



CRA Board Workshop Meeting Minutes
Tuesday, June 11, 2019 – 10:00 a.m.
City Commission Chambers – 100 NW 1st Avenue
Delray Beach, FL 33444

STAFF PRESENT:

Jeff Costello	Renee Jadusingh	Danielle Arfin	Patrick McCullough
DJ Lee	Anne Fredy	Lori Nolan	Krista Walker
Tara Toto	Ivan Cabrera	Lori Hayward	Alexina Jeannite
Jill Brown	Elizabeth Burrows		

OTHERS PRESENT:

George Long	Ernestine Holiday	Morris Carstarphen	Missie Barletto
Laura Simon	Shannon Borst	Jason Spiegel	David Tolces

1. Call to Order

Chair Petrolia called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m.

2. Roll Call

Present: Chair Shelly Petrolia, Deputy Vice Chair Angie Gray, Treasurer Bill Bathurst, Commissioner Adam Frankel, Commissioner Pamela Brinson, and Commissioner Ryan Boylston.

Vice Chair Shirley Johnson joined the meeting at 10:40 a.m.

3. Approval of Agenda

4. Discussion

a. Delray Beach CRA Workshop Presentation

b. Workshop Presentation

c. Discussion - Alleyways

The recording starts here.

Jeff Costello, Executive Director, presented a plan for the alleys as it relates to traffic circulation and improved appearance. He noted improvements are being taken from the adopted redevelopment plan, which would be being implemented moving forward.

Mr. Costello stated the discussion would start with the Northwest neighborhood, and shared a map identifying alleys which are:

- Improved
- Unimproved and dedicated
- Unimproved and undedicated (potential title issues)
- Those to be designed and constructed

Mr. Costello went on to share a map of the Southwest neighborhood, providing the same information. He stated quite a few alleys in the Southwest neighborhood have been constructed or are funded for this year.

Continuing, Mr. Costello reviewed the map for the Osceola Park neighborhood and the Pineapple Grove neighborhood and circulated an alley maintenance schedule which his staff had received from City staff the previous day.

Mr. Costello gave background on what factors the Board might use in prioritizing improvement projects, noting some residential alleys which dead end may have less value, and pointing out safety concerns should be considered.

Continuing, Mr. Costello addressed how to proceed regarding undedicated alleys. He stated visually, it appears there is an alley, but there is not. He said staff has reviewed some properties, and there is a process to be considered if it is the desire of the CRA and the adjacent properties.

David Tolces, Board Attorney, stated title work has been done on some alleys, and the ownership is vested in the individual who originally platted the lot. He noted research would be required to move forward with acquisition, and consultants would be required. He provided background on the eminent domain process and interlocal agreement possibilities with the City.

Mr. Costello stated education for the property owners within those blocks is an important piece of the picture if development of those alleys is pursued.

Chair Petrolia opened the subject to public comment.

George Long, provided a brief history of the redevelopment of Block 60, going back to the early 1960s, and stated access to his property is difficult due to historic preservation rules. He asked that Mr. Costello help him with research regarding the property.

Chair Petrolia asked Mr. Long to speak with Mr. Costello directly outside the meeting.

Ernestine Holiday, stated she has lived in her house since July 1964, and her alley has been cleaned for the first time this year. She addressed the topic of dead-end alleys and stated some of those in her neighborhood will be a problem.

Morris Carstarphen, stated he was a previous CRA Board member and the alley issue has been a problem for years. He said the funds and resources are in place, and the CRA just needs to get all the alleys done as quickly as possible. Mr. Carstarphen continued by bringing up two (2) sidewalk issues which needs to be addressed.

Chair Petrolia closed the public hearing.

Chair Petrolia stated there are some land-locked alleys with no access to the public and said those seemed like low priority to her.

Mr. Costello confirmed those alleys are not accessible unless the property owners were to dedicate.

