



CRA Board Meeting Minutes  
Special Meeting  
Tuesday, March 28, 2019 – 10:00 a.m.  
City Commission Chambers – 100 NW 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue  
Delray Beach, FL 33444

**STAFF PRESENT:**

Jeff Costello	David Tolces	Teresa Hadjipetrou	Joan Goodrich
Caryn-Gardner Young	Renee Jadusingh	Lori Hayward	Elizabeth Burrows
Kristyn Cox	Carter Roush	Patrick McCullum	Ivan Cabrera

**OTHERS PRESENT:**

Mike Monaco	Steve Murray	Dave VanFoss	Valerie Courchesne
Krystal Logan	Jason Spiegel	Kris Kimball	Mavis Benson
Laura Simon			

**1. Call to Order**

Chair Petrolia called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

**2. Roll Call**

**Present:** Chair Shelly Petrolia, Vice Chair Shirley Johnson, Deputy Vice Chair Angie Gray, Treasurer Bill Bathurst, Commissioner Pamela Brinson, Commissioner Adam Frankel, and Commissioner Ryan Boylston.

**3. Approval of Agenda**

**Motion** by Deputy Vice Chair Gray, seconded by Commissioner Boylston, to approve the agenda as presented. In a roll call vote, the **motion** passed unanimously (5-0).

**4. Old Business**

**a. Award of RFP 2018-08 Fixed Route Transportation Services**

Ivan Cabrera, CRA Project Manager, stated the CRA received three (3) responses to the RFP. Those proposals came from Downtowner Holdings LLC, First Transit Inc., and Maruti Fleet and Management LLC.

He also stated that at the March 12 CRA Board Meeting staff recommended the Board accept the proposal from Downtowner Holdings LLC, and the Board gave direction to review the top two (2) responses.

Mr. Cabrera recapped the key elements in the RFP, including:

- The use of environmentally vehicle is required
- Mid-sized shuttle with capacity of up to 22 passengers
- Aesthetically acceptable for neighborhood shuttle
- Equipped to collect ridership data and with GPS units for vehicle location
- Advertising within and/or outside of vehicles may be permitted
- Weekly, monthly, quarterly, and yearly reports to CRA staff
- Service provided from at least 6 a.m. to 11:15 p.m. Monday through Friday and 8 a.m. to 11 p.m. on Saturday and Sunday.

Mr. Cabrera outlined the format the presentations would follow. Mr. Cabrera stated each proposer gets 10 minutes to make their presentation, followed by 20 minutes of discussion from the Board.

Chair Petrolia asked that the Board consider deciding on both the fixed route and point-to-point issue after both had been heard as there may be tie-ins.

The Board agreed by consensus.

### **Downtowner Holdings, LLC**

Mike Monaco, Chief Technology Officer and Steve Murray, Chief Executive Officer of Downtowner Holdings, LLC, presented on behalf of their company. Both are Delray Beach residents.

Mr. Murray stated Downtowner partners with public and private clients to re-imagine transportation. He noted their programs leverage in-house technology and operational expertise to fill gaps in existing transit landscapes, increase overall mobility, decrease personal vehicle use, and ease parking and congestion.

Continuing, Mr. Murray used their project in Aspen, Colorado to illustrate the ways Downtowner is an economic driver. He stated the company moved nearly 400,000 people in January 2019.

Mr. Murray stated the company has won local and international awards and has a 100 percent renewal rate. He said the company takes safety very seriously, and reviewed ways in which drivers are reviewed and trained.

Mr. Monaco outlined the types of services offered by Downtowner, including fixed route, deviated route, and point-to-point. He said they provide a rider app to assist riders in utilizing the service.

Continuing, Mr. Monaco stated integrated approaches are possible, using Vail Resorts as an example. He noted Vail uses all three (3) options offered.

Mr. Monaco reviewed the specifics of the proposal to Delray Beach. Highlights include:

- Route avoids Atlantic Ave where possible
- Old School Square Garage becomes Park N Ride
- Continue to provide service to/from Tri-Rail
- 20 minute or less frequency
- 3 propane or hybrid vehicles
- 14 passenger vehicles
- New look with bike racks
- App with real-time tracking of vehicles and the ability to view live ETAs and nearby stop locations
- Ridership analytics including when and where people are moving
- Data-driven program evolution

Mr. Monaco stated Downtowner is offering a fresh new concept, with a reimagined 1950s “Woody”-style van which is not the “old Trolley.” He stated the style lends itself to an advertising with stickers on the van.

