



Legislation Text

File #: 18-120, Version: 1

TO: Mayor and Commissioners
FROM: Tim Stillings, Director of Planning, Zoning and Building
THROUGH: Mark R. Lauzier, City Manager
DATE: March 6, 2018

CITY COMMISSION APPEAL OF THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION BOARD APPROVALS OF CERTIFICATES OF APPROPRIATENESS FOR THREE RELOCATIONS AND SEVEN DEMOLITIONS ASSOCIATED WITH THE MIDTOWN DELRAY (FORMERLY KNOWN AS SWINTON COMMONS) PROJECT GENERALLY LOCATED AT THE SOUTHWEST CORNER OF ATLANTIC AND SWINTON AVENUES (QUASI-JUDICIAL HEARING)

Recommended Action:

The recommendation is to confirm the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) Certificates of Appropriateness (COA) for Buildings D, G, H, T, U, V, W, X, Y, and Z, more specifically described below.

RELOCATIONS:

Approve the COA (2016-072) for the relocation of the contributing structure on the property located at 21 SW 1st Avenue (Building 'D') in the Old School Square Historic Arts District (OSSHAD) to the property located at southwest section of the Sundry Block (address to be determined) by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA (2016-061), a.k.a. Yellow House, for the relocation of the contributing structure on the property located at 44 South Swinton Avenue (Building 'G') in OSSHAD to the property located south central on the Sundry Block (address to be determined) by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA (2016-057), a.k.a. White House, for the demolition/relocation/reconstruction of the contributing structure on the property located at 10 SE 1st Street on Block 70 (Building 'H'), to same property located slightly north of its current site on Block 70 facing SE 1st Street., OSSHAD (address likely to be the same) by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report, and finding that the request and approval thereof is consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

DEMOLITIONS:

Approve the COA (2016-065) for the demolition of a non-contributing structure (Building 'T') located at 52 W. Atlantic Avenue Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1(E)(5) and 4.5.1(F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA (2016-068) built in 2001 for the demolition of a non-contributing structure (Building 'U') located at 20 W Atlantic Avenue, Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1(E)(5) and 4.5.1(F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA (2016-058) for the demolition of a contributing structure/accessory structure (Building 'V') located at 35½ SW 1st Avenue, Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1(E)(5) and 4.5.1(F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA (2016-062) for the demolition of a contributing structure (Building "W") located at 14 SE 1st Street, Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1 (E)(5) and 4.5.1 (F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA (2016-06)6 for the demolition of a contributing structure (Building 'X') that has lost its character defining features of its Mission Revival style located at 18 SE 1st St, Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is not consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1 (E)(5) and 4.5.1(F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA 2016-067 for the demolition of a contributing structure/accessory structure (Building 'Y') located at 18½ SE 1st Street, Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is not consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1 (E)(5) and 4.5.1(F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Approve the COA 2016-059 for the demolition of a contributing structure (Building 'Z') located at 48 SE 1st Avenue, Old School Square Historic District, by adopting the findings of fact and law contained in the staff report and finding that the request is not consistent with LDR Sections 4.5.1 (E)(5) and 4.5.1(F), Comprehensive Plan and meets the criteria set forth in the Land Development Regulations, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Background:

At its meeting of June 26, 2017, the Historic Preservation Board (HPB) approved the relocations and demolition of the structures referenced above in the "Recommended Action" section of this report. The HPB voted to deny the Class V site plan application and the additional COAs for five structure

relocations and two structure demolitions. At its meeting of July 18, 2017, the City Commission appealed the HPB approvals of the relocations and demolitions of the structures, which are those referenced above and now under consideration by the City Commission. It is noted that applicant submitted a request to appeal the HPB denials of proposed relocations and demolitions. The applicant withdrew the appeal (see attached letter dated October 4, 2017 from Dunay Miskel Backman, LLP). On September 6, 2017, the applicant submitted a new site plan application for a mixed use project known as "Midtown Delray". The proposed relocation/reconstruction of buildings "D," "G," and "H" are in the same proposed locations as presented in the COAs. Thus, approval of these relocations/reconstruction would not be in conflict with the Midtown Delray application. Further, the demolition approvals would not be in conflict with the current Midtown Delray project since these structures are proposed to be demolished in the same manner under both projects.

The staff report for each COA is included.

At its meeting of October 17, 2017, the City Commission considered this appeal for the relocations and demolitions. At that time the City Commission postponed consideration of the appeals until such time as the site plan was brought forward to the HPB for consideration. The site plan and associated requests was considered by the HPB at their December 19, 2017 meeting, and is subject to the applicant's appeal which is also part of the February 6, 2018, City Commission agenda.

City Attorney Review:

Approved as to form and legal sufficiency.

Funding Source/Financial Impact:

N/A

Timing of Request:

This item should be considered along with the applicant's appeal and the associated items for commission consideration including the conditional use, alley abandonment and waiver requests.