Chair Petrolia stated those alleys looked like prime locations to seek a property owner to absorb, rather than continuing to discuss maintaining an area as a CRA that is not accessible.

Continuing, Chair Petrolia stated there is several alleys in the Northwest that appear to be designed for construction. She noted those alleys which dead-end should be a priority only if they serve a purpose, and if they do not, cleaning them up is more important than paving or improving.

Chair Petrolia stated there is a challenging road ahead, especially in the Northwest neighborhood. She asked why three (3) areas in Osceola were not included in the previous design project.

Mr. Costello explained those may be areas to review abandonment, but he would need to check with Public Works.

The Commissioners and staff discussed a specific example of an alley where the owner owned property on both sides.

Commissioner Brinson asked if discovering ownership of an alley through title search increased the value of the property to the current homeowner.

Mr. Tolces explained that in the cases being discussed, the ownership does not reside with the current owner, but with the heirs of the person who did the original plat in 1913 or 1925, as they did not dedicate the alley to the City.

Continuing, Mr. Tolces stated abandoned alleys would potentially increase the assessed values of properties they were conveyed to.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated the CRA has identified the alleyways and sidewalks as a priority and has been more aggressive with providing funding this year, but issues had come up with conveyance of land. She said she would be interested in exploring the complicated properties, because they need to be improved.

Mr. Tolces explained staff does know the process which would need to be followed, but the CRA and City Commission need to determine whether that is something they want to spend time, money, and effort pursuing.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated she thinks it is much needed and the time would be worthwhile. She noted the owners should be involved in the process.

Continuing, Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked what was happening with the alleys associated with improvements on 7th Avenue.

Mr. Costello pulled up the map for the Southwest Neighborhood and pointed out where the seven (7) alleys associated with the larger capital improvement project are marked. He stated the City is working on the utilities, and an invitation to bid is anticipated later in the fiscal year.

Continuing, Mr. Costello stated a designer is working on the alleys, and stated the CRA Board needs to determine whether the alleys Deputy Vice Chair Gray was asking about that require conveyance be included, with the possibility the plans would expire before land is secured.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated it makes sense to move forward with those which are secured but wants to see movement on those with title issues.

The Commissioners and staff discussed the plan and budget for cleaning up the alleys.

Caryn Gardner-Young, Assistant City Manager, stated the City wants to bring forward that there is a plan, but would follow up with additional information.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked for a quarterly report regarding which alleys were being cleaned.

Commissioner Brinson asked for clarification regarding eminent domain.

Mr. Tolces explained the process that would be required to obtain title of an alley.

Ms. Gardner-Young provided additional information, noting it might be helpful to think of the alley as a private roadway.

Commissioner Bathurst stated the alleys which are designed and ready to be constructed should be moved forward, as this is a project the CRA has wanted to do for a long time.

Continuing, Commissioner Bathurst asked if the alleys all had the same design standard.

Missie Barletto, Deputy Director Program and Project Management for the City of Delray Beach, explained the alleys do not have the same design standard. She stated the alleys north of 4th Street will be improved with pervious asphalt, while those south of 4th Street will be improved with turf block to maintain the stormwater management issues as well as making them accessible and to provide additional green space.

Commissioner Bathurst stated items like gardens and greenery beside the alley should be respected, as people are trying to make spaces look nice.

Ms. Barletto stated in the Osceola neighborhood in particular, the City has been asked to pay attention to maintaining the character of the neighborhood and to give the neighborhood an identity. She said because of these requests, the neighborhood will have its own street signs.

Commissioner Frankel commented regarding the priorities, and stated the priority expressed by the CRA Board over and over has been alleys, sidewalks, and infrastructure. He noted the \$170,000 to be discussed for signs should be spent on those priorities instead of signs.

Commissioner Boylston stated the designed alleys in the Northwest neighborhood could be prioritized as they do not have title issues, and hopefully by the time those are done, there will be progress on those with problems.