Continuing, Mr. Monaco addressed ways the company plans to conduct outreach and bring people to the service. He then presented details on ways the fixed route and point-to-point could be integrated to provide better service to Delray Beach, noting the company identified 36,016 riders who could have utilized point-to-point to get to the beach.

Chair Petrolia opened the Board Q&A section of the presentation by Downtowners.

Chair Petrolia pointed out the proposal includes 14-passenger vehicles rather than the 22-passengers outlined in the RFP and asked Executive Director Jeff Costello about funds available for vehicle purchase and minimum quotas.

Mr. Costello provided information on options explored by the City regarding grant funds and stated there are choices to be made. He stated funds may be available in 2020 and vehicle delivery in 2021.

Chair Petrolia asked for additional clarification regarding the differences between a company leasing their own vehicles and the City owning vehicles.

Mr. Costello stated the agreement is structured so that it can be reworked to be beneficial to both parties when funding becomes available for vehicle purchase.

Mr. Murray responded to the question regarding the grant funds and CRA-owned vehicles, stating that was the structure Downtowner started with in Tampa, so they are familiar with the requirements.

Chair Petrolia clarified that Downtowner was not taking a cut of any advertising that was done and asked if there was an option for video advertising on the shuttles.

Mr. Murray stated video is an option they have utilized previously.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated in their original proposal, Downtowner did not propose an environmentally-friendly vehicle, but in their presentation, they said they could use propane vehicles. She asked how that would impact the cost.

Mr. Monaco responded the pricing was done with the propane vehicles taken into consideration, but the type of vehicle was left open because each type of vehicle has a different lead time. He stated the company could get a gas-powered vehicle tomorrow, but a propane vehicle might take a month or two (2) to source.

Mr. Monaco addressed ways different vehicles could be used and traded out short-term and long-term based on lead time for procurement.

In response to a question from Deputy Vice Chair Gray, Mr. Costello stated the RFP was silent in terms of the type of vehicle required.

Commissioner Boylston asked for additional information regarding deviated route options, stating it was interesting because on weekends he would like the fixed route to be able to make changes, such as jumping to Pompey Park to take families to the beach.

Mr. Monaco explained ways Pompey Park could be added as a deviation to the route, including only going to the park when someone requests a ride, or adding the park as a pre-scheduled deviation on weekends.

Commissioner Boylston addressed the tracking and clarified the app can track not just the number of riders, but the actual riders themselves.

Mr. Murray stated the data is important in designing the programs, noting stops can be adjusted based on where riders are coming from.

Mr. Monaco noted point-to-point and fixed route services overlap and having them independent of one another leads to duplication of services. He addressed missed opportunities and ways they can correct that moving forward.

Commissioner Boylston asked about advertising in the application.

Mr. Monaco gave brief information on additional services available within the app, including ways to cross-promote with local businesses. He stated businesses can customize their descriptions in the app, but it's a relationship built at no cost.

Commissioner Bathurst stated the “Woody” idea was intriguing and asked for clarification on advertising.

Mr. Murray said the short answer is that decision is up to the City.

In response to a question from Commissioner Bathurst, Mr. Monaco gave information on different ways the routes are set. He stated when starting fresh, it would be determined by demand, and zones would be approved by the CRA or the City.

Commissioner Bathurst asked if integration with the Transit app was an opportunity.

Mr. Monaco stated they have worked with Transit in the past, and linking may be an option, but the Downtowner app would be a better experience.

Vice Chair Johnson asked what provisions were being made for those people who do not use apps.

Mr. Murray stated it would work similarly to how it does now, with signage at set stops.

In response to a question from Vice Chair Johnson, Mr. Monaco said they could work to get times on the signs to make that process more accessible.

Vice Chair Johnson asked how the new route would be rolled out.

Mr. Costello stated there would be a marketing push to advertise the new service in partnership with the company, as well as the DDA, City, and CRA.

Vice Chair Johnson asked if there is any way to mandate that drivers be local hires.

Mr. Murray stated having local drivers is important, and that has been their effort in the past. He said he was open to that being mandated.

### **First Transit**

Dave VanFoss, Regional Vice President, spoke on behalf of First Transit. He introduced his team, including the day-to-day people working on the project.

Mr. VanFoss stated when you select First Transit, you are choosing a company that puts safety first. He showed a map of Florida with current service areas labeled.

