



DEVELOPMENT SERVICES

BUILDING | HISTORIC PRESERVATION | PLANNING & ZONING
100 NW 1ST AVENUE, DELRAY BEACH, FLORIDA 33444
(561) 243-7040

HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD STAFF REPORT

17 NE 7th Street

Meeting: July 3, 2019	File No.: 2019-196	Application Appropriateness	Type: Certificate of
------------------------------	---------------------------	---------------------------------------	--------------------------------

GENERAL DATA

Agent: Nigel S Harris
Owner: Eric Keto
Location: 17 NE 7th Street
PCN: 12-43-46-09-29-001-0070
Property Size: 0.1377 Acres
FLUM: LD (Low Density)
Zoning: R-1-AA (Single-Family Residential)
Adjacent Zoning:

- R-1-AA(North)
- R-1-AA (West)
- R-1-AA (South)
- R-1-AA (East)

Existing Land Use: Single-Family Residence
Proposed Land Use: Single-Family Residence
Historic District: Del-Ida Park Historic District



ITEM BEFORE THE BOARD

Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-196) for the replacement of windows on a non-contributing property located at **17 NE 7th Street- Del Ida Park Historic District**, pursuant to Land Development Regulation (LDR) Sections 2.4.5(I)(5) & 2.4.6(H)(5). This includes:

- ☐ Site Plan
- ☐ Photographs of the property
- ☐ Sample of materials

BACKGROUND

The subject property is located on the north side of NE 7th Avenue between N Swinton Avenue and NE 2nd Avenue, contains a 1954 non-contributing single-family residence within the Del-Ida Park Historic District and is zoned R-1-AA.

A COA was administratively approved for the installation of a pool on September 17, 2002.

At its HPB meeting of July 21, 2010 board approved the Certificate of Appropriateness (2010-183) for the installation of a white, scalloped PVC fence to enclose the property. The fence is visible from the adjacent right-of-way.

PROJECT DESCRIPTION

The subject request is for a COA to remove thirteen (13) white framed windows varying from single-hung, jalousie, and horizontal sliding, and replacing them with white, aluminum single-hung and horizontal sliding impact-resistant windows. The request before the board is for the replacement of 4 existing windows with horizontal sliding windows as the single-hung windows can be approved via permit. All windows will be clear with non-reflective glass.

Project Planner:

Katherina C. Paliwoda, Planner
paliwodak@mydelraybeach.com,
561-243-7039

Review Dates:

HPB: July 3, 2019

Attachments:

1. Architectural Plans
2. Photographs
3. Detail of materials



SITE PLAN ANALYSIS

Pursuant to LDR Section 2.4.6(H)(5), prior to approval, a finding must be made that any Certificate of Appropriateness which is to be approved is consistent with Historic Preservation purposes pursuant to Objective A-4 of the Land Use Element of the Comprehensive Plan and specifically with provisions of Section 4.5.1, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Pursuant to Land Development Regulation (LDR) Section 2.4.5(I)(5), Architectural (appearance) elevations, the Site Plan Review and Appearance Board or the Historic Preservation Board, as appropriate, may approve, approve subject to conditions or deny architectural elevations or plans for a change in the exterior color of a building or structure, or for any exterior feature which requires a building permit.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(4) – Alterations: in considering proposals for alterations to the exterior of historic buildings and structures and in applying development and preservation standards, the documented, original design of the building may be considered, among other factors.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(5) - Standards and Guidelines: a historic site, building, structure, improvement, or appurtenance within a historic district shall only be altered, restored, preserved, repaired, relocated, demolished, or otherwise changed in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, and the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, as amended from time to time.

Standard 1

A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

Standard 2

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Standard 3

Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

Standard 4

Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Standard 5

Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

Standard 6

Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Standard 7

Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall



not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Standard 8

Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

Standard 9

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Standard 10

New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Standards 2, 3, 5, & 9 are applicable to the proposed modification of the structure. The installation of new aluminum, impact-resistant windows will be beneficial in that the exterior of the structure will be less affected where permanent hurricane protection will not be necessary. Additionally, replacement of the existing horizontal sliding windows with single-hung windows restores some of the original architectural authenticity.

