section 4.5.1(E)(2) shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m). Visual compatibility for all development on individually designated properties outside the district shall be determined by comparison to other structures within the site.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7)(I) Architectural Style, all major and minor development shall consist of only one architectural style per structure or property and not introduce elements definitive of another style.

The proposed sign includes the use of neon tubing, which is a sign element utilized during the Art Deco time period and is not appropriate for the architectural style of the structure. Compliance with this standard can be made provided the neon tubing is replaced with internally illuminated channel letters.

Review by Others

The application was emailed to the Downtown Development Authority and the board is in support of the sign.

Assessment and Conclusion

Provided the conditions of approval are met, the proposed signage meets the intent of LDR Sections 4.6.7(E)(7) for the Old School Square Arts Historic District and 4.5.1(E) Historic Preservation.

Alternative Actions

- A. Move to continue with direction
- B. Move to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-135) for a sign located at 32 E. Atlantic Ave, **Elisabetta**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding the request and approval thereof meets the criteria set forth in Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5), subject to the conditions of approval.
- C. Move to deny the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-135) for a sign located at 32 E. Atlantic Ave, **Elisabetta**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding the request and approval thereof does not meet the criteria set forth in Land Development Regulations Section 2.4.6(H)(5).

Public and Courtesy Notices

_ Courtesy Notices are not applicable to this request

_ Courtesy Notices were provided to the following, at least 5 working days prior to the meeting:

- (DDA)

_ Public Notices are not required for this request.

_ _ Agenda was posted on (March 26, 2019), 5 working days prior to meeting.