Continuing, Mr. VanFoss provided background information regarding the City’s relationship with the company. He stated experienced local management, staff, and drivers are in place, though things have been operating in “emergency mode.” He said they would like to grow the relationship to be more collaborative.

Valerie Courchesne, General Manager for First Transit in the Boynton Beach area, gave information on their interest in developing communication and providing transparency.

Ms. Courchesne stated First Transit is a member of the Chamber of Commerce and provides transportation for the monthly Leadership event. She said the company goes above and beyond in their current work for Delray Beach, providing daily cleaning and an operations facility for maintenance.

Continuing, Ms. Courchesne explained First Transit has CDL drivers, a requirement for any vehicle over 15 passengers, and stated this means additional training is provided.

Krystal Logan gave background on safety and training. She stated the advantages of First Transit in this area include 54 hours of training for new drivers, monthly safety meetings, and DriveCam for driver feedback and reinforcement of driver behaviors.

Ms. Courchesne provided details on the vehicles in their proposal, which are Starcraft Allstar vans seating 20 passengers (up to 2 wheelchairs) with bike racks and vehicle wrapping in collaborating with the CRA.

Ms. Courchesne reviewed the technology services available through First Transit. She noted cameras provide video and audio to document incidents.

In addition, Ms. Courchesne addressed optional technology services available and options for those who don't utilize technology, including a telephone number on the signage.

Mr. VanFoss made a brief closing statement, reiterating that safety, security, and maintenance make this a reliable service for the community of Delray Beach. He stated the proposal is based on a fixed rate per hour.

Chair Petrolia opened the Q&A section of the presentation by First Transit.

Commissioner Boylston thanked First Transit for their focus on safety, stating the attention has been appreciated. He asked Mr. VanFoss to address ways the program will evolve with changing needs.

Mr. VanFoss stated they would collaborate with staff on the street and the City to make the program a more effective community-based system.

Commissioner Boylston asked First Transit's recommendations regarding the vehicle. He stated in the past there was a vehicle you couldn't see into, which is part of the reason they went to the trolleys.

Ms. Courchesne stated the darker the window, the less people want to get in. She said the cleanliness of the vehicles will help with making it inviting. In addition, she said advertising could be up inside so windows could be seen through.

Commissioner Brinson asked how often the bus would be sanitized.

Ms. Courchesne said the buses are cleaned every single day to a high standard.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked how many employees First Transit has and what percentage are local.

Ms. Courchesne stated there are currently seven (7) employees for the trolley, and all but one (1) lives in Delray Beach.

In response to a question from Deputy Vice Chair Gray, Ms. Courchesne stated having a local garage helps to keep the vehicles on the road.

Chair Petrolia clarified that the vehicles belonged to First Transit and they were always agreeing to keep a minimum of two (2) vehicles on the road, so the maintenance would be the responsibility of the company, whether it was local or not.

In response to a question from Vice Chair Johnson, Ms. Courchesne stated a driver using a personal cell phone while driving would be terminated immediately.

Vice Chair Johnson asked the presenters to address the differences between the First Transit proposal and the Downtowner proposal in costs.

Ms. Logan stated their wages are a bit higher than the competitors, in part because they require a CDL. She said a lot of the differences would be related to employee costs such as wages and benefits, as well as technology.

Chair Petrolia confirmed that special event coverage would be available, though it wasn't included in the contract.

## **b. Award of RFP 2019-01 Point-to-Point Transportation Services**

Mr. Cabrera explained the CRA received six (6) responses to the RFP for a point-to-point pilot program. Those proposals came from BeeFree LLC dba FreeBee, Delray Downtowner Inc., L3 LLC dba O-Cartz, Round the Town LLC, The Free Ride LLC, and The Nickel Ride LLC.

He also stated that at the March 12 CRA Board Meeting staff recommended the Board accept the proposal from FreeBee, and the Board gave direction to review the top two (2) responses.

Mr. Cabrera recapped the key elements in the RFP, including:

- The vehicle will be a neighborhood electric vehicle, GEM car, or similar and supplies state-of-the-art charging equipment
- The program is expected to start with three (3) to five (5) vehicles
- Estimated time of arrival must be a function through mobile app
- Driver app must be able to organize ride requests to allow multiple rides be assigned to one (1) driver
- Proposer must include an ADA vehicle as part of its fleet
- Advertising may be permitted and is encouraged to offset operational costs
- Vehicle maintenance and charging must be performed by the proposer

- Service will be provided Monday through Wednesday from 11 a.m. to 9 p.m., Thursday through Saturday 11 a.m. to 11 p.m., and Sunday 11 a.m. to 9 p.m.