Jalousie, awning, and 1/1 single-hung style windows are typical of the Masonry Vernacular style of architecture, where horizontal sliding windows are not original to this style. In order to protect the integrity of the original style of the structure the 4 proposed horizontal sliding windows should be replaced with single-hung windows. This item is attached as a condition of approval.

Pursuant to LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(8) - Visual Compatibility Standards: new construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section with regard to height, width, mass, scale, façade, openings, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1. Visual compatibility for minor and major development as referenced in Section 4.5.1(E)(2) shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m) below. Visual compatibility for all development on individually designated properties outside the district shall be determined by comparison to other structures within the site.

The following criteria apply:

1. **Height:** The height of proposed buildings or modifications shall be visually compatible in comparison or relation to the height of existing structures and buildings in a historic district for all major and minor development. For major development, visual compatibility with respect to the height of residential structures, as defined by 4.5.1(E)(2)(a), shall also be determined through application of the Building Height Plane.
2. **Front Facade Proportion:** The front facade of each building or structure shall be visually compatible with and be in direct relationship to the width of the building and to the height of the front elevation of other existing structures and buildings within the subject historic district.
3. **Proportion of Openings (Windows and Doors):** The openings of any building within a historic district shall be visually compatible with the openings exemplified by prevailing historic architectural styles of similar buildings within the district. The relationship of the width of windows and doors to the height of windows and doors among buildings shall be visually compatible within the subject historic district.



4. **Rhythm of Solids to Voids:** The relationship of solids to voids of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district for all development, with particular attention paid to the front facades.
 5. **Rhythm of Buildings on Streets:** The relationship of buildings to open space between them and adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible with the relationship between existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district.
 6. **Rhythm of Entrance and/or Porch Projections:** The relationship of entrances and porch projections to the sidewalks of a building shall be visually compatible with existing architectural styles of entrances and porch projections on existing historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district for all development.
 7. **Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color:** The relationship of materials, texture, and color of the facade of a building and/or hardscaping shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district.
 8. **Roof Shapes:** The roof shape, including type and slope, of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the roof shape of existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district. The roof shape shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building.
 9. **Walls of Continuity:** Walls, fences, evergreen landscape masses, or building facades, shall form cohesive walls of enclosure along a street to ensure visual compatibility with historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district and the structure to which it is visually related.
 10. **Scale of a Building:** The size of a building and the building mass in relation to open spaces, windows, door openings, balconies, porches, and lot size shall be visually compatible with the building size and mass of historic buildings and structures within a historic district for all development. To determine whether the scale of a building is appropriate, the following shall apply for major development only:
 - a. For buildings wider than sixty percent (60%) of the lot width, a portion of the front façade must be setback a minimum of seven (7) additional feet from the front setback line:
 - b. For buildings deeper than fifty percent (50%) of the lot depth, a portion of each side façade, which is greater than one story high, must be setback a minimum of five (5) additional feet from the side setback line:
 11. **Directional Expression of Front Elevation:** A building shall be visually compatible with the buildings, structures, and sites within a historic district for all development with regard to its directional character, whether vertical or horizontal.
 12. **Architectural Style:** All major and minor development shall consist of only one (1) architectural style per structure or property and not introduce elements definitive of another style.
- (m) **Additions to individually designated properties and contributing structures in all historic districts:** Visual compatibility shall be accomplished as follows:
1. Additions shall be located to the rear or least public side of a building and be as inconspicuous as possible.
 2. Additions or accessory structures shall not be located in front of the established front wall plane of a historic building.
 3. Characteristic features of the original building shall not be destroyed or obscured.
 4. Additions shall be designed and constructed so that the basic form and character of the historic building will remain intact if the addition is ever removed.
 5. Additions shall not introduce a new architectural style, mimic too closely the style of the existing building nor replicate the original design but shall be coherent in design with the existing building.
 6. Additions shall be secondary and subordinate to the main mass of the historic building and shall not overwhelm the original building.