Vice Chair Johnson stated it has been 95 years, and Delray Beach is finally putting an emphasis on the Northwest, Southwest, and Osceola Park neighborhoods. She said it was a heavy lift but encouraged the Commissioners to maintain it as a neighborhood.

Continuing, Vice Chair Johnson said she would advocate for a survey of the neighborhoods, so information is available regarding who owns property.

The Commissioners discussed issues with lights being out on Avenues and Streets throughout the City, as well as other projects which should be considered.

d. Discussion – West Atlantic Branding Initiative

Mr. Costello stated the Board had been provided a chronology of all the activity regarding the West Atlantic Branding Initiative. He provided information regarding the goal and what had been accomplished to date.

Continuing, Mr. Costello noted a number of partners came together in 2015 and a grant was provided by the Downtown Development Authority for the effort.

Chair Petrolia opened the item to public comment.

Laura Simon, Downtown Development Authority, stated she was available to answer questions, and gave a brief background on the initiative, including the collection of survey data and efforts to best represent the community.

Ernestine Holiday, stated the Chamber of Commerce has a brochure regarding The Set, and said everyone at a recent school reunion was pleased with it. She said a lot of hours were spent on that brand, and the people within The Set would appreciate it being maintained as it is.

Morris Carstarphen, commented regarding the alleys and prioritizing. He stated a priority list already existed, along with budgets. He stated the branding initiative should not be an issue if politics are removed from the discussion.

Chair Petrolia closed the public comment session.

The Commissioners discussed Mr. Carstarphen's comments regarding the alleys, and said they have a plan moving forward.

Commissioner Boylston stated he was on the DDA Board at the time of the initiative, and had a lot of questions regarding the project, but voted for it because he thinks marketing is frequently missed. He stated marketing ties in with economic development, and referenced campaigns in other communities.

Continuing, Commissioner Boylston stated the branding went through a long process, so when he wasn't as impressed with the product, it didn't matter, because the community involvement and the marketing materials is what was important.

Commissioner Bathurst agreed, stating strictly as a marketing brand, the project is a success. He said it was vetted and identifies the area.

Vice Chair Johnson stated she is concerned and confused, as the citizens who are involved in the project are not the people who live in the neighborhood. She said the people who live in the neighborhoods already have names for their communities, and she takes issue with renaming them. Continuing, Vice Chair Johnson stated she has a problem with the name "The Set" and its possible connotations.

Commissioner Bathurst stated he agrees that neighborhoods should not be renamed, but the marketing and branding for the economic development of that side of Town is a separate issue.

The Commissioners discussed other communities which had undertaken branding campaigns for all or part of their neighborhoods.

Commissioner Boylston stated one of the topics that was debated at community workshops was whether there should be branding separate for that neighborhood at all.

Chair Petrolia stated there are two (2) distinct groups, residential and business, and that the pushback is largely around the residential district. She said the residents of the Northwest/Southwest neighborhoods were not as engaged as they could have been, and maybe it could be looked at separately.

Commissioner Bathurst stated there is individual pride in each of the neighborhoods, and the branding should not be on street signs.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated she lives in the neighborhood, and the Southwest neighborhood is the Southwest neighborhood. She said she would not be interested in changing the name.

Continuing, Deputy Vice Chair Gray said previous Commissions have always fought for a seamless downtown, with no separations, and branding should consider that. She stated she has spoken with residents and business owners who do not like it.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated that because a lot of people were involved in the development and a lot of money was spent, she would be willing to discuss taking out the neighborhoods and calling the business area The Set, if all business owners were consulted and agreed.

Commissioner Boylston pointed out there are numerous branded neighborhoods in Delray Beach, and encouraged Commissioners to speak with Laura Simon from the Downtown Development Authority regarding that issue.

Commissioner Frankel thanked Mr. Costello for the timeline and asked him to clarify when The Set became a Political Action Committee (PAC).

Mr. Costello stated he didn't know that it was.