### **BeeFree LLC dba FreeBee**

Jason Spiegel and Kris Kimball, Managing Founders of BeeFree, LLC, presented their proposal to provide a first-class experience in Delray Beach.

Mr. Spiegel gave a brief background on the company, which he said provides free on-demand door-to-door transportation to help get cars off the road and make the community a place people can, live, work, and play without a personal vehicle.

Continuing, Mr. Spiegel stated their service is fully customizable. He shared information on the company's fleet of 58 vehicles in South Florida, and awards and affiliations held by FreeBee.

Mr. Spiegel used Coral Gables as an example, stating they moved over 75,000 passengers there last year with three (3) vehicles, leading to an increase in service this year.

Mr. Spiegel outlined competitive advantages of FreeBee, including technology efficiencies, operating efficiencies, ridership maximization strategies through economic development, and ability to deliver a first-class experience.

Continuing, Mr. Spiegel stated they have an in-house app development team which is continually enhancing the data daily. He explained the company is local, so all management and maintenance also happen locally.

Mr. Spiegel stated local businesses can offer exclusive deals and discounts in the application at no charge, and custom campaigns can be integrated.

Mr. Spiegel outlined the driver rating program, stating FreeBee pays their drivers the highest in the industry and provide comprehensive training.

Continuing, Mr. Spiegel showed the proposed coverage for Delray Beach. He stated the service would be geofenced within the defined areas of Delray Beach, with five (5) vehicles operating. He noted there are three (3) ways to request a ride, including:

- On-Demand through the "Ride Freebee" app
- On-Demand through a toll-free phone number
- "Flagging down" a passing vehicle

Mr. Spiegel showed photos of the proposed fleet, which would be a Polaris GEM e6 with a Level Two (2) Charger and lithium ion batteries with a 60 to 70-mile range. He stated there would be an interactive iPad and in-car video screen, and vehicles would be ADA wheelchair accessible.

Using Coral Gables as an example, Mr. Spiegel provided performance metrics and noted the company uses the data to continuously enhance the efficiency of the service.



Mr. Spiegel gave a brief demonstration of the mobile app and broke down the fees associated with the proposal. He noted a \$180,000 advertising subsidy was guaranteed.

In closing, Mr. Spiegel stated FreeBee did not respond to the RFP for fixed route services because they did not think it was the most efficient use of resources but noted that if Delray Beach allowed them to look at that service in addition to the point-to-point, he believed they could save the City thousands of dollars.

Chair Petrolia opened the Board Q&A section of the presentation by FreeBee.

Chair Petrolia asked how FreeBee would do a better job of picking passengers up and not running out of battery than the previous system.

Mr. Spiegel stated the company enhances the carts, more than doubling the mileage capacity for each vehicle.

In response to a question from Chair Petrolia, Mr. Kimball said he would be sourcing a location for a shop once the contract was granted. He noted they would source a location in Delray Beach.

Chair Petrolia stated a large portion of the previous service area was left off from the proposal, including the beach and Lake Ida. She asked if there was a possibility to expand to those areas.

Mr. Spiegel stated the area included in the proposal was the area included in the RFP, but FreeBee is fully flexible.

Attorney David Tolces clarified the area shown is the CRA boundaries.

Commissioner Bathurst agreed some of the most served areas are outside of the boundaries, and that will need to be addressed.

Mr. Tolces used the Tri Rail as an example, and stated the service brings people into the CRA, which is an economic driver. He said an interlocal agreement with the City may be required, but options could be discussed with the successful proposer.

Mr. Costello added that this is a pilot program, and additional revenue sources to expand the program would be reviewed over time.

Commissioner Boylston verified that all services would be provided in-house.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked Mr. Cabrera to provide his input on why point-to-point services would be used in place of something like Uber.

Chair Petrolia stated one (1) option is free and one (1) is not.

Mr. Cabrera noted the cost is a big point, as it is a private driver and the cost can add up. He stated in addition, there is the key element of the GEM cart of having “an experience.”

The Commissioners and staff discussed the “party ride” aspect of the point-to-point service versus an Uber or other service.