The proposal is for replacement of 9 windows in the main house (4 horizontal sliding and 5 single-hung) and 4 single-hung windows in the pool house/office. The single-hung windows are appropriate for the style of the structure and their use restores some of the original architectural authenticity. The use of horizontal sliding windows are not original to the Masonry Vernacular architectural style of the structure.

The applicable Visual Compatibility Standard is the Proportion of Openings (Windows and Doors) as the relationship of windows shall be visually compatible within the subject historic district.

The Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for the Treatment of Historic Properties, states:

"It is not recommended to change the appearance of windows that contribute to the historic character of the building by replacing materials, finishes, or colors which noticeably change the sash, depth of the reveal, and muntin configurations; the reflectivity and color of the glazing; or the appearance of the frame."

The City of Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, states:

"When new windows are required, their replacement with the original material is always most desirable. However, the Historic Preservation Board will consider other materials or cladding on a case-by-case basis, provided that the new windows match the originals in their profile, configuration and any other character-defining feature(s)."

and, the Guidelines state it is not recommended to:

"Changing the historic appearance through inappropriate design materials or adding a finish or color that changes the sash, depth of reveal, the reflectivity, or the appearance of the frame."

Based upon the above standards, guidelines, and requirements the use of single-hung or casement windows is most appropriate for use with the subject structure and the use of horizontal sliding windows is not appropriate. A condition of approval is that single-hung or casement windows be proposed instead of horizontal sliding windows. Provided the condition of approval is met, the Visual Compatibility Standards can be met.

Review by Others:

Not applicable

Courtesy Notice:

Del-Ida Park Neighborhood Association

ALTERNATIVE ACTIONS

1. Move to continue with direction.
2. Move approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-196), for the replacement of 4 aluminum single-hung and jalousie style windows with horizontal sliding windows associated with the single-family residence located at **17 NE 7th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets criteria set forth in Sections 2.4.6(H)(5) and 2.4.5(I)(5) of the Land Development Regulations.
3. Move approval of the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-196), for the replacement of 4 aluminum single-hung and jalousie style windows with horizontal sliding windows associated with the single-family residence located at **17 NE 7th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets criteria set forth in Sections 2.4.6(H)(5) and 2.4.5(I)(5) of the Land Development Regulations, subject to the following condition:
 1. That single-hung or casement windows be utilized instead of horizontal sliding windows.



4. Move denial of the Certificate of Appropriateness (2019-196), for the replacement of 4 aluminum single-hung and jalousie style windows with horizontal sliding windows associated with the single-family residence located at **17 NE 7th Street, Del-Ida Park Historic District**, by finding that the request is inconsistent with the Comprehensive Plan and does not meet criteria set forth in Sections 2.4.6(H)(5) and 2.4.5(I)(5) of the Land Development Regulations

Public and Courtesy Notices

☐ Courtesy Notices are not applicable to this request

☒ Courtesy Notices were provided to the following, at least 5 working days prior to the meeting: Del-Ida Park Neighborhood Association

☒ Public Notices are not required for this request.

☐ Public Notice was posted at the property on (insert date), 7 calendar days prior to the meeting.

☐ Public Notice was mailed to property owners within a 500' radius on (6/6/2019), 10 days prior to the meeting.

☐ Public Notice was mailed to the adjacent property owners on (insert date), 20 days prior to the meeting.

☐ Public Notice was published in the (insert publication) on (insert date), 10 calendar days prior to the meeting.

☐ Public Notice was posted to the City's website on (6/6/19)), 10 calendar days prior to the meeting.

☐ Public Notice was posted in the main lobby at City Hall on (insert date), 10 working days prior to the meeting.

☒ Agenda was posted on (6/25/19), 5 working days prior to meeting.