Commissioner Frankel stated in 2018, The Set hosted a candidate forum and put out palm cards. He said to him, the set is more than an area, it is a PAC, and noted the materials were handed out in coordination with the Northwest/Southwest Neighborhood Alliance. Commissioner Frankel asked who paid for, created, and distributed the materials.

Mr. Costello stated he did not know the answer to the question.

Commissioner Boylston asked who owns the logo and the brand, noting he has seen other logos used on materials and is unsure of the ownership.

Board Attorney David Tolces stated he had not filed anything on behalf of the CRA regarding protection of the logo.

Commissioner Frankel said as someone who pays CRA and DDA taxes, he is concerned his tax dollars went to fund a campaign against him. He noted there is no disclaimer on the material as required by Florida law, and there is no designation of who paid for and approved the card.

Chair Petrolia stated she understands the concern and thinks it should be addressed.

Commissioner Frankel distributed information from The Set's website regarding an event hosted by The Set, West Atlantic Redevelopment Coalition (WARC), and the Northwest/Southwest Neighborhood Alliance in September 2018 which was a forum to

discuss a construction project. He noted the materials specifically stated the cone of silence and Sunshine Laws did not apply.

Continuing, Commissioner Frankel stated there was previous discussion regarding forming a citizens' group that adhered to State guidelines. He said certainly the residents need representation, but the City should be involved so that rules are respected.

Mr. Costello stated the landing page for The Set appeared to be being managed by the WARC, and the City, CRA, and DDA could look at bringing that back.

The Commissioners discussed the origins of the project and what actions might need to be taken regarding The Set.

Vice Chair Johnson stated she felt it was time for governmental reigning in of the project.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray said she felt the answer might be removing the logo from CRA materials and focusing on spending CRA money on in-house marketing to advertise its own programs.

Commissioner Brinson stated she was concerned people who were not vested in the Northwest/Southside community making the decisions and pushing for branding.

Commissioner Boylston clarified that he sat on the DDA Board for six (6) years, and during that time, The Set came to the Board for funding, and they provided money for the marketing brand to be developed. He stated he was not involved in the project beyond approval of funding.

Commissioner Bathurst stated the CRA wants to get things done in the Northwest/Southwest communities, and one of the ways to do that is to shine a light on them. He stated he does not support changing the brand of the neighborhoods themselves.

Continuing, Commissioner Bathurst said he would direct legal counsel to lock down the brand so the CRA could make sure it was not being used for purposes outside those originally intended.

Commissioner Frankel indicated he would ask legal counsel for feedback and get definitive answers on who is paying for the activities of The Set. He stated he did not feel tax dollars could be used in this manner.

Mr. Tolces stated he would like an opportunity to meet with Laura Simon of the DDA and the CRA Executive Director and track back to the funding of the branding to find out what the agreements stated regarding ownership.

Commissioner Frankel suggested the City Auditor also had information regarding tracing the documents and should be involved in the conversation.

Vice Chair Johnson stated she wants a seamless downtown and does not support The Set. She said the CRA and City Commission did not bless the project, and it went amok.

Commissioner Boylston said the idea was workshopped over 18 months, and hundreds of people were involved. He said he believes the CRA should have control over the branding and noted he hadn't known the website was not controlled by the CRA or DDA.

Continuing, Commissioner Boylston stated he disagreed that Atlantic to Swinton should be like Swinton to the bridge. He said he did not believe that would be a success and would not preserve the history of the district.

Vice Chair Johnson stated the character of I-95 to Swinton is already lost.

Chair Petrolia said the takeaways were that staff does not have support moving forward with The Set as branding. In addition, there are questions for the Board Attorney to follow up with.

Chair Petrolia noted Commissioner Boylston made good points about the seamlessness not continuing past Swinton because they do want that to be affordable and the CRA is working very hard to do that. She said it was a great time for visioning, as the pallet of the western side of town is fairly clear.

Commissioner Brinson stated the point was to keep the small-town charm.