### **Downtownner Holdings, LLC**

Mike Monaco, Chief Technology Officer and Steve Murray, Chief Executive Officer of Downtownner Holdings, LLC, presented on behalf of their company.

Mr. Murray stated Downtownner’s pricing would have been similar to the other company’s if they had proposed the same number of vehicles, but Downtownner is proposing a larger fleet.

Continuing, Mr. Murray said the rider experience would be different because an ETA is given immediately when requesting a ride to allow people to plan. He stated automated technology groups riders to give the highest efficiency and relieves drivers from making any judgment calls.

Mr. Murray stated the point-to-point and fixed route services would be integrated to be sure passengers were using the correct service.

Mr. Murray stated Downtownner already has a location operating in Delray Beach and does not need to procure a location. He said they have six (6) years of advertising experience in Delray Beach, and recently started partnering with Vector Media.

Mr. Monaco presented the program overview, following the service area outlined in the RFP. He stated the company has the technology to require one end of the trip is within the CRA.

Continuing, Mr. Monaco stated brand-new open-air vehicles, to be replaced every two (2) years, are included in the budget.

Mr. Monaco explained the drivers are knowledgeable City Ambassadors for the City of Delray Beach, in addition to being experienced and friendly.

Mr. Monaco gave a brief review of the rider app, and compared the Downtownner application to a screenshot of the FreeBee app.

Mr. Murray presented a chart comparing Downtownner to FreeBee, stating Downtownner felt they had a lot more to bring to the community.

Chair Petrolia opened the Board Q&A section of the presentation by Downtownner.

In response to a question from Chair Petrolia, Mr. Murray stated the vehicles in another community were earning approximately \$3,000 in advertising. He said the City should be able to make similar, and that subsidy was not included in the bottom line of the proposal.

Chair Petrolia stated the addition of the cost for the service is a difficult pill to swallow, and she liked the idea of using the advertising to offset some of the costs.

Mr. Murray stated their proposal was for a fleet of eight (8) vehicles plus an ADA vehicle, ensuring a fleet of four (4) on the road at all times. He said the vehicles have the lithium ion batteries and level 2 charging referenced in the first proposal, as those services are not proprietary.

Chair Petrolia verified with Mr. Murray that the price difference between the two (2) proposals came down to the number of vehicles on the road.

Commissioner Bathurst followed upon Chair Petrolia's question and stated the per vehicle cost is lower with Downtowner.

Commissioner Boylston verified that all services would be provided in-house.

Commissioner Bathurst clarified the proposal from Downtowner did not include advertising in the budget. He stated he liked the clean look.

Mr. Monaco used examples from other Cities to explain why they don't use the advertising in the initial budget and allow that to be a factor after the project is in place.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked how many employees the Downtowner had when it was operating in Delray Beach, and how diverse that staff was.

Mr. Murray stated they had men and women of every skin color imaginable, and that they were from Delray Beach.

In response to a question from Deputy Vice Chair Gray discussed the route changes compared to previous iterations of the program. He said constraints on advertising dollars were a factor in dictating the route, but the new program won't have that issue.

In response to a question from Vice Chair Johnson, Mr. Murray said their chargers will be in the lot adjacent to the Downtowner offices at NE 4<sup>th</sup> Avenue and 2<sup>nd</sup> Street.

#### **Discussion on fixed route**

Mr. Tolces stated because each RFP was issued separately, they needed to be discussed and addressed separately.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated she supported First Transit on the fixed route service because what they are offering is a true "fixed route" program, and because of the number of seats offered. She noted the community is growing, and these services will be utilized more and more.

Continuing, Deputy Vice Chair Gray said the CDL requirement from First Transit is huge, as is the salary offered, local employees, safety, and the route to the grocery store.

Chair Petrolia opened a public hearing on the fixed route program.

**Steve Murray**, 118 Dixie Blvd., stated he has lived in Delray Beach for about six (6) years. He said the transportation the Downtowner had was fabulous, and most people would like to have it back. He noted he liked the idea of having an integrated system.

**Mavis Benson**, Delray Beach resident and merchant who is also on the DDA Board, stated she thinks the main thing is to keep in consideration that the community is a resort town. She said she thinks the look and feel of what the Downtowner is bringing is important, and that the technology seemed more advanced.

Chair Petrolia closed the public hearing and returned to Board discussion.

Commissioner Boylston stated the City would be taking a step backward if the only change that was made was from the trolleys to buses. He said he thought the Board went out for RFP because they wanted more than that.

