Delray Beach CRA Justification Statement

TAC Comment

LDR Section 4.5.1(E) <u>Development Standards</u>- All new development or exterior improvements on individually designated historic properties and/or properties located within historic districts shall comply with the goals, objectives, and policies of the Comprehensive Plan, the Delray Beach Historic Preservation Design Guidelines, the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation , and the Development Standards of this Section.

LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) <u>Visual Compatibility Standards</u> – New construction and all improvements to both contributing and noncontributing buildings, structures and appurtenances thereto within a designated historic district or on an individually designated property shall be visually compatible. In addition to the Zoning District Regulations, the Historic Preservation Board shall apply the visual compatibility standards provided for in this Section with regard to height, width, mass, scale, façade, opening, rhythm, material, color, texture, roof shape, direction, and other criteria set forth elsewhere in Section 4.5.1 Visual compatibility for minor and major development shall be determined by utilizing criteria contained in (a)-(m) of this section.

Provide a written narrative or justification statement demonstrating how the proposal complies with the requirements of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation, as well as the Visual Compatibility Standards.

Compliance with The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation

The Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties within Guidelines for Preserving, Rehabilitating, Restoring, and Reconstructing Historic Buildings are four different approaches to the treatment of historic properties. The two-story building located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue, is neither designated as a historic property and nor classified as a contributing structure within the West Settlers Historic District. As such, the Delray Beach CRA does not agree that the Secretary of Interior's Standards for the Rehabilitation of Historic Properties is applicable in this circumstance. However, as LDR Section 4.5.1(E) currently requires compliance with the Secretary of Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation for all new development and/or exterior improvements on all properties located within historic districts, the Delray Beach CRA provides the below responses as it relates to compliance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Standard 1:

A property shall be used for its historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.

Response 1:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. Notwithstanding, the proposed design does maintain the original exterior walls of the two-story building while accommodating a modern use for the building and site. The proposed design and use aim to embrace the characteristics of the site and surrounding environment with no negative effect on the historic

integrity of the West Settlers Historic District while bringing greater economic development and activation to the Northwest 5th Avenue corridor.

Standard 2:

The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alteration of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.

Response 2:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. The proposed design and use for the property do not alter any previously recognized historic character, features, or spaces of the property, or involve removal of previously recognized historic materials. Notwithstanding, the proposed design does maintain the original exterior walls of the two-story building while accommodating a modern use for the building and site.

Standard 3:

Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.

Response 3:

The proposed design will not include architectural elements that would create a "false sense of historical development." The proposed design reflects characteristics and elements of the Masonry Modern architectural style that is in line with the building's current architectural style, the Delray Beach Central Business District Architectural Design Guidelines, and with the other buildings and structures within the historic district.

Standard 4:

Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.

Response 4:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. The proposed design does not involve the removal of any previously recognized historically significant change, addition, or alteration.

Standard 5:

Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.

Response 5:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. The proposed design for the property does not alter or remove any previously recognized historically distinctive feature, finish, construction technique, or example of craftsmanship. The current two-story building was built in the Masonry Modern architectural style and that style is maintained in the proposed design.

Standard 6:

Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

Response 6:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. The proposed design does not involve the repair or replacement of any previously recognized historic feature. The current two-story building was built in the Masonry Modern architectural style and that style is maintained in the proposed design.

Standard 7:

Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.

Response 7:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is currently neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. Nevertheless, chemical or physical treatments that could cause any damage will not be used.

Standard 8:

Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.

Response 8:

No archaeological resources have been discovered at the site.

Standard 9:

New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

Response 9:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. The proposed design for the property will not destroy any previously recognized historic material or architectural feature. The proposed design maintains the use of the original exterior walls of the two-story building, and aims to embrace the characteristics of the site and surrounding environment with no negative effect on the historic integrity of the West Settlers Historic District while bringing greater economic development and activation to the Northwest 5th Avenue corridor through a modern use.

Standard 10:

New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Response 10:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the historic district. Any new addition or construction undertaken as part of the proposed design and use for the property would not impair the form and integrity of any previously recognized historic property. Notwithstanding, the proposed design maintains the use of the original exterior walls of the two-story building, and aims to embrace the characteristics of the site and surrounding environment with no negative effect on the historic integrity of the West Settlers Historic District while bringing greater economic development and activation to the Northwest 5th Avenue corridor through a modern use.

<u>Compliance with City of Delray Beach Land Development Regulations - LDR Section</u> <u>4.5.1(E)(7) Visual Compatibility Standards</u>

The subject property is located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue within the West Settlers Historic District. The site contains a non-contributing two-story building built in 1972. The proposed design and redevelopment of the two-story building allows for modernization of the building with more durable materials that are visually compatible with the other buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District. The proposed Masonry Modern architectural style utilizes architectural materials, details, elements, and characteristics that are appropriate for the West Settlers Historic District and will not impair the integrity of the historic area. Additionally, the proposed design was inspired by the previously approved design for the abutting property

located at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue, currently the office for the Delray Beach Housing Authority, specifically for visual compatibility and continuity along Northwest 5th Avenue. With the redevelopment of this building, the Delray Beach CRA hopes to bring more economic opportunities into and further activate the Northwest 5th Avenue corridor.

The Delray Beach CRA provides the below responses as it relates to compliance with LDR Section 4.5.1(E)(7) <u>Visual Compatibility Standards</u>. **Please see Sheets AS-102 and A-201 for more specifications and details**.

Standard A: Height

The height of proposed buildings or modifications shall be visually compatible in comparison or relation to the height of existing structures and buildings in a historic district for all major and minor development. For major development, visual compatibility with respect to the height of residential structures, as defined by 4.5.1(E)(2)(a), shall also be determined through application of the Building Height Plane.