Mr. Costello stated the attorney would follow up and the conversation could be continued another time.

Mr. Costello asked if the remaining agenda items could be reversed so the speaker could catch a flight.

f. Update – Transportation Services

Fixed Route

Shannon Borst, Director of Business Development for First Transit, gave an update on the trolley service (fixed route). She shared a transition timeline for the remainder of the year.

Ms. Borst said the goal was to have the contract finalized in the next week, noting vehicles would be ordered immediately upon execution of the contract. She stated the propane vehicles would be ordered at the same time.

Ms. Borst outlined the details of the interim fleet, which would include:

- Two (2) 2018 Ford Allstar Starcraft E350 Vehicles with 6.2-liter engines
- Certified for E85 Fuel
- One ambulatory entrance and one lift entrance
- 14-passenger capacity with two (2) wheelchair securement areas
- Delivery 14-21 days after lease agreement is signed
- Magnetic signs identifying trolley to be designed and attached

Ms. Borst also provided details on the permanent fleet, which would include:

- Three (3) 2019 Ford Allstar Starcraft E350 Vehicles with 6.8-liter engines
- Propane fueled
- One ambulatory entrance and one lift entrance
- 14-passenger capacity with two (2) wheelchair securement areas
- Delivery 120-160 days after lease agreement is signed
- First Transit will work with CRA on wrap design
- Vehicles will be transported to local vendor for wrapping

Chair Petrolia opened the item to public comment, however there being none to speak, closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Bathurst stated he was excited progress was being made, and said he was interested to see what the vehicles would look like.

Chair Petrolia said she thought the Board gravitated to a previous suggestion of the “woody” look, as it fit with being the City by the beach.

The Commissioners discussed ideas for the look.

In response to a question from Chair Petrolia, Ms. Borst stated the vehicles had bike racks on the front.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray stated she wanted to see the City and CRA logos both included and noted the fixed route and point-to-point vehicles should have a similar design.

The Commissioners discussed the reasons they did not want the windows to be wrapped.

Commissioner Boylston stated he felt the project was going backward instead of forward, and noted the trolleys are an experience. He asked if Ms. Borst would be open to another style option.

Ms. Borst stated it all comes down to the bottom line, including design and green features. She noted the new contract is supposed to start in two (2) weeks, and a redesign would push that out.

Mr. Costello noted they did say going in that this would be a short-term option.

Ms. Borst stated the Board may want to consider that a longer contract period would allow for more expensive vehicles to be purchased and depreciated over a longer period.

Commissioner Boylston pointed out that this was not a conversation about the company, but about the vehicles. He noted that in his six (6) years on the DDA Board, there was never a complaint about First Transit.

Commissioner Bathurst asked if the current trollies could be converted to propane.

Ms. Borst stated they could, but it was her understanding the condition of the trolleys is quite poor, so she was unclear what return that investment would garner.

Commissioner Boylston asked if it was an option to utilize the vehicles in place or the temporary vehicles presented for the interim while staff worked with First Transit to identify another vehicle option for the next meeting.

Mr. Tolces stated the contract is negotiated and ready to go back to First Transit, so he needed direction on what changes should be made to the contract.

Ms. Borst said the three (3) trolleys are currently not functioning, and First Transit's spare vehicle is being utilized.

Ivan Cabrera, CRA Project Manager, noted the funding only runs through June 30, so that would need to be adjusted if negotiations will be extended.

Vice Chair Johnson stated she would not be in support of continuing the current vehicles.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray said the CRA needs to get what they want, not just settle for something.

Mr. Costello noted the timing might dictate moving forward with the interim vehicles and negotiating something different for the long-term.

Ms. Borst stated the E-85 vehicle lease could be set at six (6) months, then extend the contract with First Transit by six (6) months to allow for that decision to be made. She noted pricing requirements would need to be made to reflect the longer lease and the new vehicle that is chosen.