Continuing, Commissioner Boylston stated he asked about who was doing the maintenance because it was important that the Downtowner is responsible for its own services. He said there is no one to point to, as they employ the people, maintain the carts, and built the technology.

Commissioner Boylston said he was looking for someone who would bring ideas to the table, not just do what is asked. He noted transportation is moving so quickly, the company should be able to move just as quickly and make recommendations.

Commissioner Boylston stated he thinks the City has an opportunity to take a leap forward with transportation.

Commissioner Bathurst discussed the proposals, and the number of seats available, stating even though Downtowner had smaller vehicles, they had more seats. He noted the Downtowner pushes back sometimes because they have institutional knowledge, and that can be utilized to the advantage of the City.

Continuing, Commissioner Bathurst referenced Ms. Benson's public comment, stating the downtown folks are looking for something different and innovative that matches the vibe of Delray Beach.

Commissioner Frankel stated both presentations were good, but he liked that the Downtowner guys "get it" and know the City. He noted the trolleys currently operating are not clean, so he disagrees with the First Transit assertion regarding cleanliness.

Vice Chair Gray thanked everyone for taking the time to help move Delray Beach forward. She stated she liked the look of the Downtowners vehicles, and that they were getting off the Avenue to avoid being stuck in traffic. In addition, she liked the integration and automated dispatch.

Chair Petrolia stated she saw a marked difference between the two (2) proposals with respect to changing technology. She said the smaller vehicles makes things more flexible, and adding an extra vehicle is the right thing to do.

Continuing, Chair Petrolia stated the advertising is something to be addressed at a later date. She said she, like her colleagues, likes the cleaner look, but there may be ways to integrate advertising and offset the costs to the taxpayers.

Chair Petrolia referenced the institutional knowledge of the Downtowner and the ways they looked to improve on the plan.

**Motion** by Commissioner Boylston, seconded by Commissioner Bathurst, to award the fixed route transportation contract to Downtowner, Inc. In a roll call vote, the **motion** passed (6-1). Deputy Vice Chair Gray voted no.

Chair Petrolia opened a public hearing on the point-to-point transportation, however there being none to speak, she closed the public hearing.

#### **Discussion on point-to-point**

Vice Chair Gray thanked the public for speaking regarding the transportation issues and stated she was voting for Downtowner.

Commissioner Boylston stated the synergy was something that would really help the City out, but he was very compelled by the presentation by FreeBee. He said they appear to run a great program, but the experience of the Downtowner trumped that.

Commissioner Frankel stated both were qualified firms, but the accurate ETA offered by Downtowner was a tie-breaker for him.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray said she liked everything about the FreeBee, but she would be supporting the Downtowner because her colleagues were looking for one (1) system.

Commissioner Brinson stated the Downtowner looked like a well-oiled machine and would be getting her support.

Commissioner Boylston stated this was a more difficult decision for him, as he thought FreeBee would be providing the same push to change the City's transportation with the times. He said he would be in favor of moving forward with the Downtowner, but it was close.

Chair Petrolia stated she felt the same was as Commissioner Boylston, that this was a more difficult decision. She noted the price comparisons start to level off when the number of carts on the road is considered and when advertising is factored in.

Commissioner Boylston said he was still on the fence as to whether CRA funds should be used for point-to-point and appreciated that it was a pilot program. He noted he would be watching carefully.

Chair Petrolia stated she agreed, and feedback would be needed regarding business, parking, and people using the carts instead of their personal vehicles.

**Motion** by Commissioner Frankel, seconded by Vice Chair Johnson, to award the point-to-point transportation contract to Downtowner, Inc. In a roll call vote, the **motion** passed unanimously (7-0).

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated she would like to comment regarding the trolley. She said it was her understanding that the City was responsible for the cleanliness of the trolley.

Commissioner Boylston said there is a difference between the inside and the outside. He stated he has never ridden the trolley and not had it be pristine and safe.

Mr. Tolces clarified that the motions gave the Chair the authority to negotiate and sign both agreements.

The Board agreed by consensus.

## **5. Other Business**

### **a. Comments by Commissioners**

None.

### **b. Comments by Board Attorney**

None.

### **c. Comments by Executive Director**

None.

### **d. Comments by Staff**

None.

## **11. Adjournment**

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 12:20 p.m.

---

Jeff Costello, Executive Director

---

Shelly Petrolia, Board Chair