Response A:

The overall height of the proposed two-story building will be visually compatible in comparison and relation to the height of existing structures and buildings within the West Settlers Historic District. The current building on the site is a two-story building and the proposed two-story building will be visually compatible to the existing two-story buildings located directly to the south at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue and east at 85 Northwest 5th Avenue.

Standard B: Front Façade Proportion

The front facade of each building or structure shall be visually compatible with and be in direct relationship to the width of the building and to the height of the front elevation of other existing structures and buildings within the subject historic district.

Response B:

The height and width of the front elevation of the proposed two-story building, located on Northwest 5th Avenue, will be visually compatible and proportional to one another. The front façade of the proposed building will be visually compatible with the front elevations of other existing buildings located within the West Settlers Historic District and along the Northwest 5th Avenue Corridor.

Standard C: Proportion of Openings (Windows and Doors)

The openings of any building within a historic district shall be visually compatible with the openings exemplified by prevailing historic architectural styles of similar buildings within the district. The relationship of the width of windows and doors to the height of windows and doors among buildings shall be visually compatible within the subject historic district.

Response C:

Overall, the proportions for the windows and doors of the proposed building will be visually compatible with those of other existing buildings located within the West Settlers Historic District. The proposed windows and doors will utilize clear, non-reflective glass, and be more vertically proportioned, which is in line with the Masonry Modern architectural style.

Standard D: Rhythm of Solids to Voids

The relationship of solids to voids of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district for all development, with particular attention paid to the front facades.

Response D:

The relationship of solids to voids of the proposed building will be visually compatible with those of other existing buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District. Through the addition of openings, the proposed design establishes a more consistent relationship of solids to voids and the proposed building will be more visually compatible with buildings and structures that currently exist along Northwest 5th Avenue.

Standard E: Rhythm of Buildings on Streets

The relationship of buildings to open space between them and adjoining buildings shall be visually compatible with the relationship between existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district.

Response E:

The proposed building will not compromise or change the rhythm of buildings and open spaces that currently exists along Northwest 5th Avenue.

Standard F: Rhythm of Entrance and/or Porch Projections

The relationship of entrances and porch projections to the sidewalks of a building shall be visually compatible with existing architectural styles of entrances and porch projections on existing historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district for all development.

Response F:

The relationships of entrances to the proposed building and sidewalks will be visually compatible to those of existing buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District.

Standard G: Relationship of Materials, Texture, and Color

The relationship of materials, texture, and color of the facade of a building and/or hardscaping shall be visually compatible with the predominant materials used in the historic buildings and structures within the subject historic district.

Response G:

The materials, texture and color of the façade of the proposed building and/or hardscaping will be visually compatible and consistent with the predominant materials, textures, and colors used on the existing buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District and will also comply with the Masonry Modern architectural style stated in the "Delray Beach Central Business District Architectural Design Guidelines." Moreover, the overall proposed design will be visually compatible and consistent with the previously approved design for the mixed-use building located on the abutting property at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue, the office building for the Delray Beach Housing Authority. The proposed building will utilize stucco walls, clear, non-reflective glass for openings, and an aluminum roof.

Standard H: Roof Shapes

The roof shape, including type and slope, of a building or structure shall be visually compatible with the roof shape of existing historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district. The roof shape shall be consistent with the architectural style of the building.

Response H:

The roof shape of the proposed building will be visually compatible with the roof shapes of existing buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District. More specifically, the proposed roof shape, material, and color will be visually compatible and consistent with that of the previously approved design for the mixed-use building located on the abutting property at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue, the office building for the Delray Beach Housing Authority. The roof will be aluminum.

Standard I: Walls of Continuity

Walls, fences, evergreen landscape masses, or building facades, shall form cohesive walls of enclosure along a street to ensure visual compatibility with historic buildings or structures within the subject historic district and the structure to which it is visually related.

Response I:

The overall building façade will be cohesive and visually compatible with the other existing buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District. The overall design for the proposed building was inspired by and specifically chosen because of its visually compatibility, continuity, and cohesiveness with that of the previously approved design for the mixed-use building located on the abutting property at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue, the office building for the Delray Beach Housing Authority.

Standard J: Scale of Building

The size of a building and the building mass in relation to open spaces, windows, door openings, balconies, porches, and lot size shall be visually compatible with the building size and mass of historic buildings and structures within a historic district for all development.

Response J:

The proposed overall size of the building and building mass will be visually compatible with the building size and mass of other existing buildings and structures within the West Settlers Historic District, specifically to that of the existing two--story buildings located directly to the south at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue and east at 85 Northwest 5th Avenue.

Standard K: Directional Expression of Front Elevation

A building shall be visually compatible with the buildings, structures, and sites within a historic district for all development with regard to its directional character, whether vertical or horizontal.

Response K:

The directional expression of the front elevation of the proposed two-story building will not change and will be visually compatible with the buildings, structures, and sites within the West Settlers Historic District.

Standard L: Architectural Style

All major and minor development shall consist of only one (1) architectural style per structure or property and not introduce elements definitive of another style.

Response L:

Only one architectural style is proposed and will be utilized – Masonry Modern. This architectural style is the current architectural style of the building located at 98 NW 5th Avenue and is one that complies with the "Delray Beach Central Business District Architectural Design Guidelines." Moreover, the proposed design will be visually compatible and consistent with that of the previously approved design for the mixed-use building located on the abutting property at 82 Northwest 5th Avenue, the office building for the Delray Beach Housing Authority.

Standard M: Additions to individually designated properties and contributing structures in all historic districts.

Response M:

The property located at 98 Northwest 5th Avenue is neither a historically designated property nor classified as a contributing structure within the West Settlers Historic District.