Mr. Tolces said the concern goes back to the RFP. He clarified the maximum period would need to remain two (2) years, with an option to renew.

Point-to-Point

Jason Spiegel, Managing Partner with FreeBee, provided an update on the point-to-point transportation service.

Mr. Spiegel stated the vehicles have been purchased and should be delivered by mid-August, at which time they will be customized and wrapped in Miami. He noted a recruitment blitz for drivers will start as soon as the contract is signed.

Continuing, Mr. Spiegel explained FreeBee staff has been working to find a location and believe they will have a site secured in the next two (2) to three (3) weeks. He touched on economic development efforts ramping up to start promoting the service and signing people up for the application.

Mr. Spiegel stated the program is estimating a start date of September 3.

Chair Petrolia opened the topic to public comment.

Morris Carstarphen, thanked the CRA Board for continuing the transportation service.

Chair Petrolia closed the public hearing.

Commissioner Frankel stated he was recently in Wynwood, where FreeBee is currently operating, and he saw cards advertising the service everywhere. He stated it looked nice, and he wanted to share that with the Board.

Chair Petrolia asked for additional information regarding the look of the vehicle and clarified the advertising subsidy guaranteed by FreeBee.

Mr. Spiegel stated the proposal provided for \$180,000 in advertising subsidy.

Vice Chair Johnson said she felt it would be worth spending that amount to keep the vehicles expressly Delray Beach, rather than providing advertising space.

Commissioner Frankel disagreed, stating it promotes City businesses.

Commissioner Boylston noted the vehicle would also have an area that was constant with City and CRA branding.

Chair Petrolia asked for consideration that the vehicles be branded together with the fixed route service, in addition to being a space for advertising. She said she was OK with the advertising as long as it had a consistent look.

Mr. Spiegel stated because it is app based, people are not looking around trying to find the vehicles and uniform looks may not be as important as with fixed route.

Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked how FreeBee will go about hiring and asked how diversity will be included.

Mr. Cabrera stated the CRA would be connecting FreeBee with the Career Cottage. Deputy Vice Chair Gray asked if there was a way to make the cost of advertising on the vehicle more affordable for small businesses. She also asked if the CRA would need to create a subsidy to allow small businesses to advertise.

Mr. Spiegel stated the FreeBee app has free advertising available to all local businesses, allowing them to place their businesses in "Places to Be" at no cost, as well as the ability to offer specials and promotions through the app to incentivize visits.

e. Update – Northwest/Southwest Neighborhood Identification Signs

Mr. Costello provided an update on the effort to update signs in the Northwest/Southwest neighborhoods. He shared a brief look at the steps the CRA Board has seen in

the past and the feedback they gave, and new options being explored to tie in with capital improvement projects.

Chair Petrolia opened a public hearing on the topic.

Morris Carstarphen, clarified his previous comments and suggested that a logo not be allowed to hold up progress.

Chair Petrolia closed the public discussion.

Vice Chair Johnson expressed concern that one (1) property owner who might disagree stopping an entire neighborhood from receiving beautification.

Mr. Costello stated there would be seven (7) properties which required easements to be obtained, but there are opportunities to look for locations. He noted preference is to put the signs not on private property.

The Commissioners and staff discussed options and pricing.

Chair Petrolia stated she appreciates a sign in the community that is an update, with the same parameters used in different neighborhoods but the addition of stylistic items for each area.

Commissioner Boylston pointed to the dilapidated signs in some neighborhoods and stated he thought an upgrade was needed. He echoed Chair Petrolia's preference for a sign that is updated, better quality, but not revolutionary in design.

The Commissioners discussed bringing Block Captains or neighbors in on design approval. Staff noted there had been 11 public meetings since December 2017.

f. Update – Transportation Services

Item previously addressed.

5. Adjournment

There being no further discussion, the meeting was adjourned at 1:10 p.m.

Renee Jadusingh, Executive Director

Shelly Petrolia, Board Chair